

HARVARD THEOLOGICAL REVIEW

VOLUME XV

OCTOBER, 1922

NUMBER 4

SOCIAL UNREST AND SPIRITUAL AGITATION IN PRESENT-DAY JAPAN

MASAHARU ANESAKI

UNIVERSITY OF TOKIO

IN many aspects of social life Japan shares with the whole world the consequences of the World War, particularly in the intricate connections between social unrest and spiritual agitation. Japan had passed through two wars in recent times; they aroused the nation to national self-consciousness, but they brought also many new problems. Yet those wars were fought far from Japan itself, and did not bring home the disasters and miseries of war. In the World War Japan took a part, but it remained for the people a matter of distant lands. Thus they were comparatively indifferent to the various issues raised by the war, such as the combat between militarism and democracy, the questions of international justice and the self-determination of nations, the problems of peace and social reconstruction. Moreover, their indignation against the aggressive Occident led the people to discredit the pleas of the allies against Germany, and often to incline to sympathize with the German claim of "a place in the sun." These circumstances tended to keep the Japanese comparatively untouched by the problems created by the war. But the collapse of the great empires and the final outcome of the war could not fail to produce a profound impression among the Japanese. Although the people at large did not realize the whole situation, yet the gravity of the changes and problems was more or less fully grasped, and serious thought was stirred on social and religious questions.

In addition to the tidal waves coming from Europe, international conditions gradually caused apprehension. By reason

of the peculiar position of Japan during the war, her industrial and commercial prosperity made marvellous strides. The war-boom produced many *nouveaux riches*, a reign of the *nari-kin*,¹ and brought tremendous changes in life and ideas. The extravagant luxury of the rich capitalists called out high claims from the labor people; the one-sided accumulation of wealth, never before paralleled, was accompanied by an astonishing rise in the cost of living; the heavy claims of the army and navy stood in flagrant contrast to the miserable accommodations of schools and other works of culture. Strikes of laborers became frequent, the discontent of the educated classes rose to high tide, the miseries of the poorer classes increased; and the "rice riots" in August 1915 brought to every one's life and mind the dangerous features of the whole situation. The militarist Terauchi cabinet fell on that account; but the antagonism between the reactionaries and the radicals was thereby not at all assuaged, because the demands for certain changes and the pressure for reconstruction so alarmed the conservatives that they called up all available forces and means for combating the "dangerous" tendencies. Any expression of radical ideas was suspected to be connected with Bolshevik propaganda, for the Russian revolution of 1917 became a nightmare to the privileged classes. Demands for social reconstruction were interpreted as a mere imitation of revolutionary ideas imported from outside. The number of accusations of *lèse-majesté* increased year by year. Socialism, communism, and anything of similar tendency were indiscriminately condemned as potential cases of high treason. The Shinto religion and "national ethics" were resorted to against those "foreign ideas" which meant "dangerous" menace to the safety of the country; while dubious agents, — hypocrites, fanatics, or unprincipled preachers, — were mobilized for fighting the "dangerous ideas."

To the erratic nature of these reactionary measures corresponded the growing ferocity of agitation, manifesting itself

¹ This term was taken from Japanese chess, its occidental equivalent being a pawn raised to the dignity of a queen.

in the vigor of the protest, the extension of labor sabotage² and strikes, and the outspoken hostility toward the authorities and the rich. No previous period in Japan ever witnessed so many publications on labor questions, Marxism, syndicalism, social reconstruction, as did the years after the Great War. The vehement expressions of the plea for the proletariat seemed to subside after the economic depression which gave a serious blow to business in the spring of 1921; but the firm stand of the government and its party (Seiyu-kai) in behalf of the propertied classes has called forth the indignation of the unprivileged, and is working only to instigate disorders beneath the surface. The scandals exposed one after another, all on a larger scale than in most of the preceding years, were shown to have connection with members of the government party. The desperate steps taken by the quick-tempered radicals culminated in the assassination of a rich banker and then of the Premier Hara, both in 1921.

One cannot foresee what will be the outcome of this furious conflict. But one point is clear; a firm stand has been taken by the thoughtful middle class in seeking after a reconstructed foundation of culture on the basis of social solidarity and democratic freedom. Yet it remains to be seen whether a really constructive force can prove itself efficient without first a further outburst of destructive forces. In the midst of the furious conflict the young heir-apparent to the throne made in 1921 a journey to Europe, and it is believed that he was deeply impressed by the democratic freedom of English life. Thus hope is cherished that his regency, upon which he entered in November, may help to mitigate the situation, since social and political situations are much influenced by the attitude of the person in the highest position. But on the other hand the cleavage between the conflicting forces is giving more and more reason for concern, and the general situation may be described as one of ferment and agitation.

² To cite one instance, the author was surprised to find so much in vogue the word sabotage, and a new Japanese verb derived from it, *saboru*, when after an absence of only ten months he returned to Japan in October 1919.

The ferment is not limited to the political and social arena, but goes deep down to the very roots of human life, and the turbulence manifests itself in demands for wanton emancipation of the instincts of human nature. As ferocity and pugnacity mark the present phase of social movements, so the consideration of the instincts of self-preservation and perpetuation plays an important part in discussions of moral and social problems. Many a problem is reduced to that of sex, and naturalism is extended from the sphere of literature to other aspects of social life. The question of birth control, the feminist movement, the question of love and marriage, these and similar points are but different aspects of the general tendency; and many people are dissatisfied unless every veil that covers human instinct be relentlessly stripped off. In fact numerous cases of love or family tragedies have been made public, and opinions are freely expressed either in sympathy or in antagonistic criticism. These, and other, expressions of ideas on sex often exhibit indecent coloring; but in any case the instinctive nature of mankind is emphasized in various discussions, and thinkers are aware that the moral questions of the day cannot be successfully attacked without considering the fundamental fact of instinct. We see here a repetition of the conflict between the instinct and the reason which has several times shown its effects in the moral history of the Japanese people; but at present the manifestation of the instinctive nature finds freer expression than in any past period, and therein is shown an effect of the modern biological view of life. The question is not, as in the past, whether the instinct should be suppressed, but how it can or ought to be controlled by considerations drawn from the higher aspects of human life. Naked exposure of these questions may work as an explosive force, but may also lead to a more constructive stage of the re-estimate of all values through due account taken of biological factors. But it cannot be said that the agitation is at present taking a normal and wholesome course.

One marked feature of spiritual ferment in these circumstances is the general discrediting of all the existing religions,

including Christianity, and the appearance of new religious movements ranging from impetuous revivalism and great visions to calm self-renunciation. Wide is the gap between these two extremes, but common features can be discerned in them all, namely that social, and particularly economic, considerations are brought into close relation with the spiritual problems, and that the intuitive, or instinctive, nature of religion is emphasized in antagonism to the doctrinal and ecclesiastical systems. On the social and economic side more or less communistic ideas keep recurring in these new religions; and very general emphasis is laid on the instincts, either with a justification of human passions and instincts which used to be called sins, or with some kind of attempt at their transformation, not their suppression. We discern here an insurgent upheaval of the instinctive force of religion embedded in the depth of the soul, taking advantage of the opportunity given by social agitation and spiritual ferment in defiance of the discredited traditional religions. Most of these new forces are crude in expression and extravagant in their pretensions, but they show the vigor and nascent vitality of growing organisms. Some of them are extremely individualistic and sentimental, but many a representative leader has passed through stages of spiritual convulsion and attained a sincere insight into the mysteries of life. It is not enough simply to denounce the crudeness; full recognition must be given to the vigorous power arising in turbulence. In short, all this offers a bold challenge to traditional beliefs, represents an aspiration toward a thorough review of spiritual values, and is making an attempt at reconstructing human life from the depths of the demands of instinct. All the questions and movements revolve about the pivot of how to look at the basic nature of human existence, and of the question what aspect of that nature shall be re-valued and used in a reconstruction of human life, both individual and social.

The whole situation is highly perplexing, and it is no wonder that many troubled minds are at a loss as to how to discover some clue to a final reconstruction. They cherish an ardor of aspiration, but in their crudeness are often unable to cope with

the complications, and so try to arrive at a conclusion by wild groping and convulsive pretension. Any chance notion may, and often does, captivate minds in this condition, inducing them to preposterous affirmations, particularly those tinged by prophetic hues. The key-note of this state of mind is discontent with the present and a demand for reconstruction, and the tune that is played reveals the bombastic certitude of prophetic convictions. Numerous individuals and organizations represent this type of the bewildered mind. Though they appear and vanish again from one day to the next, or month by month, they all are but different manifestations of one and the same force of turbulent commotion stirring in the depths of perplexed souls. One who is troubled at heart often goes to an extreme of boastful self-assertion, and many a movement of this kind is characterized by an anomalous combination of desperate pessimism with unbalanced self-glorification.

The most typical of the movements of this kind has been a body called Omoto-kyo, or the teaching of the "Great Fundamentals," which was started by a crazy old woman who believed herself to be the messenger of the gods, sent by them to effect a fundamental "rebuilding" (*O-tate-naoshi* or *O-tate-kae*³) of the whole world. The idea first came to her of herself, and she wrote down the messages of the gods in automatic writing, and so began her propaganda of rebuilding the world. Under maltreatment by her neighbors and persecution from the police her fervor grew to intense heat. Her teaching was further elaborated by a combined effort of humbugs and fanatics. Their ideas were prompted by fear and boastfulness, with much of chauvinism as well as of threats and lamentations; and their utterances bear a certain resemblance to some passages of the Old Testament prophets or of Mohammed. During the Great War they predicted an invasion of Japan, first by a German-Russian allied force (particularly through air attacks), and then, after the destined collapse of these two powers, by the United States. According to them, this coming

³ The words *tate-naoshi* and *tate-kae* are commonly used for rebuilding houses, and the woman was in fact the wife of a carpenter addicted to drink. The necessity of 'rebuilding' was indeed deeply felt by the woman through her own experience in life.

invasion will devastate the whole country, except their own locality, Ayabe, a little town in central Japan. But, they preach, the final day in the fate of Japan will be a turning-point in the world's history, for the hosts of the gods will arise from Ayabe and not only vanquish the invaders but subjugate the whole world. Thereafter the peace of the gods will prevail in a theocracy, the present believers being destined to be ministers, generals, and high officials, under the sole rulership of the messenger of the gods, the descendant of the woman founder. Beside these preposterous predictions and promises they pretend to work miraculous cures, and teach more or less communistic ideas, claiming to solve the social problem of all mankind.

This curious combination of fear and pride is not limited to this Omoto-kyo; many similar movements in Japan and Korea show nearly the same symptoms of the bewildered mind. The Omoto-kyo was suppressed by the government authorities, but its members are working along the same lines no less eagerly than before, only modifying those points of their teaching most distasteful to the government. These survivors and many others may at any time renew their vigorous propaganda, and there are many souls ready to fall victims to similar predictions and miracles. It is noteworthy that the individuals and bodies of this sort are in one way or another affiliated with the Shinto religion, and consequently antagonize Buddhism and Christianity. For this there is more than one reason. The first is a motive, on their part, to assume a protective color, because of the patronizing attitude extended to Shinto by the government. Even the most bombastic of these pretenders are often, if not usually, cowards, and feel safer under the protection of the Shinto name. Moreover, Shinto represents the primitive, and therefore instinctive, traits of religious life, in contrast to the "doctrinated" religions existing in Japan. Thus the rise of these Shinto movements is a part of the same emphasis on the instinctive nature of man which has been described above.

This trait, however, is not limited to Shinto, but can be found more or less in Buddhism and Christianity. Buddhism as a

body, or as an aggregate of church organizations, is hopelessly degenerate, and its clergy are utterly at a loss as to how to meet the perplexing situations presented on all sides. Yet its spiritual fountain is not without signs of a new outburst of geyser-like revival. In the course of the past two or three decades several Buddhist revivals have appeared one after another and passed away, but have left some impressions. At present one of the conspicuous features in the life of Buddhism is the rising interest in Shinran, the pietist reformer of the thirteenth century. In fact, his religion of absolute faith in Buddha's grace has as its counterpart a full recognition of all kinds of human weakness or sinfulness. Though not exactly justifying or advocating sins and passions, he emphasized that we could be saved even without purging ourselves from all the depravities of human nature, because of the overwhelming strength of Buddha's saving power. This aspect of Shinran's religion could easily be used as endorsing the naturalistic or biological view of human life, and in the past various signs of this combination of pietism and naturalism have shown themselves. Now the new vitality manifested in this form of Buddhism, particularly among the youth, is a phenomenon intrinsically connected with the surging tide of the emphasis on the instinctive side of life. The motive lies in the full acknowledgment of the wickedness of human nature, of the miseries and tragedies of life. This may be called an attitude of confession and contrition, but the modern followers of Shinran deny the necessity of remorse and contrition. On the contrary, they proceed to the delight of cancelling (or redeeming) all sins and obstacles through the all-embracing mercy of Buddha. All vile darkness vanishes, according to them, before the all-permeating light of his love, the love which can and ought to be experienced even by the most sinful beings. It is only one step from this joy in faith to a kind of glorification of human passions, and in fact the new force in Shinranism lies in the free delight of life even in vice and passion. To cite from one of the typical representatives of this movement:

Religion is nothing but yearning of a defective being after perfection. The humility of the soul by which it confesses without any reserve the bar-

renness of self that is full of falsehood and is bewildered and troubled, — this humility makes us aspire for the absolute reality which is rich, true, and stands beyond all commotion for ever. The lonesome cannot bear to remain alone, but ardently longs to be joined with an eternally beloved, — that is religion.

But this is not all. Reality, or love, is, according to this writer, not an abstract principle, but is to be personally experienced by everybody. Again, this experience needs no training in higher sorts of culture or contemplation, but just in daily life, the actual carnal life of every human being. Love is best exemplified by sexual love, because its secret is latent in every man and woman, which can only be brought forth to actual experience through contact with the other sex. Love is a union of both flesh and spirit, and one who is the best and most fervent lover in life is best entitled to be saved by Buddha's love. This was the religion of Shinran, according to this writer, and his faith amounted to a securing of the love of Buddha through love for other beings, — certainly love of all kinds, but especially sexual love. Various other points could be noted in the tenets and experiences of this writer and his fellows, but suffice it to say that they emphasize what they call "pure experience," coinciding with "pure love," and that they thus identify instinctive love with religious faith, because they see purity only in the life of primal instinct.

This strain of religious faith, somewhat vague and mystic though it is, exhibits a fire of ardor in finding the final resort of life in the primal motive of human life. It is doubtless sentimentalism, but, being something more than a mere play of sentiment, attempts to strike at the very root of the individual soul and to discover therein something beyond the individual. It amounts to a glorification of the instincts by transforming them through the realization of the all-pervading oneness of mankind in the very depth of its instinctive nature. The influence of this stream of naturalism is not limited to Buddhism; Christianity is affected by it. One of the important aspects in the Christian movement in Japan is that not a few independent thinkers are more and more alienated from church organizations, and share in the general movement of emphasizing the intuitive aspect of religious life. Their endeavor is to reduce

the Christian religion to the palpable fact of personal experience, and it therefore stands for the assertion of individuality, in contradistinction to ecclesiastical systems and to the emphasis laid on social work. Thus these independent Christians, or ex-christians, are individualists, not only in religious idea but also in their moral or social view of life. Some among them are Tolstoyans, some are worshippers of Walt Whitman, of Kierkegaard, and so on; and in this respect they are bound together with the individualists, whose affiliation otherwise ranges from mysticism to rationalism.

Faithful to their principle, these individualists would not organize themselves in any way, in spite of the extent of their sentiment of fellowship among themselves. It is therefore almost impossible to classify them and label them by 'isms.' Indeed, one of them well represents their tendency in this respect, when he says, to cite but one passage:

I discovered that I had been one of those who were to be called hypocrites in the Christian church.

I am not sorry that I have been alienated from the group in which the righteous, the hypocrites, the sinners, and so on, are distinctly labelled, and various persons treated according to the categories.

It [deserting the church] has been a long way round; but to gain a profound sense of dissatisfaction with my own life was, after all, the shortest way home. . . .

Is man the lord or the slave of destiny? This question puzzles me and leads me to melancholy. Confidence in God, the certitude of moral laws, or the foundation of science, the standpoint of humanity, all this will be unstable without a decisive solution of this fundamental question.

And the solution is offered by Love, the pure instinct. In love I embrace others, as I am embraced by others in love; and thus I and others make up the beautiful texture of life, by weaving together the woof of self and the warp of others. The better and profounder the self, the inner self, is developed, the better and the more profoundly is the external world embraced into self. The whole life is thus perfected. There is thereby no sacrifice, nor duty, but only the privilege of being grateful and the saturation of being enjoyed.

Christ embraced in his supreme love all mankind of the past, present, and future. . . . He was the man who experienced most fully the joy of loving self, and therefore loved and embraced them all into himself.

Only change the word 'Christ,' and where is the difference between this and the utterances of the Buddhist individualists? The latter delight in discovering that either Buddha

or Shinran was merely a human being like themselves; and similarly some Christians take bold steps in finding a human Christ. In the spring of 1921 appeared a book of 1,500 pages bearing the title *Shin-yaku*, that is 'The New Testament,' a life of Jesus. Its author was a man quite unknown before, who at one stroke attained high fame by that writing. The book is in the form of an historical novel, and beside a vivid delineation of the life of the Jewish people the author brings into high relief the human and humane aspects of Jesus' personality and life. Jesus is depicted as a man of fine sensibility, keen insight, and profound spirituality, but a visionary, often bewildered as to his own dispositions, guided by ecstatic visions and voices. The author seems to have been influenced by the Freudian psychology, when he depicts the love of Jesus for certain women, particularly Mary Magdalene, a love of which Jesus was not quite aware. The emphasis on the sexual instinct is strongly shown in the author's way of handling the secrets of the lives of many persons who appear in the stories, and of indicating thereby the discrepancy between the Law and Love. The most striking point in the book is the author's sympathetic attitude towards Judas Iscariot. Describing the character and temperament of Judas, an abandoned child of cynical nature, he depicts his betrayal of the Master as an experiment, so to speak, tried on Jesus, in the idea that the Kingdom of Heaven as he had preached it could only be realized through his death. The author means that while the other disciples were still holding the traditional conception of the Kingdom, and while Jesus himself was not yet quite clear as to his own idea, Judas caught somehow by a quick insight the necessary consequence of Jesus' teaching. In a later book bearing the title "Resurrection" the author goes further, even so far as to say that the title of his book implies a resurrection of Judas, the modern man free from conventions and hypocrisy.

These books are not the only ones which attempt to humanize Jesus; they find their companion in another life of Jesus, written by a Tolstoyan who founded a communistic settlement, the "New Community." There Jesus is represented as a simple human being of pure heart. He penetrated into the heart of

humanity through his love for his Father, and so reached the innermost depth of the human soul. To cite one passage from him:

I cannot bear to think of mankind devoid of the existence of Jesus. There is nothing more grateful in the world than that Jesus and Buddha have appeared among us. I cannot live without thinking of them. They are the largest flourishing vines. . . . I am here alone, but I can hear Jesus' words, can converse with Buddha, and similarly with Goethe, Whitman, Rodin, and many others.

O Jesus! What vigor I derive from you! . . . Pity this little brother of yours! . . . I am yet too little to converse with you as a friend, but hope to be finally one day a friend who can talk with you without any reserve. In these days I feel that I know more and more the truth of what you have spoken.

This is not the place to examine all these views of Jesus, but what is to be noted is that they are all an expression of the ardent desire cherished by the youthful spirit to disentangle from all convention and formalism, to re-estimate and transform all values. These writers, together with their numerous admirers, will not be satisfied unless everything be reviewed in a new light, the light emanating from their own heart and soul. It is also a manifestation of the attempt at naturalizing Christ, unbinding him from all the fetters of ecclesiastical and missionary conceptions. But naturalization is by no means identical with nationalization, for even "national" codes of ethics, or any other national principles, are nothing but hypocrisy unless recast and rewrought by the vigorous vitality of the unfettered, aspiring soul. Thus we see, both in Buddhism and Christianity, that the young aspiring souls are radical individualists trying to review and reconstruct human life from the very bottom of its primal nature.

These individualists have certainly been moved by social unrest in general, but their ideas and principles have little to do directly with the pending questions of the present time. On the other hand many an earnest mind has been in close touch with the social troubles of the day, and consequently bears witness to the intimate ties binding together the social and the spiritual aspects of human life. The representatives

of this tendency are not merely social workers, but are convinced of the necessity of founding social reconstruction upon the spiritual rebirth of each and every individual. According to this view the solution of social problems is not merely by the application of a certain religious principle or dogma, but will be a natural consequence of a new life, a new departure of spiritual life, a resurrection after the death of the narrow self entangled in conventions and traditions. Not an immersion of self in piety or contemplation, but the life of active work guided by spiritual visions and imbued with religious ideals, — this is the key-note of the movements started by those souls who have passed through the discords of social and economic troubles and have attained a higher harmony of spiritual peace and religious zeal. We can say that nearly all the religious workers of earnest mind belong to this category. But their solutions of the problems, their methods and aims, as well as their affiliations, whether explicit or implicit, exhibit a wide range of diversity. Here we may single out two most prominent figures, one Christian and the other Buddhist, though not in the regular sense.

The first, Toyohiko Kagawa is now a name so well known that any writing bearing it is read with keen attention, while his person is worshipped in some quarters as the “saviour of the poor” or as a labor leader, though he is at the same time criticized in various ways. Whatever the merit of his person may be, and whatever he may in future finally prove to be, his work for ten years in the worst of slums and his ideas on the meaning of social work deserve close attention and high admiration. He has recently left his abode in a slum and has been evangelizing among the aborigines of Formosa; and this change in his interest is interpreted in different ways. But our interest here is not in his future but in the tendency he has represented during his work in the slums and for labor people. He was educated in a Presbyterian seminary, but being dissatisfied with theology and church, he trained himself, working among the lowest people, with the conviction that the real God and his love could only be found among the lowest of people. But let us hear what he says himself:

Love toward sinners! Human nature can first be established in a society in which one can pour love even upon sinners. This is a problem too delicate to be settled by materialistic socialism, which seeks to solve all questions through that of bread. On the other hand the bold attitude of the carpenter Jesus, who "came to call sinners to repentance," was, perhaps too religious to attract ordinary human beings; yet the aim of all and every movement for reconstruction is finally to arrive at that point. A perfect society is one where even sinners are loved and protected, so that they may be led up to repentance. . . .

The restoration and elevation of human nature can be impeded by no one. Human nature, that is the sublimest of all the architectures in the world. . . . But Capital and the Factory are nowadays forcing this grand work of art [the human being] to stand beside an oil-can and to live a constricted life among machinery. A very devil is the modern factory.

Yet sun-light comes in through the windows of the factory, and reveals that its rooms are teeming with children of God. There will come a time when the figures of these children of light, and not the machine, will be exalted and adored in the name of freedom and light. The sun is rising, and human architecture is near its completion.

It was this fundamental faith that induced him to work in the slums and enabled him to face all the hardships and desperate situations. In a novel which is practically his autobiography, Kagawa speaks thus of the hero of the story:

He is well aware that social policies of temporary nature or sensational theories of social revolution are not the way to save mankind; and he has settled down in the slums in order to see what is the power of God that saves man from the vilest depth of sinful life. He does not say to the poor either that they should attempt a revolution or that the rich alone are vicious, but he preaches only the way of salvation. And that amounts to the necessity of transforming all the aspects of human nature, including instincts, temperaments, and intelligence. Any external force is unable to save human society, and nothing is more important than the power of God working within every one's self. This is his religious faith that is guiding his whole life.

In these and other utterances backed by his life and work, we see the strong, yet meek, personality of Kagawa flooded with the rays of hope and faith, even in the midst of the most dismal shadows of the slum. He is not so much a social reformer with definite programs of policies, as a spiritual reformer full of conviction and vision, yet never losing himself in mere ideas, but working persistently and assiduously for the erection of what he calls "human architecture."

Another representative of the same tendency of identifying the social and the spiritual problems is Tenko Nishida, a man

who had passed through vicissitudes of success and failure in his life, and finally entered a life of humility, non-possession, and service. He was born in a Buddhist family and grew up as a Buddhist. He had once been an industrial enterpriser; but his failure, chiefly due to the pressure of difficulties heaped upon him by his capitalists and workmen, caused him to become desperate and addicted to vice. Even in the pit of despair, however, he never ceased to meditate on the meaning of life, and particularly on the foundation of the existing economic system and social structure. In his despair and agony he decided to renounce everything, his family and his own self too. For a while he lived like a beggar or hermit, without paying heed as to how to feed himself; still he was able somehow to live. One day he picked up grains of rice on the streets and sustained life on that. Like a flash an idea came to him, that man lives not by the virtue of his own merit, but by the free gift of Nature, and that what he once had deemed to be his work and possession was not in fact his own but a gift of grace. Then he served a friend's family by taking up menial work and claimed nothing in return but a bare living. There he himself was surprised to see the profoundly edifying effect of his humble service upon himself as well as upon the whole family of his friend, including the servants, through the bountiful spirit of ardor in mutual service and the profound sentiment of mutual indebtedness with which his life inspired the whole circle.

This experience, together with his meditation in solitude, accomplished a revolutionary conversion in his spirit and life, and thereafter, for now more than ten years, he has continued to live up to his principle of non-possession and service, serving any family which would receive him as such. He does not know how to name his religion or principle or his God, nor does he try to formulate his teaching. But he shows his Buddhist heritage in often calling the final resort of his life the "Universal Light," the source of all being, the giver of grace and gift. His life of humility is in itself his faith in the Light, and he admonishes his fellows to live the life of service rendered to all fellow beings, and therefore to the Light. He thus com-

bines in his life and faith the parts of Mary and Martha, and in that respect differs from the Shinshu pietists, his former fellows, who denounce any work as an obstacle to piety. His religion can be formulated in one way or another, as one of his fellows has formulated it in Buddhist terms; but he is better seen in his own life than in teaching, and many of his fellows are those who saw him and have adopted his way of living. Instead of describing his life, however, let us quote from his discourses. He says, for example:

When you review the life of Buddha, or Christ, or any other sage or founder of religion, you cannot but be struck by their conviction that life is secure without possession. You would say that it is a mere Utopia in the world of modern civilization to live without property; but you think so simply because you have little faith in the Universal Light.

The life of my fellows will be a living testimony, and I am convinced of the truth [of my principle that the desire for possession is the root of all evil].

First, renounce everything, property or claim. Accumulate nothing for tomorrow. Be ready to renounce even your life at any moment. Therein you will find an unspeakable satisfaction.

Heaven and earth, mountains and streams, all are Buddha himself. It does not matter who does or does not possess this or that. All belongs to all. The whole cosmos is a totality, subject neither to increase nor to decrease. When I have realized this, I have seen the Universal Light face to face.

Another passage speaks of humility:

Buddha left his royal palace and went about alms-begging. Christ washed the feet of his disciples. Laotse, St. Francis, Tosui, and many other spiritual leaders lived the life of humility (each in his own way).

Humility embraces everything.

Humility may be compared to earth which is the mother of all.

Humility bears all and gives to all. . . .

Destruction creeps into every one who takes pride in his own achievements, because the desire for achievement implies possession and monopolization.

When you examine the depth of the matter, all the conflicts of human life are rooted in egoism.

Renounce your own interests and serve others, in penitence, the penitence that the root of all evil and sin is in yourself.

So train yourself that you can serve anybody in any way, when requested; and therein polish the lustre of your own soul.

This is humility and the beginning of the life of true fellowship.

These are some points in Nishida's principle of life, and his fellowship consists in an absolutely free community, where any

one may come and go according to his own idea and will. Nishida has a cottage among the hills in Kyoto, which furnishes abode to those who come. Those men and women meet in the morning for prayer or confession, then every one of them goes to any place where work is requested, and comes back to the cottage in the evening, or may stay out, according to circumstances. The cottage is named the "Garden of One Lantern,"⁴ and may be called a convent; but no rule is imposed upon the life of fellowship, every one is free to think or work according to his choice, the only condition being a sincere conviction in the life of service and non-possession. The cottage in Kyoto is in no way a centre for the movement, because many another Garden of One Lantern may grow, where the fellows are found. In fact, one of the houses of One Lantern is being organized as an infirmary, and other similar houses may come into existence.

Nishida, who was once an industrial enterpriser, seems to have much organizing talent, and his operation of a mine started a few years ago is a matter of keen interest to all observers. Some of his fellows have organized factories, somewhat after the manner of a coöperative society. They insist on non-possession and regard these properties as a mandate entrusted to them for serving mankind. This is quite natural to the apostle of the Kingdom of Non-possession, because his new life emerged out of his doubts about the existing social structure, and his principles have finally to attack the economic problems of the day. It is yet to be seen how Nishida's "Community for Propagating the Light" (*Senko-sha*), as he calls his industrial organization, will proceed in its enterprises; but we see here one of the attempts at establishing fundamental connections between the economic and the spiritual life of mankind.

Another point to be noted is the close sympathetic ties between Buddha and St. Francis of Assisi conceived by these

⁴ The Japanese name is *Itto-en*, which is derived from the story of a poor woman who brought only one lantern in dedication to a great festival in memory of Buddha, where the rich brought thousands. The story further says that the one lantern of the poor woman was brighter than any of the numerous ones, because Buddha valued the piety of the woman more than that of the others.

fellows. In fact, Nishida started his new life quite spontaneously, even apart from his Buddhist heritage, but his conversion gradually revealed to him the life of Buddha in a new light, and similarly attracted his attention to the Christian saint who served lepers and preached to birds and wolves. Nishida says in one passage that if he should meet the Seraphic Saint even today, he would ask him how he would organize industrial life so as to solve the fundamental questions of social life. It will be evident to every observer how similar is the life of Nishida to that of Buddha or St. Francis; and it is natural to Nishida, a modern man, that he is not proceeding to create a monastic life like his predecessors, but a community life having a background of economic organization. But as his spiritual principle is a revolutionary force in religion, so his economic idea and enterprise are challenging the modern world by a radical reconstruction.

Thus we may call Nishida's life a modern Buddhist-Franciscan movement; and here we see the two bright suns of humanity meeting in Japan and in process of fusion into one light and heat, — the sun of wisdom from the Sakya clan, who shone out of the slopes of the Himalaya, and the sun of love, of whom Dante sang in adoration that he had arisen from among the pure lotus flowers in the waters of the Ganges. Whether the "One Lantern" will really "propagate the Light," that remains to be seen by future historians.

LITERATURE ON CHURCH HISTORY

IN GERMANY, AUSTRIA, SWITZERLAND, HOLLAND, AND THE
SCANDINAVIAN COUNTRIES, 1914-1920

GUSTAV KRÜGER

PROFESSOR OF CHURCH HISTORY IN GIESSEN, GERMANY

II. THE MEDIAEVAL CHURCH

CONTENTS

I. General.....	325
II. Early Mediaeval Christianity	
(a) Sources.....	335
(b) Monographs.....	337
III. The Empire and the Church	
(a) Sources.....	342
(b) Monographs.....	343
IV. The Papacy	
(a) Sources.....	351
(b) Monographs.....	354
V. Bishops and Bishoprics	
(a) Sources.....	358
(b) Monographs.....	360
VI. Councils.....	361
VII. Ecclesiastical Law and Liturgy.....	362
VIII. Saints, Monks, and Monasteries	
(a) General.....	365
(b) Saints and Monastic Orders.....	368
IX. Scholastic Philosophy and Theology	
(a) Texts.....	379
(b) Scholastic Philosophers.....	385
X. The German Mystics.....	396
XI. Reformers.....	399
XII. Norwegian Church History.....	402

ABBREVIATIONS

AAB	Abhandlungen der Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin.
AGW	Abhandlungen der Gesellschaft der Wissenschaften zu Göttingen.
BGPhM	Beiträge zur Geschichte der Philosophie des Mittelalters, hrsg. von Clemens Bäumker. Münster, Aschendorff.
BKGMR	Beiträge zur Kirchengeschichte des Mittelalters und Renaissance. Leipzig and Berlin, Teubner.
BKMR	Beiträge zur Kultur des Mittelalters und der Renaissance, hrsg. von Walter Götz. Leipzig and Berlin.
DTh	Divus Thomas. Jahrbuch für Philosophie und spekulative Theologie. Hrsg. von Ernst Commer. Vienna, Mekhitaristendruckerei.
FLDG	Forschungen zur christlichen Literatur und Dogmengeschichte. Paderborn, Schöningh.
FNFB	Foreningen til norske fortidsmindesterbevaring.
FrSt	Franziskanische Studien. Quartalschrift. Münster i. W., Aschendorff.
FrThSt	Freiburger Theologische Studien Freiburg i. B., Herder.
HJG	Historisches Jahrbuch der Görresgesellschaft.
HSt	Historische Studien, hrsg. von Emil Ebering. Berlin, Ebering.
KA	Kirchenrechtliche Abhandlungen, hrsg. von Ulrich Stutz. Stuttgart.
KÄ	Kyrkohistoriska Årsskrift. Upsala.
KIT	Kleine Texte, hrsg. von H. Lietzmann. Bonn, Marcus und Weber.
MGFr.	Monumenta Germaniae Franciscana. Düsseldorf, Schwann.
MGH	Monumenta Germaniae Historica.
MIOeG	Mitteilungen des Instituts für österreichische Geschichtsforschung.
NADG	Neues Archiv für ältere deutsche Geschichtskunde.
NAKG	Nederlandsch Archief voor Kerkgeschiedenis.
NHT	Norsk Historisk Tidsskrift.
NoTT	Norsk Teologisk Tidsskrift.
OChr	Oriens Christianus.
PhJbG	Philosophisches Jahrbuch der Görresgesellschaft.
RQ	Römische Quartalschrift.
RStT	Reformationsgeschichtliche Studien und Texte. Münster, Aschendorff.
SAB	Sitzungsberichte. Academy of Berlin.
SAH	Sitzungsberichte. Academy of Heidelberg.
SAM	Sitzungsberichte. Academy of Munich.
SAW	Sitzungsberichte. Academy of Vienna.
SRG	Scriptores Rerum Germanicarum.
StMGB	Studien und Mitteilungen zur Geschichte des Benediktinerordens und seiner Zweige. Salzburg.
StZ	Stimmen der Zeit.
ThLz	Theologische Literaturzeitung.
ThQ	Theologische Quartalschrift. Tübingen.
ThRev	Theologische Revue. Münster.
ThStKr	Theologische Studien und Kritiken.
VKSM	Veröffentlichungen aus dem kirchenhistorischen Seminar München. Munich, Lentner.
ZKG	Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte.
ZkTh	Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie. Innsbruck.
ZSchwKG	Zeitschrift für schweizerische Kirchengeschichte.

I. GENERAL

Bernheim, Ernst, Mittelalterliche Zeitanschauungen in ihrem Einfluss auf Politik und Geschichtsschreibung. Teil 1: Die Zeitanschauungen. iv, 233 pp. Tübingen, Mohr, 1918. — *Deussen, Paul*, Allgemeine Geschichte der Philosophie mit besonderer Berücksichtigung der Religionen. 2. Band, 2. Abt.: Die biblisch-mittelalterliche Philosophie. 2. Aufl. xvi, 530 pp. Leipzig, F. A. Brockhaus, 1919. — *Göller, Emil*, Die Periodisierung der Kirchengeschichte und die epochale Stellung des Mittelalters zwischen dem christlichen Altertum und der Neuzeit. Rektoratsrede. 67 pp. Freiburg i. B., Guenther, 1919. — *Hauck, Albert*, Kirchengeschichte Deutschlands. 5. Band, 2. Hälfte. viii, 583–1212 pp. Leipzig, Hinrichs, 1920. — *Holmquist, Hjalmar*, Den senare Medeltidens Kyrkohistoria. xxviii, 232 pp. Stockholm, 1914. — *Kern, Fritz*, Gottesgnadentum und Widerstandsrecht im früheren Mittelalter. Zur Entwicklungsgeschichte der Monarchie. xxxii, 445, 266* pp. Leipzig, Köhler, 1914. — *Manser, Gallus*, Die Geisteskrise des XIV. Jahrhunderts. 34 pp. Freiburg i. d. Schw., St. Paulus-Druckerei, 1915. — *Naegle, August*, Kirchengeschichte Boehmens. 1. Band. Einführung des Christentums in Boehmen. Two parts, xiv, 226 and xiii, 597 pp. Vienna and Leipzig, W. Braumiller, 1915, 1918. — *Paasche, Fredrik*, Kristendom og Kvad. En studie i norrøn middelalder. 180 pp. Christiania, Aschehoug, 1914. — *Ruvile, Albert von*, Die Kreuzzüge (Bücherei der Kultur und Geschichte, hrsg. von S. Hausmann 5). vii, 370 pp.; Bonn and Leipzig, Kurt Schröder, 1916. — *Ueberweg, Friedrich*, Grundriss der Geschichte der Philosophie. 2. Teil: Die mittlere oder die patristische und scholastische Zeit. 10. vollständig neubearbeitete Aufl. hrsg. von *Matthias Baumgartner*. x, 658, 266 pp. Berlin, E. S. Mittler, 1915. — *Wiegand, Friedrich*, Dogmengeschichte des Mittelalters (Evang.-theol. Bibliothek, hrsg. von Bernhard Bess). viii, 276 pp. Leipzig, Quelle u. Meyer, 1919. — *Schubert, Hans von*, Geschichte der christlichen Kirche im Frühmittelalter. xxiv, 808 pp. Tübingen, Mohr, 1921. — Mittelalterliche Bibliothekskataloge. Hrsg. von den Akademien der Wissenschaften zu Berlin, Wien usw. I. Oesterreich. 1. Band: Niederösterreich. Bearb. von *Theodor Gottlieb*. xvi, 615 pp. Vienna, Holzhausen, 1915. II. Deutschland und die Schweiz. 1. Band: Die Bistümer Konstanz und Chur. Bearb. von *Paul Lehmann*. xviii, 599 pp. Munich, Beck, 1918. — *Lehmann, Paul*, Quellen zur Feststellung und Geschichte mittelalterlicher Bibliotheken, Handschriften und Schriftsteller (HJG 40, 1920, 44–105); Mittelalterliche Handschriften des kgl. Bayerischen Nationalmuseums (SAM, 1916, 4). 66 pp. — *Westman, Knut B.*, Den svenska kyrkans utveckling från St Bernhards tidelvarf tin Innocentius III. Utgifren på foranstaltande af kyrkohistoriska foreningen med anledning af Uppsala arkasates. 750-års jubileum. xii, 301 pp. Stockholm, Norstadt, 1915.

IN the introduction to my first article (HARVARD THEOLOGICAL REVIEW, October 1921) I have already remarked that it is neither necessary nor possible to present the literature of mediaeval church history with the fullness which is desirable for the history of the early church. In a general survey every-

thing that has only a local interest must be omitted, and even in what remains the wheat must be winnowed from the chaff. The reviewer need not complain of lack of material; indeed what is valuable greatly exceeds in amount what is unimportant.¹ This is especially true of those comprehensive treatises which deal either with the Middle Ages as a whole or with special periods.

Wilhelm Möller's Church History belonged to the series of theological textbooks in which such celebrated works as Holtzmann's New Testament Theology and Harnack's History of Dogma appeared. After the author's death *von Schubert* published the first volume in a new edition (1902) and he has long been engaged on a revision of the second. What he has now given us is, however, much more than that; it is a wholly new book, the original purpose of which is not even suggested by a subtitle or by the inclusion of the work in the series of theological textbooks. Moreover he has taken as his subject not the entire mediaeval period but only the history of Catholicism in the early Middle Ages, that is in the formative time. He divides this into two parts: (1) the time of reshaping, organization, and missions; (2) the time when all the forces of the church, both old and new, were for the first time fused in the Frankish empire of the Carolingians, which he follows to its fall about the year 900. Von Schubert defines the "theme" of the Middle Ages as "the marriage of the Christian with the German world," and he brings out the point that "in the West the melody to this theme was played, in the East only the accompaniment." It should be added that in his presentation the "accompaniment" is far from being slighted, for the history of the Byzantine church is treated with the same attention and the same mastery of detail as that of the Germanic-Roman church.

¹ In so large a subject, it is impossible to form an independent judgment on all the books and articles, especially for one who, like the present reviewer, has as his special field in the narrower sense early church history only. I ought to say, however, that all the German and Austrian publications commented on have passed through my hands. To the valuable notices of NADG I am especially indebted. For the Scandinavian literature Professor Valdemar Ammundsen of Copenhagen, Mr. Hilding Pleijel in Lonhofda, and Professor S. Mowinkel in Christiania, and for the Dutch, Pastor Bakhuizen van den Brink of Nieuw Dortrecht have given me valuable assistance.

The centre of interest of the book is however found in the latter, as anyone would expect who knows von Schubert's scholarly writings. The great value of the new book lies in its complete independence. Nothing is taken over on authority; everything rests on this author's own research and verification, a verification urgently needed, as every fellow-worker is aware. The preliminary materials were at hand in a long series of editions, monographs, and critical miscellanies, scattered over the whole field, but they required to be arranged and systematized; and the inestimable merit of von Schubert's work is that the systematizing touch nowhere fails. Where all sections are treated with such uniform thoroughness, it is difficult to select special instances, but it may be remarked that the beginnings of the British (Celtic and Anglo-Saxon) church are especially illuminated. The most striking part of the whole is comprised in the concluding sections on ecclesiastical conditions in the Carolingian empire:— legal sources; the church as an economic and political power; the hierarchy; monasticism; forms of worship; the church as an educational institution; and the church as an agent of civilization. That the introductory matter includes a survey of the state of civilization and of religion among the heathen Germans is also useful, for in our textbooks such summaries are either entirely lacking or written from an obsolete point of view. Heinrich Boehmer's excellent article on this subject, which appeared in the *ThStKr* for 1913, was not available for von Schubert's use, as the first part of his book was already in print at that time; but it should now be used as supplementing his work. — The second half of the fifth volume of *Hauck's Kirchengeschichte Deutschlands*, the first part of which appeared in 1911, has now been published from the material left at his death (April 7, 1918). The subject is "Germany during the struggle of the papacy to establish its supremacy in the church." This is treated under five headings: (1) the concentration of ecclesiastical administration in the curia; (2) Germany and the papal schism; (3) the Wicliffite movement in Bohemia; (4) the end of the schism, the suppression of Wicliffism, and the reform of the church; (5) the religion of the Hussites and the overthrow of the con-

iliar theory. Unfortunately the last chapter is incomplete, and the history of the Council of Basel is not taken up. According to Boehmer's postscript, Hauck left only some notes on this, and in his will expressly forbade making use of them, so that this great work, on which so eminent a scholar spent more than an ordinary lifetime with untiring devotion and great success, remains a torso. It is, however, assured of a supplement in the spirit of its author, for Boehmer is working on a continuation, and will connect with it the history leading up to the Reformation. To say anything in praise or even in appreciation of this world-famous work would be like carrying owls to Athens. It is sufficient to emphasize the way in which Hauck in this last volume as in the earlier ones keeps the history of the church in Germany in the light of the general history of the church, and does this with the unerring judgment which we have so long admired. It is inevitable that in so extensive a work there should be much to challenge criticism, and this has been offered by Emil Göller of Freiburg in the Breisgau (Catholic), in *ThRev* (20, 1921, col. 249). But even he has to acknowledge that Hauck, though not always detached from his Protestant standpoint, still tries to preserve an impartial judgment. Hauck's fairness is especially evident in his criticism of Hus, who has hitherto been represented in far too favorable a light, out of sympathy either for the Czech or for the precursor of Luther.

In his book on the Crusades, *Ruville* has set his aim high. He undertakes, without losing himself in a maze of original investigation, to give a straightforward account, intelligible to everyone, of the origins, connections, and fundamental relations of the whole movement, gathering the results of countless separate studies into a single brilliant picture. He has made an interesting book, but his point of view is too little that of the historian and too much that of orthodoxy. A writer who cites Luke 21, 24 to show that Jerusalem was predestined not to remain permanently in the possession of the Christians, can hardly expect his historical views to be taken seriously. *Ruville's* book is mentioned here because it is one of a series

which claims to furnish educated laymen with scholarly and trustworthy instruction.

The main purpose of *Naegle* in his extensive and scholarly work is to counteract the one-sided Czechish view of Bohemian church history. In the first volume he seeks to combat the constant efforts of the Czech theological party to find connections for the christianizing of Bohemia exclusively in the East, entirely ignoring German influence. Hence he is continually forced into controversy, not always agreeable reading but not to be overlooked by the critic. His conclusions are so convincing that it is to be hoped they will gradually be accepted by students of the subject, in spite of irritated patriotic feelings. The narrative is carried to the end of the tenth century and ends with the founding of the first Bohemian bishopric at Prague. The author treats in special detail the appointment of Saint Wenceslaus (†935) whom, although he can be shown to have sided with the church of Regensburg on the most important ecclesiastical questions, the Czech historians honor as the patron saint of the Slavic church. — With the aid of fragmentary, local sources *Westman* gives a very interesting account of the Swedish church in the time of St. Bernard, Frederick Barbarossa, and Innocent III, presenting the relation of the development in Sweden to the movements of contemporary European history. He distinguishes between two conflicting tendencies in Sweden, the one interested in the universal church with Gregorian claims, the other, more conservative, influenced by nationalistic motives. Other scholars doubt the correctness of this distinction.

Wiegand's *Dogmengeschichte des Mittelalters und der Neuzeit* belongs to the same series of textbooks as the book by Arnold discussed in our first article (p. 292). As the mediæval history of dogma usually receives scant attention in a course of instruction, a thorough treatment of the subject in textbook form is welcome. The modern period is treated somewhat too superficially.—*Ueberweg's* *Grundriss der Geschichte der Philosophie* is already so familiar to scholars in both hemispheres that a new edition needs no recommendation, and if I call at-

tention especially to the revision of the second volume,² which is of interest to students of church history and the history of doctrine, it is for the sake of giving deserved recognition to the editor of the volume, Professor *Baumgartner* of Breslau. The extent of his contribution is shown even by an external comparison with the last previous edition (by M. Heinze, 1905). The book has grown in size from 400 to 924 pages. The list of new works on the history of philosophy in the patristic and scholastic periods, occupying over 200 pages, is in itself an astonishing achievement, while the contents of the book itself have gained very considerably, both on the bibliographical and on the critical and expository sides. It might almost be said that the virtue of completeness has been carried too far. It is certain that in no language does any repertory exist even approximately so complete and so trustworthy as this new *Ueberweg*. Unfortunately I must add that by the time this notice appears the book will be almost out of print, and whether under present conditions the publishers will have the courage to incur the expense of another printing, is of course uncertain. Hence the reader who wishes to own a copy will do well to secure it as soon as possible. As a conspectus of the present state of the study, it is an indispensable aid, both for the beginner and for the practised scholar. — *Deussen's* General History of Philosophy is also of interest to theologians, being written "with especial regard to religions." The author does not, to be sure, recognize in mediaeval philosophy, as he does in the Hindoo, Greek, and biblical philosophies, an entirely new creation of the human spirit, but only, as he aptly expresses it, a projection of the New Testament teaching upon the well-prepared field of Greek philosophy. Under these conditions we cannot expect any substantial contribution to our own spiritual life, but it is of considerable interest for ecclesiastical history to trace the efforts by which the patristic and mediaeval philosophers first sought to grasp the ideas of Christianity genetically, on

² Of the first volume, *Die Philosophie des Altertums*, the eleventh edition appeared in 1920, edited by *Karl Praechter*, the well-known writer on later Greek philosophy. The period of Hellenistic and Roman philosophy, peculiarly important for theologians, is the part to which the editor, as was natural in view of the field of his own studies, has given special attention in his revision.

the basis of Neoplatonism, and then fitted it into an ample frame drawn from the philosophy of Aristotle, a process which resulted in the imposing systems of Albertus Magnus and Thomas Aquinas. A special merit of Deussen's presentation is his vivid portrayal of the influence which the culture of the Moslem and Jewish worlds exerted on Christian philosophy.

Fundamental questions of general interest are touched upon in two works. In my first article (p. 327) I dwelt with special emphasis on the book of Ernst Troeltsch on St. Augustine and Christian antiquity. In contrast to his attitude, which separates Augustine as much as possible from the Middle Ages by making him the "consummator of christianized antiquity," *Bernheim* tries to show the strong influence of genuinely Augustinian ideas on the development of the Middle Ages. This was not first suggested to him by Troeltsch, for as long ago as 1897 he began the discussion with a valuable article on political conceptions of the Middle Ages in the light of Augustine's views, and since then, as professor of history at Greifswald, he has continued to further this view through the dissertations of numerous pupils.³ This book brings together ideas that have long been held, and is by no means a polemic against Troeltsch, whose views, indeed, he only takes up occasionally. His purpose is to give his own view, based upon the sources, and relating not so much to Augustine as to the ideas derived from him, or influenced by him, the effect of which can be traced in the politics and historiography of the Middle Ages. He distinguishes two groups of ideas, — (1) eschatological, culminating in the conception of Antichrist (iron age) and the Prince of Peace (golden age), and (2) those concerning the relation of *regnum* and *sacerdotium*. How far both groups are dependent on Augustine is shown in his first chapter, which is an admirable analysis of the controlling ideas of Augustine's most important work, the *Civitas Dei*. These are: the two *civitates* and their modifications; the virtues and vices, especially *humilitas* and *superbia*; the ideas of *pax* and *justitia*, *oboedientia* and *dominatio*, *libertas* and *servitus*, *rex justus* and *rex iniquus*. These

³ A list of twenty-two of these studies is given in NADG 41, 1919, 327, but it does not include all.

ideas need only be named for anyone at all acquainted with the sources to recognize their dominating rôle in mediaeval thought. Bernheim has handled the vast material in masterly fashion, and there can be no doubt that his work will stimulate the efforts of other scholars in the same direction. Such we have already in *H. Hermelink's* article on the *civitas terrena* (Festgabe für Harnack, Tübingen, Mohr, 1921). The continuation of Bernheim's book promised by the title has not yet appeared. — *Kern's* book is noteworthy for fullness of ideas. It deals with a problem that was of the deepest significance to humanity in the Middle Ages and has kept its interest down to the present day, — the mutual relation of the divine right of kings (*Gotteseignadentum*) and the right of resistance (*Widerstandsrecht*). In analyzing this relation, Kern aims primarily at showing the roots from which it sprang, and for this we must go back to a time in which the watchwords "divine right" and "popular sovereignty," "resistance" and "non-resistance," had not yet been invented, although the underlying ideas were implied in the battle cries of parties. The path leads to two originally separate worlds of thought: on the one hand the doctrine of the church as held in late antiquity and in the Middle Ages, and the beginnings of the formation of the German states on the other. These two worlds, by successive battle and truce, by mutual attraction and repulsion, in the ninth, eleventh, and thirteenth centuries, prepared the way for later ideas about the relation of ruler and ruled, and created the bases of the theories of absolutism and constitutionalism. In the formula *dei gratia*, which had already in early Carolingian times been adopted from the official style of the Frankish bishops into that of the kings,⁴ the authority conferred by the consecration of the church was united with the special supernatural power which, according to the Germanic conception of inherited right (*Geblutsrecht*), was inherent in the *stirps regia* — and originally in this as such, not in the individual. Only through the gradual development of a law of inheritance in place of popular election from among

⁴ For the origin of this formula consult especially *Karl Schmitz*, *Ursprung und Geschichte der Devotionsformeln bis zu ihrer Aufnahme in die fränkische Königsurkunde* (KA 81, 1913). xviii, 192 pp. Stuttgart, Enke, 1913.

the members of the royal house was the way opened for the idea that, just as in the ecclesiastical theory of "tradition," the grace of God is conveyed directly from one person to another. But the *dei gratia* was now met by a limitation from the claim of the church, as the conveyer of all divine grace, to sit in judgment even on the king, and this claim was supported both in theory and in practice by St. Augustine's conception of the *rex justus* and *rex iniquus* (*tyrannus*). The Germanic conception of the mutual relation of fidelity between ruler and people, with the conviction that even the king must yield to the supreme power of the law, came into conflict with this claim, while on the other hand the Christian doctrine of obedience to authority favored the growth of the absolutist theory, supported by the conceptions of Roman Law and the ancient tradition of the deification of emperors. Over against all these tendencies mediaevalism at its height (see Manegold of Lauterbach's very interesting discussions in the time of the contest over investitures) was fostering the democratic principle of the sovereignty of the people;⁵ and finally out of the concurrent authority and responsibility of the higher nobility (cf. Magna Charta) grew the union of royal rights and popular rights in the constitutional theory. Into this chaos of heterogeneous ideas Kern has very skilfully tried to introduce some kind of order. But the book is not easy reading; a clearly written and well arranged text is overloaded with a mass of notes which remind one of Carlyle's Dryasdust. The Sage of Chelsea would also have shaken his head over the lack of an index. Yet these notes, which sometimes grow to the proportions of essays, contain so much valuable matter that they well repay serious study.

In connection with these two important books two rectoral addresses by Catholic theologians deserve mention. The main subject of Gölle's address is the question of the time-limits of the Middle Ages. He sides with those scholars who put the transition from antiquity to the Middle Ages in the time of

⁵ For the late mediaeval development of this idea, which lies outside of our province, see Ernst Schoeniman, *Die Idee der Volkssouveränität im mittelalterlichen Rom* (Frankfurter historische Studien, hrsg. von Georg Kuntzel und Fritz Kern, N.S., 2). Frankfurt dissertation. 128 pp. Leipzig, Köhler, 1919.

Gregory the Great. The merit of his own work lies in his study of the influence of the Orient on the Occident, and this not in general terms but by concrete examples, in which task his vast erudition in sources and in literature stands him in good stead. Noteworthy is the new light shed upon the beginnings of mediaeval penitential practice, a subject which he intends to treat more fully in another connection. The last section, after considering the ecclesiastical higher culture of the Middle Ages, seeks to determine the channels through which the currents of Catholic influence have passed into the modern world. — *Manser* starts with the proposition that the real collapse of mediaeval thought must be dated earlier than 1500. The great crisis falls rather in the fourteenth century, when the classic edifice of the ecclesiastical conception built up during the previous century was shaken to its foundations by searching and all-pervading monistic, subjective, antimetaphysical tendencies, which undermined the distinction and the harmony of faith and knowledge, philosophy and theology, church and state, knowing and willing, metaphysical and empirical knowledge. To the elucidation of these matters Manser contributes many discriminating observations.

Of the monumental work undertaken by the united German Academies, namely as complete a publication as possible of the catalogues of the mediaeval libraries of central Europe, the first volumes have appeared. *Gottlieb* edits the catalogues of Lower Austria, and here, since the region was colonized by the church relatively late, the stress of the work lies on the late Middle Ages. Each section has an introduction giving the history of the library to which the text relates. The extreme accuracy of the work is praised by specialists in the field. The same is true of the work of *Lehmann*, who publishes the catalogues of the bishoprics of Constance and Chur. This volume is valuable because it contains the original very complete catalogues of St. Gall and Reichenau. For the sources specialists are referred to his article in HJG. The catalogue of the manuscripts in the Bavarian National Museum is useful, although it includes only the Latin and certain mediaeval German manuscripts.

II. EARLY MEDIAEVAL CHRISTIANITY

a. Sources

Aldhelmi Opera. Ed. *Rudolfus Ehwald*. Fasc. 2 and 3 (MGH, Auct. ant. XV. 2, 3). xxv, 324-765 pp. Berlin, Weidmann, 1919. — Arbeonis episcopi Frisingensis vitae SS. Haimhrammi et Corbiniani. Ed. *Bruno Krusch* (SRG). viii, 244 pp. Hanover, Hahn, 1920. — S. Bonifatii et Lulli epistolae. Ed. *Michael Tangl* (Epistolae selectae in usum schol. ex MGH separatim editae, tom. I). xl, 321 pp. Berlin, Weidmann, 1916. — Passiones vitaeque sanctorum aevi merovingici. Ed. *Bruno Krusch* et *Wilhelm Levison* (MGH, Script. rer. meroving. VIII. 1, 2). x, 902 pp. Hanover, Hahn, 1919, 1920. — Rhythmi aevi merovingici et carolini. Ed. *Carolus Strecker* (MGH, Poet. lat. med. aev., tom. IV. pars. ii, 1. pp. 445-900). Berlin, Weidmann, 1914. — *Brüning, Gertrud*, Adamnans Vita Columbae und ihre Ableitungen. Bonn dissertation. (Zeitschr. f. kelt. Philologie 11, 1917, 213-304). — *Müller, Karl Otto*, Eine neue Handschrift der Vita s. Bonifatii von Otloh (NADG 41, 1919, 691-704). — *Peitz, Wilhelm*, Rimberts Vita Anskarii in ihrer ursprünglichen Gestalt (Zeitschr. des Vereins f. hamburgische Geschichte 22, 1918, 135-167). — *Strecker, Karl*, Zu den Quellen für das Leben des heiligen Ninian (NADG 43, 1920, 1-26).

The Monumenta Germaniae Historica has now a full century to look back on.⁶ Since 1826 the thick volumes, at first in folio and later in quarto, have been the indispensable equipment of generations of scholars. Even during the War the staff kept at work, and several substantial volumes were published, among them the seventh and last volume of the *Passiones vitaeque sanctorum aevi merovingici*, edited by *Krusch* and *Levison*. It contains seventeen Lives, of varying length and value. The most important are those of St. Germain Auxerrois (†448), written by the presbyter Constantine at Lyons about 500, that of St. Germain de Paris (†576), and that of Bishop Wili-brord of Utrecht (†739), the apostle to the Frisians, written by Alcuin. The volume contains also, in more than 150 pages of fine print, an account of all the hagiographic manuscripts used in preparing it, and some additional material for vols. I-VI. — *Ehwald* has finished his monumental edition of the works of Aldhelm of Malmesbury (†709) begun in 1909. This concluding section contains the poetic version of the *De virginitate*, some letters from and to Aldhelm, five charters granting privi-

⁶ A history of the Monumenta Germaniae Historica, written by Professor *Harry Bresslau* at the request of the managing committee, was published in 1921 as vol. 42 of NADG (xvi, 769 pp.).

leges to the monastery of Malmesbury from the time of Aldhelm — the only genuine ones out of a great number that have come down — and finally some *carmina rhythmica* from Aldhelm's school. There are full indices, the linguistic index being especially valuable. — *Strecker* publishes some rhythmical poems of various content by Gallic and Italian writers whose names are lost. They are in part on biblical subjects, in part hymns to saints. His book includes also an *Exhortatio poenitendi* which is generally ascribed to Isidore of Seville but is certainly of later date; a *Lamentum poenitentiale* by the same poet; three considerable poetical versions of the *Vita Eligii* (Bishop of Noyon) and the *Passiones* of SS. Christopher and Justin Martyr, and finally a revision of the so-called *Cena Cypriani*, made by a certain Johannes Diaconus who lived about 900. This volume also contains much that is of general interest for the history of civilization.

Among the additions to the *Scriptores rerum germanicarum in usum scholarum*, *Tangl's* critical edition of the letters of Boniface and his pupil Lullus deserves first place.⁷ *Tangl* has newly collated the chief manuscripts (at Munich, Carlsruhe, and Vienna), and draws important conclusions as to the history of the manuscripts and of the collections on which they are based. His grounds are given in his "Studies for a new edition of the letters of St. Boniface" (*NADG* 40, 1916, 639–790; 41, 1917, 23–101). The apparatus includes brief notes on the subject matter as well as textual criticism. — *Fräulein Brüning* has proved the dependence of Adamnan's *Vita Columbae* (†597) upon earlier lives of saints, such as the *Vita Antonii*, the *Vita Martini*, and the dialogues of Sulpicius Severus and of Gregory the Great, although in her study of the history of the tradition she has not reached any definite conclusions. The shorter form of the Life seems to have been composed in the ninth century on German soil in the region of St. Gall and Reichenau. The *Vita Columbae* by the so-called Cummenus, which is printed in an appendix, is a comparatively late epitome of the original *Vita*. — *Müller* describes and discusses a fragment preserved

⁷ On the editions of the Chronicle of Adam of Bremen and the letters of Gregory VII, see sections V and IV below.

in the city archives of Ludwigsburg of an eleventh century manuscript of the Life of Boniface by Otloh, a monk of St. Emmeran about 1050. As no other known manuscript is earlier than the twelfth century, the fragment is of great importance for the history of manuscript tradition. — With less success *Peitz* has tried to prove that the shorter form of the Life of St. Ansgarius, hitherto usually considered an extract from the longer Life, is the original text. His theory, which has attracted much attention, fails to convince because the longer version, which on his view must have suffered interpolation, can be proved to be linguistically uniform throughout. He may have been led to espouse the cause of the shorter version by the fact that it contains the Hamburg papal documents in the form, hitherto regarded as spurious, according to which the legatine district of the Hamburg church extended to Iceland, Greenland, and the Faroe islands. We shall see below (V.a) that *Peitz* has tried to prove this to be the original form. *Wilhelm Levison*, enters the lists on the opposite side, with a well-informed review in the same journal (NADG 43, 1919, 89). — Considering the importance for his own time of Saint Ninian, apostle to the Picts (†401, at Candida Casa), it is to be regretted that we know so little of what he really did. We have only the short notices in Bede and the biography by Abbot Ailred from about the middle of the twelfth century. *Strecker* draws attention to certain poems about Ninian, preserved in a manuscript at Bamberg, which Alcuin received from his pupils at York but which originated at Candida Casa. Ailred did not know these *Miracula Nyniae episcopi*, but both his biography and the poems seem to go back to an early Vita which must have been in the library of the monastery.

b. *Monographs*

Bendel, Franz J., Studien zur ältesten Geschichte der Abtei Fulda (HJG 38, 1917, 758–772). — *Boehmer, Heinrich*, Zur Geschichte des Bonifatius (Zeitschr. des Vereins f. hessische Gesch. u. Landeskunde 50, n.f. 40, 1917, 171–215). — *Hautkappe, Franz*, Ueber die altdeutschen Beichten und ihre Beziehungen zu Caesarius von Arles (Forschungen und Funde, hrsg. von Franz Jostes 4, 5). vi, 133 pp. Münster, Aschendorff, 1917. — *Hörle, Georg Heinrich*, Frühmittelalterliche Mönchs- und Klerikerbildung in Italien. Geistliche Bildungsideale und Bildungseinrichtungen vom 6. bis 9.

Jahrhundert (FrThSt 13). xii, 87 pp. Freiburg i. B., Herder, 1914. — *Koebner, Richard*, Venantius Fortunatus. Seine Persönlichkeit und seine Stellung in der Geschichte der geistigen Kultur des Merowinger-Reiches (BKGM 22, 1915). iv, 150 pp. — *Koeniger, Albert Michael*, Die Militärseelsorge der Karolingerzeit (VKSM 4, 7, 1918). — *Laux, Johann Joseph*, Der heilige Columban. Sein Leben und seine Schriften. xvi, 290 pp. Freiburg i. B., Herder, 1919. — *Nottarp, Hermann*, Die Bistumserrichtung in Deutschland im 8. Jahrhundert (KA 96, 1920). vii, 259 pp. — *Schubert, Hans von*, Die sogenannten Slavenapostel Constantin und Methodius. Ein grundlegendes Kapitel aus den Beziehungen Deutschlands zum Südosten (SAH 1916, 1). 32 pp. Heidelberg, Winter. — *Tangl, Michael*, Bonifatiusfragen (AAB 1919, 2). 41 pp. — *Voigt, Karl*, Die karolingische Klosterpolitik und der Niedergang des westfränkischen Königums (KA 90, 91, 1917). xiv, 265 pp.

Hautkappe's subject is the early German penitential books, especially their definition, classification, and arrangement of the sins. He finds the same general scheme in all: first the decalogue and the fundamental sins, indicated by substantives, in the manner familiar since the time of the monastic writers; then offences against the church and the duties of love to one's neighbor, which are given in the form of complete sentences. He regards Caesarius of Arles (†542), the celebrated preacher, who had a strong influence on the early Middle Ages, as the originator of this scheme. The Benedictine rule had comparatively little effect. — *Hörle* describes the general condition of education among the clergy in Italy in the second half of the sixth century and the ideal of education embodied in the *Schola cantorum* of Gregory the Great. He shows that the clerical training there aimed at was superior to that of the Lombard church and that Monte Cassino, later so famous for learning, was at first less important. The standard of education among the Italian clergy was raised by Frankish and Irish influences, but it still remained limited to ecclesiastical learning, that is to a knowledge of the Scriptures and the Liturgy, until the Carolingian period. At the latter date the study of the liberal arts, which Augustine and Cassiodorus had required of the priesthood, was revived, and in the greater episcopal sees, especially at Rome, we may assume a well-developed system of education for the constantly increasing numbers of the clergy. Unfortunately this did not last long, for the general decline of

culture in Italy at the end of the ninth century and in the first half of the tenth brought to naught this gain. A valuable feature of Hörle's work is his abundant citation, from the original sources, of details, which is all the more welcome as the subject has not hitherto been treated in detail.

Koebner, in his monograph on Venantius Fortunatus, the only eminent poet of the Merovingian age, depends for his biographical material chiefly on Wilhelm Meyer's fundamental article in AGW (4, 1901, no. 5), but his critical estimate of the poet is entirely his own and is noteworthy. While Fortunatus is for Meyer the first of the mediaeval poets, Koebner sees in him chiefly the inheritor of the poetry and rhetoric of antiquity.⁸ In discussing the separate poems he tries to bring out their personal and intimate qualities, which critics have never been able completely to ignore, although most of them grant the poet only a gift for style. The youthful poems, composed at the court of King Sigibert, show a certain elevation of feeling in spite of their panegyric character, but the true poet was awakened in Fortunatus through his acquaintance with the pious ladies of Poitiers, Radegunde, Agnes, and the others, whose personal appearance, refinement, kindness, and saintliness made a deep impression on him. The doctrinal poem on Virginity, the famous prophecy of the downfall of Thuringia, the lament for Gelesuintha, the beautiful hymns *Pange* and *Vexilla*, as well as the Easter hymn, show him at the height of his poetical development, while the poems of his old age and the *Vita Martini* reveal the decline of his powers. Koebner's book, which deals with the history of the time as well, deserves special attention because there is not, to my knowledge, any work on Fortunatus in English which can claim scholarly thoroughness. — This is not the situation with *Laux's* Life of St. Columban. The author himself, under the pseudonym of George Metlake, published a monograph in honor of the centenary of the saint (†615) at Philadelphia in 1914, and in 1916 Mrs. Concannon's book, "St. Columbanus, a Study in Early

⁸ Heinrich Brewer has pointed out (ZkTh 13, 1919, 693–695) that the masses which Mone dates before the time of Constantine were composed by Fortunatus.

Irish Monasticism," appeared at Dublin. Laux sums up the admirable preliminary work of Greith, Gundlach, Hauck, and Seebass, and continues it, using all the available authorities and giving continuous quotations from them. His aim has been to present only what will bear searching criticism, and even where the scantiness of the evidence drives him to constructions, he tries to keep in accord with historical facts. He has given, not a conventional portrait of a saint for purposes of edification, but the genuine story of a particular saint.

In spite of such standard works as Hauck's Church History, something new still remains to be offered even on a dominant personality like Boniface, as *Boehmer's* article shows. It sheds much new light upon Boniface's activity in Hesse, and is remarkable for thoroughness even on geological and ethnological questions. He again proves conclusively that Boniface did not choose his tasks himself, but that they were assigned to him by the popes and sometimes by the Frankish and Bavarian princes; according to Boehmer only the attempted mission to Friesland and the idea of the Saxon mission were due to his own initiative. A useful chronological table of his life gives details and mentions pertinent contemporary events. That Boehmer sets the year of his death at 754 (not 755) would not require mention were it not that the wrong date is constantly reappearing. — Boehmer's sometimes very striking inferences from the original authorities have prompted an examination of them from the peculiarly competent hand of *Tangl* (see on his edition of the Letters, p. 336 above). His critical judgments cannot be discussed here, but special students of the subject should not overlook them. The second part of his article is a refutation of *Bendel's* attempt, on insufficient grounds, to treat the *Vita Sturmi* as a forgery written under the name of Eigil by a later hand. Tangl shows afresh that the testimony of the *Vita* as a contemporary document fully deserves credence in any study of the earliest history of Fulda.

In the well-known series of "Kirchenrechtliche Abhandlungen" edited by Professor Ulrich Stutz (formerly at Bonn, now at Berlin), two important studies of church law in early Carolingian times have appeared. *Nottarp* deals with the found-

ing of the earliest German bishoprics ⁹ and their legal connections. A well-qualified judge, A. M. Koeniger, in *ThRev* (20, 1921, 307), says that he has definitively and admirably summed up all that is to be said on the subject. — *Voigt's* work has also been favorably criticized, and deservedly so, for he elucidates sagaciously and thoroughly a subject of importance for general church history. He starts from the assumption that in the West-frankish kingdom in the later Carolingian period, that is from the time of Louis the Pious, episcopal sees were often granted by the kings to secular counts. The same was true of the monasteries, and in this case with a better legal claim, as these monasteries were often, by virtue of their foundation, royal monasteries, or *Eigenklöster*, to take an expression coined by Stutz and now in general use. Since these monastic establishments constituted an economic factor of no small importance, the policy of bestowing them as gifts was not without danger to the royal power. It weakened the ruler's economic and consequently his military strength, especially when the nobles contrived to unite several wealthy benefices in one hand and to use their revenues in working against the king, as was done, for example, by the lords of Anjou and Poitiers, or the dukes of Aquitaine. Whenever these great nobles appointed lay abbots as tenants of the monasteries, all connection with the royal power ceased, and the monastery became more and more the "private chapel" of the tenant. Tenure and lay abbacy became hereditary, and the tenure of such monasteries might even fall to women. This development was especially pronounced during the period of the Cluniac reform, that is, in the tenth and the beginning of the eleventh century. It is well known that the church profited greatly by this situation, as soon as the nobles clearly saw that the reform of ecclesiastical and monastic life meant the abolition of the system of lay abbots. To follow these ideas further lay outside our author's field, but the wealth of detail which he gives, and which is only imperfectly suggested in the preceding review, makes his work, both on the side of church history and on that

⁹ See also *Michael Tangl*, *Das Bistum Erfurt* (Geschichtliche Studien für Albert Hauck, 108-120, Leipzig, Hinrichs, 1916).

of "Kulturgeschichte," a valuable supplement to those of Hauck and von Schubert. — *Koeniger* has made an interesting study, based entirely on the original authorities, of military chaplaincies in Carolingian times. He treats both the legal and the practical side of the subject, citing for the former the decrees of councils and royal edicts, while he also depicts the well-qualified priests who accompanied the armies, equipped with their altars, prayer books, vestments, holy oil, and other requirements for services of worship, for preaching, and the sacrament of penance, as well as for the care of the sick, wounded, and dead. In an appendix he gives an unpublished military sermon from a manuscript in Munich and reprints one previously known but especially characteristic.

III. THE EMPIRE AND THE CHURCH

a. Sources

Eichmann, Eduard, Kirche und Staat. I: Von 750–1122. II: Von 1122 bis zur Mitte des 14. Jahrhunderts (Quellensammlung zur kirchlichen Rechtsgeschichte und zum Kirchenrecht, hrsg. von E. Eichmann, 1, 2). viii, 126; viii, 182 pp. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1912, 1914. — *Günter, Heinrich*, Die römischen Krönungsseide der deutschen Kaiser (KIT 132, 1915). 51 pp. — *Scholz, Richard*, Marsilius von Padua: Defensor pacis, für Uebungszwecke bearbeitet. (Quellensammlung zur deutschen Geschichte, hrsg. von Erich Brandenburg und Gerhard Seeliger). viii, 131 pp. Leipzig and Berlin, Teubner, 1914. — *Scholz, Richard*, Unbekannte kirchenpolitische Streitschriften aus der Zeit Ludwigs des Baiern. Analysen und Texte. II. (Bibliothek des preuss. histor. Instituts in Rom 10). x, 611 pp. Rome, Loescher, 1914.

The collections of texts here listed are all valuable, either for scholars using the sources or, in some cases, for training such scholars. *Eichmann's* series is modelled after the "Quellensammlung zur deutschen Geschichte," in which Haller's "Quellen zur Geschichte der Entstehung des Kirchenstaats" and Bernheim's "Quellen zur Geschichte des Investiturstreits" appeared in 1907. An outline of the topics which he treats will show the wealth of the contents: Heft I: (1) alliance of the papacy with the Carolingians, the Ottos, and the Salian emperors; priest-kingdom and divine state; (2) legislation of the state church; (3) recognition and protection of the ecclesiastical organization; (4) coöperation of the church in the

tasks of the state; (5) anointing and coronation of the German kings and emperors; (6) transition to a hierocratic system (pseudo-Isidore, Gregory VII). Heft II: (1) the inner unity of *sacerdotium* and *imperium*; (2) the privileged position of the church; (3) the ecclesiastical position and rights of the emperor; (4) the struggle of empire and papacy; (5) hierocratism; (6) the reaction (Dante, Marsilius, Occam, etc.). The hundreds of original texts of various lengths here assembled afford large assistance for the work of scholars and their pupils, and the use of these pamphlets in practical exercises is earnestly to be recommended. For Heft III, see below, IV, a, *Ebers*. — *Günter's* collection of all the coronation oaths from Pepin (Promise of Ponthieu) to Frederick III (1452) and Charles V (1530) is useful for the same purpose. Historical clearness is served by considering not only the promises actually made under oath on the coronation day, but also what was in each case taken for granted and the accompanying circumstances. See also below under Monographs, *Wickmann*. — *Scholz's* book, the first volume of which appeared in 1911, is intended not for training investigators but to further future investigations. The second volume gives texts from sixteen authors, chiefly of the curialist party, including the important tractates of Conrad of Megenberg (*Placitus ecclesiae, Translatio Romani imperii, Tractatus contra Wilhelmum Occam*). Six important pieces are given from Occam himself, the only representative of the imperial party in the collection, among them being an attack on Ludwig's ally, Edward III of England. — The complete work of Marsilius of Padua is difficult of access, and until the critical edition in preparation for MGH appears, *Scholz's* selections from the *Defensor pacis* can serve as a good substitute, since they include everything of importance and fully meet the requirements of criticism.

b. Monographs

Büseler, Gerda, Die Kaiserkrönungen in Rom und die Römer von Karl dem Grossen bis Friedrich II. xiv, 315 pp. Freiburg i. B., Herder, 1919. — *Brackmann, Albert*, Die Erneuerung der Kaiserwürde im Jahr 800 (Geschichtliche Studien für Albert Hauck, 121-134). Leipzig, Hinrichs, 1916. — *Bugge, Alexander*, Stat og Kirke i Norge, 1152-1164 (NHT, 5. ser., 3, 1916.

169-212). — *Caspar, Erich*, Pippin und die römische Kirche. Kritische Untersuchungen zum fränkisch-päpstlichen Bunde im VIII. Jahrhundert. viii, 208 pp. Berlin, Springer, 1914. — *Eichmann, Eduard*, Die römischen Eide der deutschen Könige (Zeitschr. f. Rechtsgesch. 37, Kanonistische Abteilung 6, 1916, 140-205); Studien zur Geschichte der abendländischen Kaiserkrönung. I. Die Beteiligung der lateranensischen Bischöfe (HJG 39, 1918-19, 714-730). — *Falk, Erik*, Marsilius af Padua (KÅ 18, 1917, 197-227). — *Günter, Heinrich*, Die Krönungseide der deutschen Kaiser im Mittelalter (Forschungen u. Versuche zur Gesch. des Mittelalters u. der Neuzeit. Festschrift für Dietrich Schäfer. 6-39). Jena, Fischer, 1915. — *Haller, Johannes*, Heinrich VI und die römische Kirche (MIOeG 35, 1914, 385-454, 545-669). — *Hoffmann, Heinrich*, Karl der Grosse im Bilde der Geschichtsschreibung des früheren Mittelalters (HSt 137). xvi, 116 pp. 1919. — *Hofmeister, Adolf*, Das Wormser Konkordat. Zum Streit um seine Bedeutung (Forsch. u. Versuche [vide supra, Günter], 64-148). — *Kozłowski, Jerzy von*, Kirche und Staat und Kirchenstaat nach dem heiligen Bernhard von Clairvaux. Freiburg i. B. dissertation. vi, 122 pp. Posen, Wieniewicz, 1916. — *Moeller, Richard*, Ludwig der Bayer und die Kurie im Kampf um das Reich (HSt 116). xvi, 256 pp. 1914. — *Pijper, F.*, Strijd tusschen kerk en staat in het begin der veertiende eeuw. Bonifacius VIII contra Filips den Schoone (NAKG 14, 1917, 1-49). — *Posch, Andreas*, Die staats- und kirchen-politische Stellung Edgars von Admont (Veröffentlichungen der Görresgesellschaft, Sektion für Rechts- und Sozialwissenschaft 37). x, 130 pp. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1920. — *Proehl, Hermann*, Beiträge zur Gesch. der Entstehung des Kirchenstaats. Diss. 98 pp. Halle, John, 1914. — *Rassow, Peter*, Pippin und Stephan II (ZKG 36, 1916, 494-502). — *Schönegger, Artur*, Die kirchenpolitische Bedeutung des "Constitutum Constantini" im früheren Mittelalter (ZkTh 42, 1918, 327-371, 541-590). — *Schrörs, Heinrich*, Untersuchungen zu dem Streite Kaiser Friedrichs I mit Papst Hadrian IV, 1157-1158. Univ. progr. Bonn. 72 pp. Freiburg i. B., Herder, 1916. — *Sperling, Eva*, Studien zur Geschichte der Kaiserkrönung. Freiburg i. B. dissertation. 63 pp. Stuttgart, Violet, 1918. — *Stieglitz, Leopold*, Die Staatstheorie des Marsilius von Padua (BKGM 19, 1914). 56 pp.

Certain problems perennially tempt the pens of historians. One of these is the inquiry into the rise of the temporal power of the papacy, to which *Caspar* now devotes a comprehensive treatise. His thorough acquaintance with the Latin of early mediaeval documents enables him to interpret disputed formulas and expressions with certainty, and so to put his consideration of historical events on a firm footing. There was special need of such a sound explanation for the formula *sanctae ecclesiae dei rei publicae Romanorum*, which occurs frequently in the official documents of Popes Stephen II (752-757) and Stephen III (768-772) as well as in the *Vita Stephani*. *Caspar*

shows beyond doubt that grammatically *rei publicae* is dependent on *ecclesiae*, not vice versa, so that we must not say, as is often done, 'Roman state of the holy church,' but 'holy church of the Roman state.' Moreover, 'the Roman state' does not mean the Imperium Romanum in the ancient sense, but according to the usage of the time the *Romani* are the Italian nationals in distinction from the Lombards on the one hand and the Greeks on the other. Hence *res publica Romanorum* embodies the central thought of the program of national autonomy which Stephen II followed and to realize which he entered upon his alliance with the Frankish king. Subject to this *res publica Romanorum* is the holy church and Saint Peter himself. With these words the papal chancery created the formula by which it was hoped to establish as against King Pepin the claim upon the imperial territory. It was to this church that Pepin in the negotiations at Kiersy (754) guaranteed, rather than gave, possession of Istria, Venetia, the exarchate of Ravenna, and the duchy of Rome, besides Spoleto and Benevento. Caspar rightly lays great stress upon this distinction. In the treaty of Kiersy there is mention of *donationis pagina*, but in the usage of the time we are to understand only a general reference to the document. A gift or bestowal is out of the question until after the second Peace of Pavia (756). In that the Byzantine claims were expressly repudiated. Later, under Paul II (757-767), the policy of Rome established more and more firmly the claims based on that "gift." The product of their claims, so important for secular history, is the so-called Donation of Constantine, more correctly designated as the *constitutum Constantini*. This originated under Paul I, and is to be regarded, in Caspar's terms, as the final rupture in theory between the papacy and the Greek empire. The relations of the Frankish kingdom were not directly affected by it. The origin of these relations, which led to the treaty of defence of 754 (Ponthieu), is subjected to a searching examination in the first section of Caspar's book. On the whole he thinks the conclusion justified that Pepin's policy toward the church was more beneficial than injurious to the Roman See. To this *Rassow* objects that the popes remained in complete depend-

ence on the Frankish kings and that Pepin cannot have failed to foresee the conflicts which necessarily arose from the ambiguous character of the type of state he had created. — *Proehl* gives a critical survey of recent investigations and discusses the origin of the so-called *Fragmentum Fantuzzianum*.

That the Donation of Constantine is to be dated in the time of Paul I has gradually become accepted by scholars,¹ and it is the conclusion reached by *Schönegger* after a careful weighing of the various opinions. The emphasis of his article however lies not so much on this critical judgment as on his valuable collection of all the passages referring to the Donation, from the first mention of it by pseudo-Isidore down to its incorporation into the *decretum Gratiani*. He has here brought together a wealth of material not to be neglected by future writers on the history of church law. — The fact that the first public use of the *constitutum* was that made by pseudo-Isidore in the middle of the ninth century has always served as a support for historians who desired to assign the document to that century, but on the other hand it is important to note that the principles of the *constitutum* played their part in the events preceding the coronation of Charlemagne as emperor, and indeed that the papal conception of the coronation would be incomprehensible without them. This is shown by *Brackmann* in his article on the revival of the imperial dignity in the year 800. His few pages on this topic are perhaps the best thing that has been written on it. The coronation is made more difficult to understand by the fact that the papal and the Frankish accounts of it are contradictory. It is futile to try to reconcile them, and they can only be judged rightly if it is borne in mind that they proceeded from totally different ideas of the meaning of the imperial office. For the papal biographer this act was the crown of the edifice which the popes had been rearing since the time of Stephen II. As already observed in speaking of the views of Caspar, the idea of the autonomous *res publica Romanorum* was the chief point in the political program of the popes;

¹ I may state that I took this position as long ago as 1889 (*Theol. Literaturzeitung*, nos. 17 and 18) in a full discussion of Friedrich's views. At that time but few investigators had adopted it, among them B. Scheffer-Boichorst.

and as early as the time of Hadrian it was combined with the idea of the *pium imperium*. In contrast to this conception of the founding of an Empire in the West by the pope, to which the parallel: Leo III — Charlemagne, Sylvester I — Constantine the Great, gave welcome support, the view of the Frankish imperial annalists leads us into the ancient world. To the Franks, the *imperium* of Charles is the universal *imperium* of the Roman Caesars, succeeding to the vacant Greek *imperium*. The papal account is certainly right in representing the pope as the sole author of the act of coronation, but it would be wrong to infer from this, and from Charles's reluctance to admit the pope's initiative, that Charles had not for a long time cherished the idea of the imperial dignity. He was reluctant, because a coronation at the hands of the pope would involve him in the ideas associated with the Donation of Constantine. His own attitude is shown by his negotiations with Byzantium and by the *designatio* of his son in 813 without participation by the pope. — To write the posthumous history of Charlemagne was the task set himself by *Hoffmann*, a young scholar who fell in the war. While Gaston Paris, in his "Histoire poétique de Charle-Magne," had devoted a monograph, hitherto unsurpassed, to the glorification of the Frankish king in epic poetry, Hoffmann limits his field to the writers who intended to present actual history. In the native land of the Carolingians legends gathered about the figure of Charles until it grew to more than human proportions, but in Germany an impression of his personality persisted which kept closer to historic fact. His strict justice and his activity as a lawgiver were especially remembered. He became the ideal ruler, the model for the ablest of his successors. The period of the Crusades rounded out this ideal to romantic perfection, until finally Frederick Barbarossa obtained his canonization, and so his apotheosis, from Pope Paschal III. This evolution is clearly depicted by Hoffmann from the original authorities.

With Christmas day of the year 800 begins that period of German history in which the German kings turned toward the south, to fetch from Rome the crown of the Caesars. The bitter contests over *imperium* and *sacerdotium* which this en-

tailed have often been narrated. But there was a third party to these contests, — the populace of the city of Rome, who manifested their particular interest by frequent outbreaks. To give a connected account of their relation to the imperial elections is Fräulein *Bäseler's* task. She distinguishes three periods: (1) from Charlemagne to Ludwig III (800–901), (2) from Berengar to Henry III (915–1046), (3) from Henry IV to Frederick II (1084–1220). In the first and third periods the antagonism of spiritual and secular Rome — the latter represented at first by the aristocracy of papal officials and later by purely local elements — was of decisive significance for the elections; in the second period spiritual and secular powers were generally united by the Roman nobility in a single family or a single person. From this point of view Fräulein *Bäseler* discusses the several elections down to the latest of the Hohenstaufens. Her work is conscientious and merits attention. — Fräulein *Sperling* first directs attention to the ritual of coronation, the so-called *ordines*, in which, in correspondence with the meaning of the coronation procedure, the relation of *imperium* and *sacerdotium* was symbolized. She next deals with the successive acts of the process: anointing, consecration, and coronation, showing the changes in their mutual relations during the Middle Ages. A third section treats of the oaths which the emperors swore to the popes. It is a good piece of work, but suffers from lack of clearness of arrangement. — The question of coronation oaths is acutely examined by *Eichmann*. He shows that the *fidelitas* therein required was originally pledged by both parties, the pope as well as the emperor, but from the time of Lothair II, that is after Gregory VII, by the emperor alone. Henceforth the *fidelitas* no longer expresses the mutual relation subsisting between two equal powers, but that of a subject to a superior, a vassal to a lord. This theory, that the *imperium* was a papal grant, was insisted on by the curia with increasing emphasis from the time of Innocent III. It is however by no means implicit in the idea of *fidelitas*, but rests ultimately upon the belief in the Donation of Constantine; with it papal imperialism stands or falls. An important event in this history is the decretal of Clement V, *Romani principes*

(1314), which required the oath of vassalage. *Günter*, however, who has specially studied this question, is of the opinion that no oath of vassalage was taken by the emperors either before or after the decretal. See below under Moeller. — *Kozłowski* describes Bernard of Clairvaux as pursuing a policy of mediation, with the aim of doing justice both to state and church, but as at heart theocentric. The theory of the two swords is discussed with insight and competent knowledge. — *Schrörs*' investigations centre about the events in the Diet at Besançon in 1157, which began the conflict between Frederick Barbarossa and Pope Hadrian IV and, after him, Alexander III. *Schrörs* adduces very strong arguments to prove that the much-contested word *beneficia* in the pope's letter read at the Diet was intended to express the feudal dependence of the imperial power (*beneficium* meaning 'fief,' as the curia and its partisans have always interpreted it, not 'benefit'). — In the Concordat of Worms (1122), according to *Hofmeister*, no new right was created by the curia, but an ancient fundamental right of the state, that of election at the court of the king (hence *in praesentia tua*) was declared compatible with its principles. — *Haller's* article on Henry VI and the Roman church is important enough to have appeared also in book form. He tries to dispel the impression, so apt to prejudice the judgment of historians, that the emperor's policy was adventurous and improvised, and to show that the political aim which he pursued in Italy was only the consistent sequel to that which his father Barbarossa had followed in his later years, namely, the control of Italy by establishing his own power as firmly and broadly as possible in the middle of the peninsula, in close alliance with the Roman church. That he was enabled to unite Sicily with the Empire only strengthened an already existing ambition. Even the concessions to the pope made by Henry in his will, which Haller regards as genuine and complete, would have brought the emperor nearer to his goal if they had been carried out. What Henry desired was later vainly attempted by Frederick II. Charles of Anjou finally succeeded, and so the rôle which Henry had dreamed of for the German nation passed to the French. Compare below in IV, *Tangl*.—

Pijper's article is a critical survey, based partly on the recently published papal registers of the chief events in the great ecclesiastical controversy in France. He believes that the archdeacon Jacobus Normannus, who conveyed the bull *Ausculda fili*, brought also the short, insolent letter *Deum time*. In this he differs from the view that this letter and the king's answer *Fatuitas tua* were composed by the chancellor Pierre Flotte and published in place of the genuine bull, which had been burnt by the king's orders. Whether he is right seems doubtful to the present reviewer. — *Moeller* disputes the general opinion, shared even by Hauck, that the theory of imperial as against papal claims, so stoutly defended by the Hohenstaufens, did not disappear in the German empire in the succeeding period. It was not revived indeed until the time of Ludwig the Bavarian, and then it was not the princes of the empire such as Archbishop Baldwin of Trier, but the emperor himself who advocated it. In place of the dualism of emperor and empire, Ludwig, following in the footsteps of the Salians and Hohenstaufens, aimed at a unity of the imperial commonwealth, with the downfall of the particularism of the territorial princes. Under the advice of a small group of non-german publicists he strove with unwearied effort to win over these princes to his policy. At the Diet held in Frankfort in 1338 it looked as if he had attained his goal, but the speedy revolt of the princes marked the end of the old empire. *Moeller* defends his theory with new evidence and new arguments. Valuable critical discussions of the sources, which cannot be neglected by any serious student of the fourteenth century, constitute almost one third of the volume. It contains also fresh material on the vexed question of the value of the oaths sworn by the emperors at Rome. — One of the emperor's advisers, Marsilius of Padua, has recently been discussed by E. Emerton in the *Harvard Theological Studies*, 1920. Scholars in Germany have also been drawn to the attractive figure of this anticipator of modern ideas of the state. *Stieglitz* has written an elaborate and learned article on his doctrine of the state, and *Falk* a thoughtful essay. — The Benedictine monk Edgar of Admont was another thinker who contributed publicistic discussion to

the ecclesiastical controversy of the time of Ludwig the Bavarian. *Posch* gives a systematic account of his principles, comparing them with those of earlier publicists. He has been able to correct some biographical details, and discusses the manuscript tradition of Edgar's works.

IV. THE PAPACY

a. Sources

Bresslau, Harry, Aus der ersten Zeit des grossen abendländischen Schismas (AAB 1919, 6). 32 pp. Berlin, Vereinigung wissenschaftlicher Verleger. — *Ebers, Godehard Josef*, Der Papst und die römische Kurie. I: Wahl, Ordination und Krönung des Papstes (Quellensammlung zur kirchl. Rechtsgeschichte). viii, 216 pp. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1916. — *Hofmann, Walter von*, Forschungen zur Geschichte der kurialen Behörden vom Schisma bis zur Reformation (Bibliothek des preuss. histor. Instituts in Rom 12, 13). xi, 329; viii, 295 pp. Rome, Loescher, 1914. — GREGORY VII. Das Register Gregors VII, hrsg. von *Erich Caspar* (Epist. select. in usum schol. ex MGH sep. edit. II, 1: Gregorii VII. Registrum. lib. i-iv). xlii, 350 pp. Berlin, Weidmann, 1920. — PIUS II. Des Eneas Silvius Piccolomini Briefwechsel, hrsg. von *Rudolf Wolkan*. 3. Teil: Briefe als Bischof von Siena. I: Briefe von der Erhebung zum Bischof bis zum Ausgang des Regensburger Reichstags. xvi, 634 pp. Vienna, Holder, 1918. — *Göller, Emil*, Verzeichnis der in den Registern und Kameralakten Clemens' VII von Avignon vorkommenden Personen, Kirchen und Orte des deutschen Reiches, seiner Diözesen und Territorien (1378-1394). (Repertorium Germanicum. Bd. I.) xvi, 182*, 250 pp. Berlin, Weidmann, 1916. — Vatikanische Quellen zur Geschichte der päpstlichen Hof- und Finanzverwaltung, hrsg. von der Görresgesellschaft. III: *Schäfer, Karl Heinrich*, Die Ausgaben der apostolischen Kammer unter Benedikt XII, Klemens VI und Innocenz VI, 1335-1362. xii, 936 pp. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1914.

Eichmann's collection of sources (see III, a, above) extends in part beyond the period we are here dealing with. *Ebers* not only gives the documents for the mediaeval law relating to papal elections, but traces that law down to its final regulation by Gregory XV (1621) and Clement XII (1732), and appends the full text of the law of papal elections now in force as embodied in the Constitutions of Pius X (1904). The last section of his book contains the sources for ordination, enthronement, the so-called possession, and coronation. The book is useful to own, as the material is nowhere else so fully and conveniently assembled. The sources for the development of the papal rights

of jurisdiction and honors (*Ehrenrechte*), as well as those for the conflict between papalism and episcopatism, and those for the organization of the curia, are reserved for two later parts. — A new edition of the register of Gregory VII has long been a desideratum, since Jaffé's, in the *Bibliotheca Rerum Germanicarum*, is notoriously inadequate, and it was made imperative by Peitz's proof (1911) that the Vatican manuscript is an original register kept in the Gregorian chancery. This seemed to make the task of editing it comparatively simple, but a new complication arose from Caspar's discovery (1918) that the next oldest manuscript copy, that in the library of Troyes, the exemplar of which must have been derived from the Roman manuscript, contains variations from the latter which are unquestionably original. This singular fact is explained by the circumstance that the Roman manuscript in its present condition has not only suffered certain palaeographically demonstrable alterations, but has also received additions which do not belong to the original writing. In comparison with these two, all later manuscripts may be left virtually out of account. In addition, however, to the tradition proceeding from the papal chancery, attention must be paid to that which goes back to the several recipients of the letters. It is wrong to include in the textual apparatus this parallel tradition on an equal footing and without distinction, as Jaffé did. Caspar has accordingly drawn a sharp distinction between the tradition from the register and that from the recipients. In the text he aims to reproduce the original register as exactly as possible, and he appends a clearly constructed table of the arrangement of the Roman manuscript. The second half of this excellent edition is not yet published.

In the first volume of the "*Repertorium Germanicum*," published by the Prussian Historical Institute in Rome, *Göller* brings together new source-material of various kinds. Although little is to be gleaned in regard to the lesser observance of the schismatic pope at Avignon, the comprehensive introduction, which discusses the sources and the canonical, diplomatic, and historical problems, is of great importance. The legal aspects of the papal system of benefices are particularly well eluci-

dated. — *Bresslau* publishes and discusses some new documents relating to the history of the *oboedientia* of Clement VII. An important memorandum written by the pope's own hand, about means for ending the schism, is given in facsimile. — The publication, undertaken by the Görresgesellschaft, of the Vatican manuscript sources on the administration of the papal court and exchequer in the fourteenth century, lays a firm foundation for our knowledge of this branch of the administration of the curia, which, as is well known, gave rise to the severest attacks upon the papacy in the later Middle Ages. The first two volumes, edited by Göller and Schäfer, dealt with the time of John XXII (1316–1334), and the third, also by Schäfer, covers the years to 1362. An immense amount of material, very valuable in details, is here made available. — Another volume has appeared of the edition of the letters of Aeneas Silvius Piccolomini, later Pope Pius II, which *Wolkan* has been publishing since 1905 under the auspices of the Vienna Academy. This volume contains more than three hundred letters, many of them new. The improvement over the edition of Anton Weiss (1897) is considerable, especially since the correspondence of the years 1450–1454 forms a source of the first importance. — *Hofmann's* work may be mentioned in this connection, as the second volume gives original documents, lists, and excursus relating to the matters treated in the first volume. By studying the history of the papal chancery and comparing the parallel phenomena in the other offices, the author endeavors to determine the underlying causes that made it impossible, in spite of every effort at reform, to put a stop to the demoralization, especially in matters of finance, which began with the schism. The book is well written and is important also for students of the history of the Reformation. The Lateran Council report on reform (1513), here published for the first time, deserves special attention, as do the statements in the *avisamenta* of Cardinal Capranica about the state of morals in the curia under Pius II, which are certainly shocking, even if somewhat exaggerated.

b. *Monographs*

Baethgen, Friedrich, Die Regentschaft Papst Innozenz' III im Königreich Sizilien (Heidelberger Abhandl. zur mittl. und neueren Geschichte, hrsg. von Karl Hampe und Hermann Oncken, 44). 164 pp. Heidelberg, Winter, 1914. — *Brilioth, Y.*, Den påfliga beskattningen af Sverige intill den stora schismen. xxx, 385 pp. Upsala, 1915. — *Bull, Edvard*, Den pavelige legat Stephanus i Norge 1163 (Videnskabselskabets Skrifter II. Historisk-Filos. Klasse 1915, 2). 18 pp. Christiania, Dybwad. — *Dehio, Ludwig*, Innocenz IV und England. Strassburg dissertation. x, 84 pp. Berlin, Göschen, 1914. — *Fiebach, Johannes*, Die augustinischen Anschauungen Papst Innocenz' III als Grundlage für die Beurteilung seiner Stellung zum deutschen Thronstreit. Greifswald dissertation (see p. 331, foot-note 3). 65 pp. Neisse, Bär, 1914. — *Graf, Theodor*, Papst Urban VI. Berlin dissertation (partial publication). 182 pp. Berlin, Scholem, 1916. — *Heckel, Rudolf von*, Untersuchungen zu den Registern Innocenz' III (HJG 40, 1920, 1-43). — *Herzeld, Gottfried*, Papst Gregors VII Begriff der bösen Obrigkeit (*tyrannus, rex injustus, iniquus*) im Sinne der Anschauungen Augustins und Papst Gregors des Grossen. Greifswald dissertation (see p. 331, footnote 3). 88 pp. Greifswald, Adler, 1914. — *Lange, Johannes*, Das Staatensystem Gregors VII auf Grund des Augustinischen Begriffs von der "libertas ecclesiae." Greifswald dissertation (see p. 331, footnote 3). 82 pp. Greifswald, Adler, 1915. — *Lulvès, Jean*, Die Machtbestrebungen des Kardinalkollegiums gegenüber dem Papsttum (MIOEG 35, 1914, 455-483). — *Meyer, Erich W.*, Staatstheorien Papst Innocenz' III (Jenaer histor. Arbeiten, hrsg. von Alexander Cartellieri und Walter Judeich, 9). xii, 50 pp. Bonn, Marcus u. Weber, 1919. — *Meyer, Werner*, Ludwig IX von Frankreich und Innocenz IV in den Jahren 1244-1247. Marburg dissertation. x, 103 pp. Borna-Leipzig, 1916. — *Neumann, Richard*, Die Colonna und ihre Politik von der Zeit Nikolaus' IV bis zum Abzug Ludwigs des Bayern aus Rom, 1288-1328 (Sammlung wissensch. Arbeiten 29). vii, 193 pp. Langensalza, Wendt u. Klauwell, 1914. — *Perels, Ernst*, Papst Nikolaus I und Anastasius Bibliothecarius. xii, 327 pp. Berlin, Weidmann, 1920. — *Schneider, Wilhelm*, Papst Gregor VII und das Kirchengut. Greifswald dissertation. 206 pp. Greifswald, Abel, 1919. — *Schoepp, Natalie*, Papst Hadrian V (Kardinal Ottobuono Fieschi). (Heidelberger Abhandl. zur mittleren u. neueren Gesch. hrsg. von Karl Hampe u. Hermann Oncken 49). viii, 360 pp. Heidelberg, Winter, 1916. — *Seckendorff, Eleonore, Freiin von*, Die kirchenpolitische Tätigkeit der heiligen Katharina von Siena unter Papst Gregor XI. Ein Versuch zur Datierung ihrer Briefe. (Abhandl. zur mittleren und neueren Geschichte, hrsg. von Georg von Below, Heinrich Finke und Friedrich Meinecke 64). xvi, 162 pp. Berlin und Leipzig, W. Rothschild, 1917. — *Tangl, Michael*, Die Deliberatio Innocenz' III (SAB, 1919, 1012-1028).

For the writings on the individual popes we follow the chronological order, and this brings the most important work at the beginning. NICHOLAS I (858-867). This great pope's wide-reaching activity in ecclesiastical politics has been a favorite

subject for research (Richterich, 1903; Greinacher, 1909), and the new edition of his letters in MGH (1912) provides occasion for a new consideration. *Perels*, the editor of the letters, first discussed the manuscript tradition in NADG (37, 1912, 535-586; 39, 1914, 43-153), and he has now given a picture of the political activity of the pope which is distinguished for discretion, clarity, and a striving for fairness, and is an important contribution to the history of the ninth century. He maintains stoutly the independence of Nicholas. No one of those about the pope could have given to his policy and correspondence such marked individuality; his own mind produced and guided them. Subordinates of course assisted, and Anastasius Bibliothecarius had a considerable share in the composition of the letters. This assistance was not confined to the discussions with the Greeks, but is evident also in the letters on the Frankish question. In some letters both the pope and his assistants took part in the dictation. — GREGORY VII. In a study marked by thorough mastery of the sources, *Schneider*, a pupil of Bernheim (see p. 331, footnote 3), shows the falsity of the idea that Gregory intended to take from the empire all the property of the higher churches without distinction. He also makes some instructive remarks on lay investiture, and puts special emphasis on the measures for the internal regulation of the church under this great pope, commonly thought of as chiefly a politician, — his care for the proper administration and expenditure of the incomes of the endowed churches, his encouragement of the *vita communis* among the lower clergy, and his efforts to elevate the spiritual and material forces of the church.

INNOCENT III (1198-1216). Several works deal with Innocent III. In pursuance of the arguments advanced by Peitz for the genuineness of the Register of Gregory VII (see above, Caspar) *von Heckel* shows that the registers of Innocent are also to be regarded as the original manuscript of the pope's chancery. The traces of the work of the secretaries are still clearly recognizable. — *Erich Meyer* is well aware of the difficulty of expounding the political theories of Pope Innocent III without reference to their practical application, but he is right

in pointing out that the political activity of the pope essentially corresponds to the theories, and that on the other hand these theories are so important for the bases of the Catholic hierarchy down to the present day that a separate study of them is justified. — Innocent's famous *Deliberatio super facto imperii de tribus electis* (viz. Philip the Suabian, Otto the Guelph, and Frederick II), has always been considered a memorial addressed to the pope, but *Tangl* proves that it was an address composed by the pope and read by him before the cardinals at a secret consistory on Christmas day of the year 1200. The *deliberatio* contains the declaration that the conferring of the imperial orb upon Henry VI by Celestine III (1191) signified the former's acceptance of the imperial dignity as a fief from the pope. *Tangl*, in opposition to *Haller* (see III, b. p. 349) shows that this interpretation was that of Innocent himself alone, and that no recognition of papal claims by Henry is to be inferred from it.

INNOCENT IV (1241–1254). Two dissertations are devoted to Innocent IV, who continued so successfully the policy of Innocent III. *Dehio*, a pupil of Bresslau, dealing with the relations of the curia to England under Henry III, shows how the feeble attitude of the king toward the claims of the pope both led to the elaboration of papal authority in England and roused opposition from people and clergy, Robert Grosseteste, Bishop of Lincoln and originally a partisan of the pope, appearing as spokesman for the opposition. — In the work of *Werner Meyer*, a pupil of Wenk, the main theme is the opposition to the purely secular development of the papacy. It is interesting to see how Louis IX, whose great piety is spoken of by all contemporary writers and who was canonized not many years after his death, stood up vigorously against the encroachments of the curia on the property, rights, and liberties of the French church. An address delivered before the curia by an un-named envoy of the king, the genuineness of which has always been questioned by scholars favorable to the popes, is here discussed at length.

HADRIAN V (1276). Hadrian was pope only a few weeks, but as Cardinal Ottobuoni Fieschi he played an important part in the complicated ecclesiastical politics of the third quarter of the thirteenth century. *Fräulein Schoepp* carefully traces his

career, especially the years of his embassy to England (1265-1268), on which the sources are comparatively full.

COLONNA. Among the noble families of Rome who so often decisively influenced the politics of the curia, that of Colonna was the most prominent at the close of the thirteenth century. Under Frederick II they had become the representatives of the Ghibelline cause in the curia, and they kept this position during the succeeding period. How they gradually swung over to the side of the Guelphs and finally contributed materially to the failure of Ludwig the Bavarian's expedition to Rome and so to the extinction of the Ghibelline party in Italy, is shown in *Neumann's* book. He gives a fascinating picture of the varying fortunes of these stubborn and stiff-necked Roman optimates, who played the dominant rôle in Rome under Nicholas IV (1288-1292), were forced into exile under Boniface VIII (1294-1303), and again attained to great power and influence under Clement V (1305-1314) and his successors.

GREGORY XI (1370-1378). Baroness *von Seckendorff*, a pupil of Heinrich Finke, seeks to throw light on the dates of the letters of St. Catherine of Siena to Gregory, and succeeds, in spite of the scanty material, through excellence of method. Besides other work in the archives, she has examined the register of this pope, which had been little used for this purpose, and draws from it what is probably the earliest letter of the pope to Sir John Hawkwood, written in January 1373 (not 1372). It may be mentioned that the new edition of the letters by Pinco Misciabelli in six volumes, Siena, 1913-1916, is only a reissue of Tommaseo's edition of 1860.

URBAN VI (1378-1389). *Graf's* work, unfortunately not yet completely published, gives in the early chapters an excellent idea of the history of the curia under Urban VI, with special attention to the *cancellaria* and *camera apostolica*. The very complete list of all the members of the curia, with the documentary evidence, occupying seventy pages, will be of great value to scholars.

V. BISHOPS AND BISHOPRICS

a. Sources

ADAM OF BREMEN. *Magistri Adam Bremensis Gesta Hammaburgensis ecclesiae pontificum*. Editio tertia. Ed. *Bernhard Schmeidler*. (SRG). lxxviii, 353 pp. Hanover and Leipzig, Hahn, 1917. — *Schmeidler, Bernhard*, Hamburg-Bremen und Nordost Europa vom 9. bis 11. Jahrhundert. xiv, 363 pp. Leipzig, Dieterich, 1918. — *Peitz, Wilhelm, M., S. J.*, Untersuchungen zu Urkundenfälschungen des Mittelalters. 1. Teil: Die Hamburger Fälschungen (Ergänzungshefte zu StZ 2, 3). xxviii, 319 pp. Freiburg i. B., Herder, 1919. — MEINWERK OF PADERBORN. *Vita Meinweri episcopi Patherbrunnensis*. Ed. *Franz Tenkhoff*. (SRG). xxviii, 181 pp. Hanover and Leipzig, Hahn, 1920. — *G'sell, Amandus, O. S. B.*, Die Vita des Erzbischofs Arnold von Mainz, auf ihre Echtheit geprüft (NADG 43, 1920–21, 27–85, 317–379). — *Acta Pontificum Danica*, udgivne af *A. Krarup og J. Lindbek*. VI. Copenhagen, 1915.

The new third edition of Adam of Bremen's history of Hamburg is almost a new book. *Schmeidler* has classified the manuscripts, thus throwing light on the origin and growth of this important document, and in the first part of his book on Hamburg-Bremen he explains his conclusions by an intricate but well-supported chain of reasoning. Adam's work as it exists today is the product of several hands. The earliest version (*Schmeidler's A1*), which is extant in Ms. 521 of the Hofbibliothek at Vienna, is the fair copy from which was to be made the copy intended for the personal use of the Archbishop. In this fair copy, however, Adam himself made additions, and others continued the practice after his death. The editor devotes a special chapter to Adam as an author, shows his extraordinary learning in the most varied directions, and characterizes especially his admirable portrayal of Adalbert. The second part of his study is a critical investigation of the documents for the founding and confirmation of the archbishopric. These documents (Gregory VII, 832; Louis the Pious, 834; Agapetus II, 940; Nicholas I, 864; John XV, 989, etc.) he regards as all either unauthentic or forged. In the two most important ones, the bulls of Gregory and Nicholas, he thinks he can distinguish the hand of Adalbert of Bremen. — *Peitz* on the contrary defends the genuineness of all the documents. The present reviewer (*supra*, 1921, p. 363) pointed out the

audacity with which this writer seeks to attack and overthrow the accepted results of archivistic study. The critics applaud the learning, subtlety, and adroitness of his latest essay, but the fact that his criticism of the tradition of the *Vita Anskarii* has to all appearances broken down (see II, a, p. 337), advises caution. Here in the same way he merely tries to reverse the accepted relations of the sources. A detailed refutation of his revolutionary contention is to be expected. With respect to method, the whole controversy is highly interesting. The last part of Schmeidler's book contains studies in northern and Wendish history, but these do not relate to church history. — Bishop Meinwerk (1009–1036) is accounted the second founder of the bishopric of Paderborn because of his zealous efforts for the welfare of the church. His Life is a noteworthy record of the cultural and economic conditions of the time and well deserves the careful work of *Tenkhoff's* new edition. Compare also the same editor's discussions in the "Verzeichnis" of Lectures at the episcopal Academy of Paderborn for the winter semester of 1919–1920. — Archbishop Arnold of Mainz, who was killed in a popular revolt in 1160, had played a great part as chancellor of Conrad II and Frederick Barbarossa. We have for him an anonymous Life (edited by Jaffé, *Bibliotheca Rerum Germanicarum*, 3, 1860, 604–675) which has been preserved only in late manuscripts and on that account has had its authenticity doubted. *G'sell* proves conclusively that it is a contemporary production, composed probably by some priest of Mainz, and therefore a valuable example of the literary efforts of Mainz in the middle of the twelfth century.

Lindbek's edition of the *Acta Pontificum Danica* gives, either at length or condensed, all papal documents relating to Denmark, mostly from the Vatican archives. Volume VI covers the period from 1513 to 1536 (the Danish Reformation) and gives supplements to the earlier volumes. Most of the documents of course deal with preferments and financial affairs. [V. A.]

b. *Monographs*

Bauermeister, Karl, Berthold von Henneberg, Kurfürst und Erzbischof von Mainz, 1484–1504 (HJG 39, 1918–19, 731–740). — *Beinlich, Johannes*, Die Persönlichkeit Erzbischof Adalberts von Bremen in der Darstellung seines Biographen Adam, auf Grund der Zeitanschauungen. Greifswald dissertation (see p. 331, foot-note 3). 156 pp. Breslau, Fleischmann, 1918. — *Kehr, Paul*, Das Erzbistum Magdeburg und die erste Organisation der Kirche in Polen (AAB 1920, 1). 68 pp. Berlin, Verein. wissenschaftl. Verleger. — *Kolrad, Oluf*, Olavskyrkja i Trondhjem (Norske Folkeskriften 63). 132 pp. Christiania, Norigs ungdomslag og Studentmållaget, 1914. — *Meyer, August*, Der politische Einfluss Deutschlands und Frankreichs auf die Metzzer Bischofswahlen im Mittelalter. x, 132 pp. Metz, Müller, 1916. — *Schmauch, Hans*, Die Besetzung der Bistümer im Deutschordensstaate bis zum Jahre 1410. Königsberg dissertation. (Zeitschr. für Geschichte und Altertumskunde Ermlands 20, 21, 1919, 1920). — *Schmidt, Gustav*, Erzbischof Siegfried I. von Mainz. Königsberg dissertation. xi, 101 pp. Berlin, Ebering, 1917. — *Schmitt, Karl Heinrich*, Erzbischof Adalbert I von Mainz als Territorialfürst. Giessen dissertation. (Arbeiten zur deutschen Rechts- und Verfassungsgeschichte, hrsg. von Johannes Haller, Philipp Heck und Artur B. Schmidt 2). viii, 84 pp. Berlin, Weidmann, 1920. — *Weibull, Lauritz*, De skånska kyrkans älsta historia (Historisk Tidskrift för Skåneland 5, 1913, 1916).

Berthold of Henneberg, Elector of Mainz, rendered great service to the empire at the end of the fifteenth century. With the aid of newly available sources from the archives of Würzburg, *Bauermeister* shows that both as a reigning prince and as a churchman he had a noteworthy career. — *Kehr* demonstrates by skillful use of the original documents that the bishopric of Posen never belonged to the province of Magdeburg. Thietmar of Merseberg, who asserted that it did, was following a papal document forged in the interest of Magdeburg at the beginning of the eleventh century.

Meyer's collection of material for the study of church law is welcome. In spite of the title, the subject is not so much the political rivalry between Germany and France, which in the borderland of Lorraine was a conspicuous fact all through the Middle Ages, but rather the legal aspects of the appointments to the see of Metz. The attitude of the bishops toward the great conflict between empire and papacy is also discussed. — In the appointment of bishops in the territory of the Teutonic knights, the rivalry between the knights, the archbishop of Riga, and the see of Rome was an important element. *Schmauch*

writes interestingly on the appointments in chronological order, discussing as well matters of church politics and ecclesiastical law. — In the contest of Henry IV with Gregory VII, Archbishop Siegfried of Mainz is one of the most prominent figures among the German bishops. *Schmidt* shows that his defection from the king was affected by his hope of establishing his position as spiritual primate of the realm. This hope, however, rested on a mistaken understanding of political conditions. — The metropolitans of Mainz preferred to be at the king's court rather than to attend to justice in their own territory, but Willigis in the time of Otto II and Otto III, and still more Adalbert I (1111–1137), were exceptions. What the latter accomplished for the benefit of the archbishopric of Mainz is told in detail by *Schmitt*, a pupil of Haller. — *Weibull's* fresh and critical study is the first modern account of the rise and early history of the church in Skane, which is the southernmost part of Sweden, comprising the two modern provinces of Malmöhus and Christianstad. The author describes the founding of this church in the eleventh century, the attempt of the Danish king to establish a Danish archbishopric, the efforts at a patriarchate on the part of Adalbert of Bremen, the erection of the archbishopric in Lund, the contest for supremacy between Hamburg and Lund, and finally the reorganization of the archbishoprics in Norway and Sweden. He also gives an exact account of the inner development of the church in Skane.

VI. COUNCILS

Günther, Otto, Zur Vorgeschichte des Konzils von Pisa (NADG 41, 1920, 633–676). — *Katterbach, Josef* (P. Bruno O. F. M.), Der zweite literarische Kampf auf dem Konstanzer Konzil im Januar und Februar 1415. Freiburg i. B. dissertation. vi, 94 pp. Fulda, Aktien-druckerei, 1919. — *Lenné, Albert*, Der erste literarische Kampf auf dem Konstanzer Konzil im November und Dezember 1414. Freiburg i. B. dissertation. (RQ 28, 1914, 3–40, 61–86). — *Mohler, Ludwig*, Eine verloren geglaubte Schrift des Georgios Amirutzes über das Florentiner Konzil (OChr 8, 1920, 20–35). — *Riegel, Josef*, Die Teilnehmerlisten des Konstanzer Konzils. Freiburg i. B. dissertation (partial publication). 73 pp. Freiburg, Charitas-Druckerei, 1916. — *Tangl, Georgina*, Die Teilnehmer an den allgemeinen Konzilien des Mittelalters. Berlin dissertation (partial publication). 74 pp. Weimar, Böhlau, 1916.

From a manuscript of the Stadtbibliothek of Danzig, comprising a large collection of valuable contemporary pieces relating to the Council of Pisa and its preliminaries, *Günther* publishes the *inedita*. — *Katterbach* and *Lenné* have had access to *Heinrich Finke's* extensive unpublished material, which assures the documentary value of their work. — *Riegel* also, in his scrutiny of the lists of participants in the Council of Constance, has been influenced by *Finke*. — The tract of *Georgios Amirutzes* on the Council of Florence, hitherto known only by title, is published by *Mohler* from Cod. Bibl. Vallicell. XCIII, 25. It proves to be an invective against the union of the Greek and Latin churches. — It is to be hoped that *Fräulein Tangl's* dissertation will be published in full. The chief value of this careful piece of work lies in the chapter on the development of the Roman synod into the general council of the later Middle Ages.

VII. ECCLESIASTICAL LAW AND LITURGY

Bauer, Richard, Der Strafprozess der Inquisition in Südfrankreich. Heidelberg dissertation. viii, 134 pp. Marburg, Hamel, 1917. — *Bliemietzrieder, Franz Paul*, Zu den Schriften Ivo von Chartres (SAW 182, 6, 1917). 89 pp. — *Lindner, Dominikus*, Die Lehre vom Privileg nach Gratian und den Glossatoren des Corpus juris canonici. 128 pp. Regensburg, Coppenrath, 1917. — *Ludwig, Vinzenz Otkar*, Der Kanonisationsprozess des Markgrafen Leopolds III des Heiligen (Jahrbuch des Stiftes Klosterneuburg 9). ccxvii, 220 pp. Vienna, Braumüller, 1919. — *Pöschl, A.*, Der *vocatus episcopus* der Karolingerzeit (Archiv f. katholisches Kirchenrecht 97, 1917, 3-43, 185-219). — *Prochnow, Fritz*, Das Spolienrecht und die Testierfähigkeit der Geistlichen im Abendland bis zum 13. Jahrhundert (HSt 136, 1919). 130 pp. — *Seckel, Emil*, Benedictus Levita decurtatus et excerptus. Studie zu den Handschriften der falschen Kapitularien (Festschrift für Heinrich Brunner, 377-464). Munich, Duncker u. Humblot, 1914; Studien zu Benedictus Levita VIII (NADG 40, 1915, 15-130; 41, 1917, 157-263). — *Sohm, Rudolf*, Das altkatholische Kirchenrecht und das Dekret Gratians (Festschrift für Adolf Wach). viii, 674 pp. Munich, Duncker u. Humblot, 1918. — *Wahrmund, Ludwig*, Der *ordo iudiciarius* des Aegidius de Fuscariis (Quellen zur Geschichte des römisch-kanonischen Prozesses im Mittelalter, 3, 1). xlviii, 271 pp. Innsbruck, Wagner, 1916. — *Bernhardi Cardinalis et Lateranensis Ecclesiae Prioris Ordo Officiorum Ecclesiae Lateranensis*, hrsg. von *Ludwig Fischer* (Historische Quellen und Forschungen, hrsg. von Josef Schlecht, 2. und 3. Heft). lxxviii, 164 pp. Munich and Freising, Datterer, 1916.

The first volume of *Sohm's Kirchenrecht* has had a lasting influence on research in the field of early ecclesiastical law. Death prevented the author from completing the work, but he left a part of the later portion ready for the press. His broad general thesis is well known, namely that ecclesiastical Law stands in contradiction to the essential nature of the church, which is Love. This theme continues to dominate the second volume. He holds that until about the end of the twelfth century the *hierarchia ordinis*, that is, divine ordinance (*göttliche Ordnung*), power of consecration, and sacrament were determinative for Catholic ecclesiastical law, and that only after that date did ecclesiastical law of human origin, *hierarchia jurisdictionis*, take its place beside the divine. In this sense Gratian belongs to the earlier epoch. He was not a reformer but a perfecter; he brought the old Catholic church law to its highest development. Sohms has worked out these thoughts with admirable power and charm, and his book is not merely instructive but delightful. Whether he has proved his thesis is very doubtful. Ulrich Stutz, the most eminent scholar in mediaeval church law, has offered strong objection to it (*Zeitschr. f. Rechtsgeschichte* 39, kanonistische Abteilung 8, 1918, 238-246). He finds no cleavage between Gratian and his continuators, the so-called decretists and decretalists, but rather a clear and unbroken connection; moreover, it cannot be shown that church law down to 1200 rested solely on the *hierarchia ordinis* and only after that time, and with equal exclusiveness, on the *hierarchia jurisdictionis*. Stutz seems to be in the right here, but Sohms's volume amply repays study. — A few words must suffice to characterize the other works on church law. *Bauer's* valuable discussion of the trials of the Inquisition divides the subject, from the legal point of view, into four parts: (1) the idea of heresy and the crimes covered thereby; (2) the court; (3) procedure; (4) penalties and their execution.¹¹ — The writings of Ivo of Chartres are collected in Migne, Series latina 161 and 162, but in contemporary manu-

¹¹ On the side of church policy this is well supplemented by *Hermann Köhler*, *Die Ketzerpolitik der deutschen Kaiser und Könige in den Jahren 1152-1254* (Jenaer historische Arbeiten 6), Bonn, Marcus u. Weber, 1913.

scripts there are traces of unknown writings by this important authority on early mediaeval church law. *Bliemietzrieder* gives some fragments of these. — For his study of the meaning and kinds of *privilegium* in mediaeval law *Lindner* has employed manuscript material on a large scale, using the works of the decretists practically entire and at least the more important of the decretalists. — *Prochnow's* work is of interest to students of church history and the history of civilization, as well as of legal history. The *jus spoli*, or in the more correct form, in use down to the fifteenth century, the *jus spoliorum*, is the right of the head of an ecclesiastical institution to the personal property of the deceased clergy. In its nature an encroachment on the sphere of private law, it curtailed in particular the right of testamentary disposal by the clergy. Although the discontent of the laity with the vast increase of the wealth of the church often led to violent outbreaks, Prochnow shows that in the struggle over the *jus spoli* hostilities began not from the secular side, but from that of the clerical power. What was demanded was not the abolition of an oppressive special position, which deprived the clergy (and not them alone) of their right of free action, but, as always, the creation of a new privilege calculated to increase their wealth and thereby their power. The phases of the conflict in France, England, and Germany are explained. — *Seckel's* studies on the manuscripts of the capitularies of Benedictus Levita run through a number of volumes of NADG, and are not yet finished. For his conclusions on the first book, see NADG 31, 1906, pp. 62, 134; on the second, *ibid.* 35, 1910, pp. 107, 532. — In *Wahrmund's* *Ordines judiciarii* are printed important texts for the history of procedure in canon law, a part of them being hitherto unknown, and the whole collection being the first in which an edition resting on manuscripts has been combined with critical introductions dealing with the authors. The *Ordo* of Aegidius de Fuscarariis is here of special importance.

One of the most interesting of the many problems which arise in liturgical history is that of the relation between the old Roman liturgy and its later development in the curial *Officium*; and light is thrown on this question by but few documents.

From a passage of Abaelard it must be inferred that in his time the church of the Lateran was the only one which continued to use the old Roman liturgy. By a singular good fortune we still possess this *Ordo lateranensis*, which was composed before 1145, that is, in Abaelard's time. *Fischer's* publication of it fills a considerable gap. He furnishes much topographical detail and much information about the usages observed at the basilica by the various religious corporations. The question of the author of the *Ordo*, who played an important part in the diplomatic service of the curia, is thoroughly discussed. The text of the document is reproduced with the utmost care, and the whole work deserves all attention.

VIII. SAINTS, MONKS, AND MONASTERIES

a. General

Bierbaum, Max, Bettelorden und Weltgeistlichkeit an der Universität Paris. Texte und Untersuchungen zum literarischen Armuts- und Exemptionsstreit des 13. Jahrhunderts (FrSt, Beiheft 2, 1920). xvi, 406 pp. — *Denkinger, T.*, Die Bettelorden in der französischen didaktischen Literatur des 13. Jahrhunderts und im Roman de la Rose (FrSt 2, 1915, 63–109, 286–313); Die Bettelorden im sogenannten Testament und Codicille des Jehan de Meun (ib. 3, 1916, 339–353); Die Bettelorden in Dit und Fabel (ib. 6, 1919, 273–294). — *Feusi, Iniga*, Das Institut der gottgeweihten Jungfrauen und sein Fortleben im Mittelalter. iv, xvi, 236 pp. Freiburg i. S., Gschwend, 1917. — *Leistle, David*, Ueber Klosterbibliotheken des Mittelalters (StMGB 5, 1915, 197–228, 357–377). — *Löffler, Klemens*, Deutsche Klosterbibliotheken (Schriften der Görresgesellschaft zur Pflege der Wissenschaften 1). 72 pp. Cologne, Bachem, 1918. — *Lorentzen, Valdemar*, De danske Klosters Bygningshistorie I–III. Copenhagen, 1912, 1920. — *Oliger, Livarius*, Ein unbekannter Traktat gegen die Mendikanten von Nikolaus Palmerius, O. S. A., Bischof von Orte (FrSt3, 1916, 77–92). — *Pijper, F.*, De Kloosters. 379 pp. The Hague, 1916. — *Scheler, Selmar*, Sitten und Bildung der französischen Geistlichkeit nach den Briefen Stephans von Tournai. Jena dissertation. (HSt 130, 1915). xv, 110 pp. — *Scheuten, Paul*, Das Mönchtum in der altfranzösischen Profandichtung (Beiträge zur Geschichte des alten Mönchtums und des Benediktinerordens, hrsg. von Ildefons Herwegen, 7). xx, 124 pp. Münster, Aschendorff, 1919. — *Schumacher, Adelgott*, Album Desertinense oder Verzeichnis der Aehte und Religiösen des Benediktiner-Stiftes Disentis. Eine Festgabe auf die Jubelfeier seines dreizehnhundertjährigen Bestehens 614–1914. xii, 139 pp. Disentis, Selbstverlag des Stiftes, 1914. — Urkundenbuch der Abtei St. Gallen. Teil 6 (1442–1463). Lieferung 1 (1442–1448); Lieferung 2 (1448–1453). Hrsg. vom Historischen Verein des Kantons St. Gallen; unter Mitwirkung von *Joseph Müller* bearbeitet von *Traugott Schiess*. iv, ii, 200; iv, ii,

201-400 pp. St. Gall, Fahr, 1917, 1918. — *Zibermayr, Ignaz*, Die Legation des Kardinals Nikolaus Cusanus und die Ordensreform in der Kirchenprovinz Salzburg (RStT 29, 1914). xx, 128 pp.

Leistle shows by numerous examples how the monastic libraries made their collections, describes their equipment, and tells of the learned intercourse between libraries. — After an introduction on books and the arrangements of libraries in the Middle Ages, *Löffler* discusses German monastic libraries and their influence on literary life in the period of humanism, and treats in detail the fate of these monasteries after their dissolution and ruin, closing his interesting and suggestive book with a description of the most important libraries of the Middle Ages. — *Lorentzen's* book contains the history of Danish monasteries of the Order of the Holy Spirit and of the Franciscan and Dominican orders, from the architectural point of view. A complementary treatment of the history and life of these orders in Denmark was planned by *Lindbok*, and he published the volume on the Order of the Holy Spirit (*J. Lindbok og G. Stemann: De danske Helligaandsklostre*, 1906) and more recently that on the Franciscans (Copenhagen, 1914; see below under Francis of Assisi), but this scholar's death has brought this valuable work to an end. [*V. A.*] — *Pijper's* book, dealing primarily with monasticism, should have been mentioned in the first article (1921). It covers the history of monasticism from the origins to the Jesuits. The second half discusses the significance of monasticism for the history of civilization, with such topics as life and occupation within the monastery; merits and defects; social advantage and disadvantage; monasteries as educational institutions; the international character of the monastic orders, and the like. The original authorities are used. [*Van B.*] — The letters of Bishop Stephen of Tournay are valuable for their bearing on the condition of church and society at the end of the twelfth century. Though himself trained under a monastic rule, Stephen was an ardent friend of the reform of the secular clergy, taking an active interest in all questions that concerned the priesthood. *Scheler's* selections from his correspondence give valuable information about the morals and education of the French clergy

of the time. — *Scheuten's* literary study is useful also for ecclesiastical Kulturgeschichte. From the secular poetry of the Middle Ages the author has drawn a mass of historical details and combined them into a general picture of monasticism. The epic poetry in particular gives us vivid little pictures of monastic life such as purely historical sources cannot afford. They remind one of the Canterbury Tales. Naturally dwelling on the externals of life in the cloister rather than on the inner religious life (for the poets are usually critical of monasticism), they show a tone often unfriendly or even frivolous. We see here the beginnings which led to the later satirical poetry directed against the church. — *Denkinger* treats a kindred theme, studying the mendicant orders as viewed by French contemporary writers, the general grounds for the views of these latter, and the place of the separate poems with relation to mendicant literature as a whole. — The battle over the ideal of poverty of the mendicant orders and their pastoral rights, which was fought out at the University of Paris in the thirteenth century, and in which such distinguished scholars as Thomas Aquinas, Bonaventura, Peckham, and William of St. Amour took part, has never been described as a whole, nor are the extant sources fully known. *Bierbaum* has taken a long step toward clearing up this matter (which has further importance for general church history), by publishing for the first time and discussing a long tractate by the Minorite brother Bertrand of Bayonne and three shorter writings by opponents of the Minorites, Gerhard of Abbeville and Nicholas of Lisieux. — An invective against the Minorites by Bishop Nicolaus Palmerius of Orte in the Papal State (†1467), published by *Oliger* from Cod. Vat. lat. 5815 (which contains other unpublished writings of Palmerius), is of a later period. — *Zi-bermayr* discusses the work for monastic reform of Nicholas of Cusa after his appointment as papal legate, with special reference to the visitation protocols. Some unpublished documents are included. — Sister *Feusi* proves from an abundance of original authorities that the usual opinion that consecrated virgins ceased to exist as a separate class in the church after the sixth century, is mistaken. The institution survived the

period of the migrations, declined toward the end of the seventh century, and in consequence of ecclesiastical regulations came to an end at the beginning of the ninth century.

b. Saints and Monastic Orders

AUGUSTINIANS. *Vonschott, Hedwig*, Geistiges Leben im Augustinerorden am Ende des Mittelalters und zu Beginn der Neuzeit (HSt 129, 1915). 130 pp.

BEGUINES. *Meier, Gabriel*, Die Beginen der Schweiz (ZSchwKG 9, 1915, 23-34, 119-133).

BERNARD OF CLAIRVAUX. *Honnef, Johannes*, Das Priesterideal des heiligen Bernhard von Clairvaux. xi, 198 pp. Düsseldorf, Schwann, [1919]. — *Kozłowski, Jerzy von*, Kirche und Staat und Kirchenstaat nach dem heiligen Bernhard von Clairvaux. (See III, b). — *Radcke, Fritz*, Die eschatologischen Anschauungen Bernhards von Clairvaux. Greifswald dissertation. (Sammlung wissenschaftl. Arbeiten 45). iii, 132 pp. Langensalza, Wendt u. Klauwell, 1915.

BIRGITTA AND THE VADSTENA CONVENT. *Collijn, I.* ed., Acta et processus canonizationis S. Birgittae. Cod. Holm. A. 14. (Codices medii aevi e Bibliotheca Regia Holmiensi selecti phototypice expressi). xxii, (1) 4; xii, (1) pp. with 255 facsimiles; introduction in Swedish and French. Stockholm, 1920. — *Iconographia Birgittina typographica*. Birgitta och Katherina i medeltida bildtryck. Upsala, 1915-18. — *Fogelklon, Emilia*, Birgitta. 252, (1) 5 pp. Stockholm, 1919. — *Geete, R.* ed., Fyra handlingar rörande Vadstena klostres privilegier (1440 och 1458), abbedissans åsliga redovisning och klosterfolkets tarf af kost och föda (Bilaga till Svenska Fornskrifts Sällskapets årsmote, 1914, 281-295). Stockholm, 1914. — *Vadstena klostres Minnesbok*. Diarium Vagatenense. x, 377 pp. Stockholm, 1918. — *Månsson, P.*, Vadstenabrodern Peder Månssons bref pu svenska från Rom tin Vadstena kloster, 1508-1519 (Bilaga tin Sv. Fornskrift Sällskapets årsmote, 1915, 297-348). Stockholm, 1915. — *Söderblom, Nathanael*, Birgitta och reformationen (Föredrag, Vadstena kyrka, den 24 Okt. 1916). 32 pp. Upsala, 1917.

CAESARIUS OF HEISTERBACH. *Harder, Heinrich*, Die sittlichen Begriffe im *Dialogus miraculorum major* des Caesarius von Heisterbach. Leipzig dissertation. 74 pp. Halle, John, 1916.

CATHERINE OF SIENA. *Maresch, Maria*, Katharina von Siena (Führer des Volkes 9). 87 pp. München-Gladbach, Volksverein, 1918. — *Riesch, Helene*, Die heilige Katharina von Siena. 2. u. 3. Aufl. viii, 142 pp. Freiburg i. B., Herder, 1915. — *Seckendorff, Eleonore Frein von*, Die kirchenpolitische Tätigkeit der heiligen Katharina von Siena, (see IV, b).

DOMINIC AND THE DOMINICANS. *Meyer, J.*, Liber de viris illustribus Ordinis Praedicatorum. Hrsg. von *P. von Loë*. viii, 92 pp. Leipzig, Harrassowitz, 1918. — *Rings, Mannes M., O. P.*, Der heilige Dominicus. Sein Leben und seine Ideale. 420 pp. Dülmen i. W., Laumann, 1920. — *Wilms,*

Hieronymus, O.P., Geschichte der deutschen Dominikanerinnen, 1206–1916. 416 pp. Dülmen, Laumann, 1920.

ELIZABETH OF THURINGIA. *Maresch, Maria*, Elisabeth, Landgräfin von Thüringen. Ein altes deutsches Heiligenleben im Lichte der neueren geschichtlichen Forschung (Führer des Volkes 23). 158 pp. München-Gladbach, Volksverein, 1918.

FRANCIS OF ASSISI AND THE MINORITES. Bonaventura, der heilige, Franziskus von Assisi. In's Deutsche übertragen von *Gisbert Menge*. 99 pp. Paderborn, Bonifacius-Druckerei, 1918. — *vanden Borne, Fidentius, O. F. M.*, Die Franziskus-Forschung in ihrer Entwicklung dargestellt (VKSM 4, 6). xii, 106 pp. Munich, Lentner, 1917; Der dritte Orden des heiligen Franziskus von Assisi (Theol. prakt. Quartalschrift 72, 1919, 32–47). — *Doelle, Ferdinand, O. F. M.*, Reformtätigkeit des Provinzials Ludwig Henning in der sächsischen Franziskanerprovinz, 1507–1515 (FrSt, Beiheft 3, 1915). xv, 105 pp.; Die Observanzbewegung in der sächsischen Franziskanerprovinz bis zum Generalkapitel von Parma 1529 (RStT 30–31, 1918). xx, 280 pp. — *Falke, Didaskus*, Kloster und Gymnasium Antonianum der Franziskaner zu Geseke (FrSt, Beiheft 1, 1915). xiv, 191 pp. — *Franziskanische Studien* (Quartalschrift) 1.–7. Jahrgang. Münster i. W., Aschendorff, 1914–1920. — *Groeteken, Friedrich Albert*, Die Franziskaner an Fürstenhöfen bis zur Mitte des 14. Jahrhunderts. Münster diss. 56 pp. Münster, Buschmann, 1915. — *Imle, Fanny*, Die heilige Coletta, eine kämpferische Seele aus der Familie des heiligen Franziscus. 82 pp. Munich, J. Müller, 1916. — *Kybal, Vlastimil*, Die Ordensregeln des heiligen Franziskus von Assisi und die ursprüngliche Verfassung des Minoritenordens (BKGMR 20, 1915). iv, 176 pp.; Canticum Fratris Solis (FrSt 2, 1915, 241–265); Das Testament des heiligen Franz von Assisi (MIOeG, 36, 1915, 312–340). — *Lemmens, Leonhard*, Die Franziskaner im heiligen Lande. 1. Teil: Die Franziskaner auf dem Sion, 1336–1551 (FrSt, Beiheft 4, 1916). xvi, 224 pp.; Die Heidenmissionen des Spätmittelalters. Festschrift zum 700-jährigen Jubiläum der Franziskanermissionen (FrSt, Beiheft 5, 1919). xi, 112 pp. — *Lindbek, J.* De danske Franciskanerklostre. Copenhagen, 1914. — *Monumenta Germaniae Franciscana*. Hrsg. von Mitgliedern des Franziskanerordens. Düsseldorf, Schwann. — *Reisch, Chrysogonus*, Urkundenbuch der Kustodien Goldberg und Breslau. 1. Teil, 1240–1517. (Monumenta Germaniae Francisc. 2. Abth. Urkundenbücher. 1. Bd. 1. Teil). xxiv, 479 pp. 1917. — *Sabatier, Paul*, Leben des heiligen Franz von Assisi. Autorisierte Uebersetzung aus dem Französischen bewirkt durch *Margarete Lisco*. 320 pp. Zürich, Rascher, 1919. — *Saitschik, Robert*, Franziscus von Assisi. 79 pp. Munich, Beck, 1917. — *Schäfer, Albrecht*, Die Orden des heiligen Franz in Württemberg bis zum Ausgang Ludwigs des Bayern. Tübingen dissertation. viii, 109 pp. Stuttgart, Paulinenpflege, 1915. — *Schmitz, Cajetan*, Der Zustand der süddeutschen Franziskaner-Conventualen am Ausgang des Mittelalters. xiii, 107 pp. Düsseldorf, Schwann, 1915. — *Stöckerl, Dagobert*, David von Augsburg (see below, X). — *Thomas de Celano*, Das Leben des heiligen Franziskus von Assisi. Aus dem lateinischen Grundtext übersetzt und mit Anmerkungen versehen von *P. Schmidt* und mit einer Einleitung von *Eberhard Vischer*. xv, 272

pp. Basel, Reinhardt, 1919. — *Tilemann, Heinrich*, Studien zur Individualität des Franziskus von Assisi (BKGM 21, V, 1914). iv, 228 pp.

FRATRES COMMUNIS VITAE. *Barnikol, Ernst*, Studien zur Geschichte der Brüder vom gemeinsamen Leben (Ergänzungshefte zur Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche 17). xii, 215 pp. Tübingen, Mohr, 1917.

HILDEGARDE OF BINGEN. *Riesch, Helene*, Die heilige Hildegard von Bingen. 2. u. 3. Aufl. viii, 160 pp. Freiburg i. B., Herder, 1920. — *Roth, F. W. E.*, Studien zur Lebensbeschreibung der heiligen Hildegard (StMGB 39, 1918, 68–118).

JACOBUS DE VORAGINE. *Jacobus de Voragine*, Legenda aurea. Deutsch von *Richard Benz*. 2 vols. xxxii, 760, 720 pp. Jena, Diederichs, 1917, 1921.

JOAN OF ARC. *Prutz, Hans*, Neue Studien zur Geschichte der Jungfrau von Orleans (SAM 1917). 96 pp.

NICHOLAS VON DER FLÜE. *Durrer, Robert*, Die ältesten Quellen über den seligen Nikolaus von Flüe, sein Leben und seinen Einfluss, gesammelt und erläutert im Auftrag der h. Regierung des Kantons Unterwalden ob dem Kernwald auf die fünfhundertste Wiederkehr seiner Geburt. 1. Halbband. iv, 204 pp. 2. Halbband, 1. Hälfte. iv, 205–520 pp. Sarnen, Ehrli, 1917, 1918. — *Herzog, Eduard*, Bruder Klaus. Studien über seine religiöse und kirchliche Haltung. 111 pp. Bern, Wyss, 1917. — *Oehl, Wilhelm*, Bruder Klaus und die deutsche Mystik (ZSchwKG 9, 1915, 161–174, 241–254).

NORBERT OF PRÉMONTRÉ. *Wozasek, B.*, Der heilige Norbert, Stifter des Praemonstratenserordens und Erzbischof von Magdeburg. 318 pp. Vienna, Eichinger, 1914.

OTMAR OF ST. GALL. *Scheiwiller, Otmar*, Zur Biographie des heiligen Abtes Otmar von St. Gallen (ZSchwKG 13, 1919, 1–32). — *Vetter, Ferdinand*, Sankt Otmar, der Gründer und Vorkämpfer des Klosters Sankt Gallen (Jahrbuch f. schweizerische Geschichte 43, 1918, 92–193).

TEMPLARS. *Schüpferling, Michael*, Der Tempelherren-Orden in Deutschland. Freiburg i. S. dissertation. iv, 266 pp. Bamberg, Kirsch, 1915.

THOMAS À BECKET. *Thiemke, Hermann*, Die mittelalterliche Thomas-Becket-Legende des Gloucesterlegendars, kritisch herausgegeben. vii, lxix, 185 pp. Berlin, Mayer u. Müller, 1919.

AUGUSTINIANS. Fräulein *Vonschott* shows by aptly chosen instances how the Augustinian friars of Italy fostered the intellectual inheritance of Petrarch and Boccaccio and carried the early Renaissance art of miniature-painting to Bohemia, and how the Augustinian canonici of Bohemia became the medium for the influences of the Renaissance as it had developed in southern France, while their Austrian and South-German brethren entered heartily into the scholastic activity of the humanistic movement. How far the same is true of the friars who were settled in middle and northern Germany, it is difficult

to say, because their libraries were destroyed in the Reformation, while the canonici, who held aloof from this movement, guarded their precious volumes better. The Augustinians took a particularly active interest in the religious movements of the time,—the monks in reviving classical Augustinianism, and the canonici in promoting the religious endeavors of humanism.

BEGUINES. *Meier* gives exhaustive information, with abundance of statistics, as to the diffusion of Beguinitism in Switzerland, which was greater than is commonly supposed.

BERNARD OF CLAIRVAUX. *Radcke* uses the eschatological views of the saint of Clairvaux to explain his position in the strife of ecclesiastical politics. In the present meritorious study he examines the apocalyptic and sibylline elements; the influence of Augustinian views is to be treated in a second part. Scheel (ThLz 43, 1918, 317 f.) is right in criticizing this division of subjects.

BIRGITTA AND THE MONASTERY OF VADSTENA. *Collijn* publishes, with an introduction in Swedish and French, a phototype reproduction of a manuscript in the monastery library at Stockholm (A14), which is very important for understanding the life and activities of Saint Birgitta. His second book is a collection of mediaeval stencil portraits of Birgitta and her daughter Katharine, reproduced in the original size and colors and furnished with explanatory descriptions.—Fräulein *Fogelklon's* biography of the great northern mystic is very well written, and based on the sources. She directs attention not so much to the events of her outward life as to its inner development, and is particularly interested in bringing out her conscious femininity.—*Geete* furnishes information from unpublished manuscripts, important for its bearing on life in the monastery of Vadstena and on the *privilegia* of the monastery.—The letters of *Månsson*, the Vadstena monk, who was curator of the Birgitta foundation in Rome, 1508–1524, are an important authority for the history of the foundation.—*Söderblom's* address is short but instructive. He shows how Birgitta, although not in the ordinary sense a fore-runner of the Reformation, yet by reason of her personal piety, moral earnestness, and prophetic gift, was a mediaeval repre-

sentative of the evangelical line of descent. Two plates are added of an excellent wooden statue of Birgitta discovered by the archbishop himself in the church at Hillesbog. [*Pleyel*]

DOMINIC AND THE DOMINICANS. Unlike Francis of Assisi St. Dominic has seldom been made the subject of a monograph, and perhaps of no biography in German before that of *Rings*. The latter's book is welcome for this reason, although it hardly satisfies the requirements of critical history and the tone is throughout that of the ordinary saint's life. The author has however taken pains to read the original sources and to consult earlier books on the Dominican order. — *Wilms* has made a useful book on the Dominican nuns, using already published material and some unpublished documents. His purpose was primarily to write for members and friends of the order an account of the varying fortunes of their community and of the varying character which has marked its spirit in the course of centuries; but the interest of the book is not confined to these circles. The Dominican nuns were never a widely extended body, but their influence was not inconsiderable. *Wilms* traces their entire history down to 1916, with emphasis on their chief local centres and on certain prominent personalities. His book is a distinct contribution to historical literature, the more so that it had no predecessor.

FRANCIS OF ASSISI AND THE MINORITES. St. Francis and his followers have always been a favorite subject of research in church history, and it was a good thought of Father *van den Borne* to give a comprehensive survey of the study, from Hadding and Suyskens down. Not only is his book what he intended it to be, a convenient introduction to the subject, but its information will be useful to experienced scholars. His judgments are in general well considered and trustworthy. — Meanwhile research is still going on, and in the period covered by this survey has brought to light much valuable matter. To be sure, the flood tide that set in with Sabatier's famous biography and the publication of sources which accompanied and followed that, has passed, but the number of publications on Franciscan topics which appear annually is still considerable, especially since popular and polite literature has interested

itself in the subject. In our bibliography we have included only works which possess value as original contributions. — First of all we must mention the great publications which the order itself devotes to its history. The quarterly *Franziskanische Studien*, with its articles longer and shorter, extensive literary surveys, and careful reviews of special publications, gives an excellent notion of contemporary work. Its field is the influence which Franciscanism has had upon the spiritual life of the past, and the history, both external and internal, of the Franciscan foundations, particularly in German-speaking lands. The scheme is completed by occasional *Beihefte*, consisting of longer monographs. The contents are not always of general historical interest, and it is only for the sake of completeness that we have made mention of *Falke's* and *Doelle's* works, relating as they do solely to German history. — Those of *Lemmens*, however, long known as an investigator, are of general interest.¹² He was permitted to study on the spot the archives of the Franciscan *custodia* of the monastery of Saint Salvator in Jerusalem, and has succeeded in reconstructing, by means of the Arabic records, the history of the monastery for the period of the Egyptian sultans and a little beyond. Together with these archives, various writings from the later centuries of the Middle Ages form his chief sources, and have made possible a great advance in critical knowledge of the subject, both through the rejection of traditional errors and the discovery of new facts and combinations. This highly instructive monograph is indispensable for every student of Franciscan missions. In his second *Beiheft* Lemmens has been able to use the work of many earlier students. His aim is to collect all the statements of old authorities, to fix the date and place of the events mentioned, and to explain the circumstances. His book is published in honor of the seven hundredth anniversary of the Franciscan missions, and covers not only these, but also the closely associated Dominican missions. Lemmens arranges the missions geographically in five sections: (1) northeastern Europe, (2) the Cumanes, (3) the Mongolians (Persia, Kipchak, China, Turkestan), (4) northern India, (5) the islands of West Africa. Both books

¹² On *Beiheft 2* (*Bierbaum*) see section IX, Scholastic Philosophy and Theology.

are furnished with full bibliographical references. — Another important serial publication is the *Monumenta Germaniae Franciscana*. Its purpose is to edit or reissue all manuscripts of any value and rare printed works by Franciscan writers or on Franciscan subjects, within the sphere of the German language. The only volume so far published deals with the archives of the Silesian monasteries down to the Reformation. The expense of the work is naturally very great, and under present conditions in Germany it is to be feared that so generously planned an undertaking cannot prosper. — No life of St. Francis on a large scale has appeared during the period of this survey, but anyone who enjoys fine analysis of character will do well to read *Saitschick's* little book as an introduction to the personality and ideals of the saint. It is a charming and profound study, combining modern sentiment and historical accuracy. It would be well worth translating into English. — *Tilemann's* investigations are directed against Sabatier and his cruder followers, who insist on St. Francis as only the individualist, to the exclusion of his other well-established traits of character. Tilemann emphasizes that tendency which led St. Francis to regard unqualified obedience to superiors as an essential element of piety, a tendency which reached its full development in the Jesuits. This view is sound, provided it is not carried too far. A clear line leading from Franciscans to Jesuits has been generally admitted, but Francis was not the spiritual ancestor of Loyola, who had but few traits in common with him. — The two legends by *Thomas of Celano*, the *Vita prima* and *Vita secunda*, are the earliest biographical sketches of St. Francis that exist, but they have hitherto been neglected by German translators in favor of the later Fioretti, and have never been rendered into English. The smooth and very accurate translation by *Schmidt* is accompanied by a learned introduction by Vischer. — *Kybal's* essay on the Song of Brother Sun, of which Francis was probably, if not quite certainly, the author, discusses the occasion, circumstances, and aim of the composition. It combined several *laudes* belonging to different periods and orally current. What has come down to us in writing is a mere fragment and therefore, from the point of

view of style, lacking in unity and order. The same writer's critical study of the famous Testament of St. Francis is based on the manuscripts, and discusses the contents and spirit of these documents and their relation to the Rule of the order. A third piece of thorough criticism is devoted to the Rule itself. The author thinks he has settled the much-disputed question of the origin, form, and wording of the three Rules of 1210, 1221, and 1223. His solution is, however, open to objection, for he has restricted the contents of the first Rule altogether too drastically, leaving only the confession of obedience at the beginning together with the succeeding words from the gospel. This does not constitute a Rule. His conclusions as to the second and third Rules are very satisfactory, and many familiar facts are presented under new points of view. The parallel analysis of the two Rules is useful, as is the section on the historical significance of the Rule of 1223 and the constitution of the order. — *Schäfer's* book is primarily of interest for local history, but it touches on the golden prime of Franciscanism in southern Germany, and the author's elaboration of a mass of topics which are of wider bearing is a model of thoroughness. — With the use of many authorities, published and unpublished, *Groeteken* tells the story of the Franciscans, (1) as papal envoys at the courts of the orient and occident, (2) as counsellors and confidants of rulers, (3) as confessors of sovereigns, and (4) as opponents of the pope at the court of Ludwig the Bavarian. In conclusion he tells the romantic story of the Franciscan monk on the throne, King Hayton II of Armenia, who was murdered in 1308. — *Schmitz* has in hand a history of the observance movement in the Franciscan monasteries in the fifteenth century, and in the present monograph he answers the preliminary questions of whether, how, and why, at the close of the Middle Ages, the convents of southern Germany needed reformation. In defending the convents against the unfavorable representations of the reformers, he acknowledges that they needed reform but denies the moral and religious degradation that their opponents allege, and admits only a certain secular tone in their piety, due to the lowering of the standard of community life, to laxity in the maintenance of separate-

ness from the world, and to a departure from the original ideal of poverty. This might seem to give away his whole case, although of course the picture ought not to be pointed in too dark colors.

FRATRES COMMUNIS VITAE. *Barnikol*, in a work based wholly on original authorities, deals with the Brothers of the Common Life, who contributed so much to the intensifying of the religious spirit at the end of the Middle Ages. He clears up many matters connected with the origin of the movement in the Netherlands (Florentius) and its extension and organization in Germany.

HILDEGARDE OF BINGEN. Among the women of the twelfth century, the figure of Hildegarde, prioress of a convent of Benedictine nuns on the Rupertsberg near Bingen on the Rhine, is conspicuous. A counsellor of emperors and popes, active in the moral reform of clergy and people, her name has also been remembered for her mystical writings, especially the *Liber Scivias* (sc. *Domini*). Her portrait is painted by Fräulein *Riesch* in popular style but with due regard to scholarly standards, and can be heartily recommended as a picture of a gifted and deeply religious personality who need not fear comparison with the more celebrated Catherine of Siena.—*Roth*, who had not read Fräulein *Riesch*'s account, gives some preliminary studies for a projected learned biography of St. Hildegarde and a critical edition of her writings.

JACOBUS DE VORAGINE. One of the most widely read of mediaeval books was the *Legenda Aurea* of Jacobus de Voragine, who died in 1298, as Bishop of Genoa. This collection of legends about the saints, from the time of the Apostles to that of the author, speedily made its way, in many different versions, into all spoken languages (into the Anglo-Saxon world as Caxton's Golden Legend) and did more than any other work to cultivate a spirit of piety among the common people. The new German translation by *Benz* deserves attention both because the translator has managed to preserve the charm of the original without sacrificing strict scholarly standards, and because of the sumptuous form of publication, which is quite equal to that of incunabula, and will delight the bibliophile. It is a

fine specimen of what German book-craft can produce even under post-war difficulties. The translator has added an admirable introduction, permeated by the spirit of mediaeval piety.

JOAN OF ARC. Although in France many works on the Maid of Orleans appeared from year to year in anticipation of her canonization in 1920, in Germany only one work, but that a scholarly one, is to be noted. In continuing the studies which he began in SAW in 1913, *Prutz* emphasizes the narratives of contemporary writers, in contrast to the early crop of legends. One of the best of these writers was Perceval de Cagny, known also for his contributions to the genealogy of the dukes of Alençon and to the general history of France. His plain statements, free from fantastic enthusiasm, deserve far more consideration as an authority than they have hitherto enjoyed. *Prutz* indeed believes that the real historical figure of Jeanne d'Arc is nowhere else preserved to us. He himself endeavors to present the true picture in the sharpest possible lines, with reference to the examination of Joan at Poitiers and to her conduct on the march to Orleans and at the relief of the city. The ordinary accounts, especially of her direction of military operations and of her strategic ability, do not bear close examination. If the captains yielded to the judgment of the Maid, it was because they had to reckon with the wave of popular feeling which she personified. Indeed, in the very fact of her power so successfully to control this popular sentiment may lie the secret of that personality which, in spite of critical scruples, still remains a marvel.

NICHOLAS OF THE FLÜE. On the 17th of May, 1917, the Swiss celebrated the five hundredth anniversary of the birth of "Brother Klaus," whose place in the hearts of the people is higher than that of many a saint, although his rank in the church is only that of *beatus*. He lived for many years as a recluse in his cell not far from the Lake of Sarnen, near Sachseln, and had a reputation for constancy in prayer and fasting, even receiving nourishment only in the sacrament. In the history of the Swiss confederation he won an honorable name through his activity as mediator in 1481, which helped to avoid

civil war between the cantons. *Durrer* has collected all the original documents that concern Brother Klaus and printed them in the original wording, with an excellent German version of the corrupt and difficult text and critical notes which throw light on the history of the hermit. The book is fully illustrated, and libraries will do well to secure copies without delay, as the edition is small and will soon be exhausted. — *Herzog*, bishop of the "Christkatholische Kirche" in Switzerland, has succeeded in proving that Klaus is to be counted among the "Gottesfreunde" of Upper Germany, of whom we get so clear an idea from the writings of Rulman Merswin of Strasburg. In this connection he is inclined to restore to life the famous "Friend of God in the Oberland" (Nicholas of Basel?) whom Denifle's criticism had previously, as it seemed, shown to be an invention of Merswin's. — *Oehl*, while not knowing *Herzog's* book, stoutly denies the historical existence of this Friend of God, but holds that Brother Klaus represents the highest point, and the conclusion, of this wide-spread movement, with which he certainly was connected. Both works add to our knowledge of this significant phase of mediaeval piety. Many other books and articles, of which those of more lasting importance are named in the bibliography, were called out by the anniversary of Brother Klaus.

NORBERT OF PRÉMONTRÉ. *Wozasek* gives a careful compilation of the known material, taken from other published accounts, paying special attention to the social activities of the saint.

OTMAR OF ST. GALL. The greater part of *Vetter's* book is devoted to the history of the veneration of Otmar in the liturgy and in popular usage. He has made a thorough study, bringing out a great number of interesting details significant of social conditions of the time. — His comments on the life of the abbot and his legal discussion of the ecclesiastical suit for separation of the monastery from the bishopric of Constance are severely criticized by *Scheiwiller*, who adds noteworthy remarks of his own on the subject.

TEMPLARS. The work of *Schüpferling*, a pupil of Schnürer, is mainly devoted to an account of the fortunes of the order,

elucidated by seventeen hitherto unpublished documents, but he discusses also the question, important for general secular history, of its extinction. He has his own view of Finke's conclusions, but agrees with him that the French king was the real power, the pope only his tool.

THOMAS À BECKET. Many lives of the famous archbishop appeared within a few decades after his murder, and *Thiemke* discusses the precipitate of these stories found in the Gloucester legend. This is closely related to the Chronicle of Robert of Gloucester, but arose earlier, about 1270, and is the finest of all the legends of southern England. *Thiemke's* critical text is based on thirteen manuscripts.

IX. SCHOLASTIC PHILOSOPHY AND THEOLOGY

a. General

Beiträge zur Geschichte der Philosophie des Mittelalters. Texte und Untersuchungen. Hrsg. von Clemens Baeumker. Bde. 13 ff. Münster, Aschendorff, 1914–1920. — *Divus Thomas.* Jahrbuch für Philosophie und spekulative Theologie. Hrsg. von Ernst Commer. 1–7. Jahrgang. Vienna and Berlin. 1914–1920. — *Dörholt, Bernhard,* Der Predigerorden und seine Theologie (expanded from DTh 3, 1916, 462–590). iv, 161 pp. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1917. — *Ehrle, Franz,* Die Ehrentitel der scholastischen Lehrer des Mittelalters (SAM 1919, 9. Abh.). 60 pp. — *Endres, Joseph Anton,* Forschungen zur Geschichte der frühmittelalterlichen Philosophie. (BGPhM 17, 2. 3, 1915.) vii, 152 pp. — *Espenberger, Johann Nepomuk,* Grund und Gewissheit des übernatürlichen Glaubens in der Hoch- und Spätscholastik (FLDG 13, 1, 1915). viii, 178 pp. — *Gillmann, Franz,* Zur Lehre der Scholastik vom Spender der Firmung und des Weihesakraments. 235 pp. Paderborn, Schöningh, 1920; Die Nothwendigkeit der Intention auf Seiten des Spenders und des Empfängers der Sakramente nach der Anschauung der Frühscholastik. (Der Katholik 96, 1, 1916, 432–449; 96, 2, 1916, 40–55, 99–115, 163–179). — *Grabmann, Martin,* Forschungen über die lateinischen Aristoteles-Übersetzungen des 13. Jahrhunderts (BGPhM 17, 5. 6, 1916). xxvii, 270 pp.; Über Wert und Methode des Studiums der scholastischen Handschriften (ZkTh 39, 1915, 699–740). — *Hoffmann, Georg,* Der Streit über die selige Schau Gottes (1331–1338). 194 pp. Leipzig, Hinrichs, 1917. — *Jellouschek, Carl Johann,* Zur Lehre der Unterscheidung von Wesenheit und Dasein in der Scholastik des Predigerordens (DTh 3, 1916, 637–656). — *Klingseis, Rupert,* Das aristotelische Tugendprinzip der richtigen Mitte in der Scholastik (DTh 7, 1920, 33–49, 142–172, 269–288). — *Ljunggren, Gustaf,* Zur Geschichte der christlichen Heilsgewissheit. 8, 328 pp. Göttingen, Vandenhoeck u. Ruprecht, 1920. — *Overbeck, Franz,* Vorgeschichte und Jugend der mittelalterlichen Scholastik. Aus dem Nachlass herausgegeben von Carl Albrecht Bernoulli, xii, 315 pp. Basel, Schwabe,

1917.—*Rolfes, Eugen*, Zur Kontroverse über die Körperlehre in der griechischen und scholastischen Philosophie (DTh 4, 1917, 381–435).—*Schedler, Philipp M.*, Die Philosophie des Macrobius und ihr Einfluss auf die Wissenschaft des christlichen Mittelalters (BGPhM 13, 1, 1916). xii, 162 pp.—*Schneider, Artur*, Die abendländische Spekulation des 12. Jahrhunderts in ihrem Verhältnis zur aristotelischen und jüdisch-arabischen Philosophie (BGPhM 17, 4, 1915). viii, 76 pp.—*Schultes, Reginald Maria*, Geschichte der *Fides implicita* in der katholischen Theologie (DTh 5, 1918, 39–74, 158–181, 320–338; 6, 1919, 45–60, 153–167, 266–299, 325–399).—*Vansteenberghe, E.*, Autour de la Docte Ignorance. Une controverse sur la théologie mystique au XV^e siècle (BGPhM 14, 2–4, 1915). vi, 220 pp.

It should be observed that the works discussed in the following pages are intended for a limited group of scholars; but the famous encyclical of Leo XIII (1878) put scholastic and especially Thomistic philosophy and theology in a position which has led to more and more active interest among Catholic scholars, while Protestant theologians are likewise taking a larger share in it since they have come to see how necessary a more thorough knowledge of scholasticism is for the understanding of Luther's development. In this field, unlike that of patristics, Protestant scholars are behind the Catholics, and are responsible for scarcely half a dozen of the writings here cited. Interest is fairly evenly divided among the different periods of scholasticism, but the importance of early scholasticism, especially that of the twelfth century, has recently been more clearly perceived. A gratifying tendency shows itself to accumulate fresh material for the study, as is evident from the large number of critical editions of the famous, as well as of the less known or quite unknown, scholastic writings.

At the head of the bibliography are two serial publications edited by Catholic scholars. The *Beiträge zur Geschichte der Philosophie des Mittelalters*, which appear at irregular intervals, have the same importance for the scholastic period that Harnack's *Texte und Untersuchungen* have for the patristic. No less than twenty-three of the works on our list belong in this series, all of them genuine contributions to scholarship. — The quarterly journal *Divus Thomas*, being the second series of the *Jahrbuch für Philosophie und spekulative Theologie*, is primarily intended for systematic research, and it serves, as the new title indicates, to promote studies founded on the teachings

of Thomas Aquinas. It prints also articles on the history of dogma. The more important are mentioned in our bibliography, but not always discussed separately. Both of these publications are indispensable for any serious study of mediaeval philosophy and theology, and should be found in American libraries.

Two of the books mentioned are, in subject and treatment, of a comprehensive character. *Overbeck's* († June 26, 1905) account of scholasticism in the early Middle Ages, consists of his university lectures at Basel. It would not be easy to find elsewhere a treatment of this difficult subject so learned and at the same time so fresh. The main divisions of the book are: (1) ancient learning and the beginning of the Middle Ages; (2) ecclesiastical learning under the Carolingians; (3) decline; and transition to mediaeval theology proper; (4) the early period of scholastic theology, to the discovery of the complete Aristotle (ca. 1200). The first of these divisions is especially interesting; the characterization of Abaelard is noteworthy. — *Ljunggren*, a young Swedish scholar, has also dealt successfully with a large subject. The problem of the assurance of salvation was brought into the foreground by Luther, and in the new answer which he gave to the old problem was involved his opposition to the Catholic form of religion. In order to understand the origin and nature of evangelical piety as defined by Luther, it is indispensable to study the earlier views of *fiducia* as the characteristic element of piety, and to take into account the whole complex of motives and ideas that belong with it. To give an exhaustive account of this development would require whole volumes, and Ljunggren has done well to confine himself to the two main periods, namely, Augustine and the great period of Scholasticism. He shows that Augustine comes very close to the essential principle of the evangelical conception, in teaching that man's despair of his own power, due to his sense of personal sin and weakness, must be transformed into a deep trust in God's grace and assistance. On the other hand, the theologians of the great scholastic period by their rigid systematization so largely emptied of personal content the idea of *spes* and its equivalent *fiducia*, and so limited

it, that the notion of an impersonal and materialistic (*dingliche*) grace appears at every point as the fundamental error of their system. The merit of Ljunggren's work is that he not only refers us to the original sources, but quotes largely from them. Even in the case of Augustine this is not superfluous, for while scholars are familiar with the chief passages, they are by no means in agreement as to his position on the assurance of salvation, and an exact consideration of the evidence is incumbent on every student. For the schoolmen other than Thomas Aquinas the material itself is not easily accessible.

In *Schedler's* book on Macrobius, author (ca. 400 A.D.) of a commentary on Cicero's *Somnium Scipionis* and of a dialogue on all sorts of antiquarian topics entitled *Saturnalia*, the first part, reviewing his not very original philosophy, is of less interest than the second, which describes his influence on mediaeval Christian thought. His writings were in vogue in the circles of literary culture down to the fifteenth century, and hence were in a position to influence the speculations of the schools. To show this in detail is Schedler's aim. It appears that Macrobius was the medium through which scholasticism received its Platonic and neo-platonic ideas, and that his philosophy, like that of Boethius, must be regarded as one of the channels for the concepts and ideas of ancient metaphysical philosophy. — *Endres* uses familiar material, but his analysis of many little-noticed writings of the early scholastic period makes no small contribution to our understanding of the historical connections. — *Grabmann* has already become favorably known by his excellent book on the history of scholastic method, of which two volumes have been published (Freiburg i. B., Herder, 1909, 1911), and during the further course of his great work of research he now and then gives us a glimpse into his workshop. Taking up the much-discussed question of the discovery and acceptance of Aristotle's writings among European scholars, he shows that even the treatises on physics and metaphysics were known much earlier than is commonly supposed. A comprehensive discussion of the authorities for the text gives information as to some important manuscripts not hitherto published. His article in *ZkTh* treats of the method

to be followed in the use of such manuscripts. For comment on his valuable studies of individual schoolmen, see below. — *Schneider* also points out that the decided turn toward Aristotelian studies about the year 1200 was foreshadowed in the preceding period, and that it is wrong to speak either of a radical abandonment of former tendencies or of a new creation of philosophical conceptions and points of view. He treats in detail the relations of early scholasticism to Aristotelian logic and metaphysic. — *Espenberger* points out that the problem of the basis and certitude of supernatural faith had already been raised by early scholasticism and that the writers of the great period only analyzed and systematized the question, although in a form unknown to the earlier centuries. He groups the great scholastics whose work he discusses, according to their various interpretations of the *habitus fidei*, as voluntarists (Alexander of Hales, Duns Scotus, etc.), intellectualists (Thomas, etc.), intermediates (Durandus of St. Pourçain), and pure nominalists (Occam, d'Ailly, Biel), the last comprising those theologians who expressly dissociated faith and knowledge, and so destroyed the former foundation. — *Hoffmann* (now professor in the Protestant faculty at Breslau) is the first writer to devote an exhaustive monograph to the dispute over the *visio beatifica*, which, in consequence of Pope John XXII's ecclesiastically incorrect attitude toward this eschatological problem, raised so much dust in the years 1331-1338, and which is mentioned by all textbooks on church history and the history of dogma. He has made a real contribution to knowledge, for he has not only given a detailed account of what actually took place, according to the authorities, but has brought out clearly and acutely the relations of this controversy to the history of dogma. (See von Zychlinski below.) — Hoffmann's earlier work in three volumes on the doctrine of the *fides implicita* (Leipzig, Hinrichs, 1905-1909), being written by a Protestant, naturally called for reëxamination from the Catholic side. This has been made by *Schultes*, who in his scholarly discussion of Hoffmann's views, presents also his own summary of the history of this important doctrine. This may profitably be consulted in addition to Hoffmann's. — *Docta ignorantia* is the

title of a famous tract of Nicholas of Cusa which caused much agitation among the monasteries of Bavaria and Tyrol about the middle of the fifteenth century. It deals with the old controversy about the primacy of the intellect or of the will and affections (intellectualism and voluntarism), which was here kindled anew in connection with the mystical elevation of the heart to God. This dispute is vividly brought before us by *Vansteenberghe* in a series of newly published documents.

Gillmann, professor of ecclesiastical law at the University of Würzburg, treats the question whether, and how far, in the teachings of the schoolmen, clergy other than bishops were deemed qualified, like bishops, to administer confirmation and the sacrament of consecration. As early as Gregory the Great, priests of Sardinia were allowed the right of confirmation, but Gratian, the great teacher of ecclesiastical law in the twelfth century, was the first to make this matter of papal regulation the subject of canonistic discussion. Papalists declare that confirmation derives its validity from the delegation of the pope, not from that of a bishop, and that the pope can grant even to mere priests the right to consecrate, excepting of course in the case of consecrating a bishop. Tracing this problem through the three periods of scholasticism down to the beginning of the sixteenth century, Gillmann mentions a number of interesting points of detail that other scholars have either slighted or overlooked. The matter is somewhat important for literary history; and in a separate article he proves, in contrast to the general assumption hitherto, that the so-called *glossa ordinaria* of the *Decretum Gratiani* cannot have arisen before the Lateran Council of 1215, for it presupposes the decisions rendered by that council. — *Dörholt's* well-written paper on the history and theology of the Dominican order was published in honor of the 700th anniversary of the order. He refers with pardonable pride to the fact that the theology which arose and flourished within the order has been proclaimed by the pope as the theology of the church. His historical survey, which is the reason for our mention here, testifies to thorough knowledge of the subject and constitutes a scholarly introduction to it.

b. Scholastic Philosophers

ABAEIARD. *Geyer, Bernhard*, Peter Abaelards philosophische Schriften, zum ersten Male herausgegeben. I. Die Logica ingredientibus. 1. Die Glossen zu Porphyrius. 2. Die Glossen zu den Kategorien (BGPhM 21, 1. 2, 1919, 1921). xi, 1-109, 110-305 pp.

ALBERTUS MAGNUS. *Geyer, Bernhard*, Die Uebersetzungen der aristotelischen Metaphysik bei Albertus Magnus und Thomas von Aquin (PhJbG 30, 1917, 392-415). — *Grabmann, Martin*, Drei ungedruckte Teile der Summa de creaturis Alberts des Grossen (Quellen und Forschungen zur Geschichte des Dominikanerordens in Deutschland 13). 87 pp. Leipzig, Harrassowitz, 1919. — *Hertling, Georg von*, Albertus Magnus. Beiträge zu seiner Würdigung. 2. Aufl. (BGPhM 14, 5. 6, 1914). viii, 183 pp. — *Horváth, Alexander*, Albert der Grosse und Thomas von Aquino als Begründer der christlichen Philosophie (DTh 3, 1916, 591-636). — *Loë, Paulus Maria von*, Alberts des Grossen Homilie zu Luc. 11, 27. Zum ersten Male herausgegeben. 57 pp. Bonn, Hanstein, 1916. — *Pelster, Franz, S.J.*, Kritische Studien zum Leben und zu den Schriften Alberts des Grossen (Ergänzungshefte zu StZ 2, 4, 1920). xv, 179 pp. — *Stadler, Hermann*, Albertus Magnus: De animalibus libri xxvi. Nach der Kölner Urschrift herausgegeben. 1. Band: Buch 1-12. 2. Band: Buch 13-26 (BGPhM 15, 1916; 23, 1920). xxvi, 842; 843-1664 pp.

ALBERT OF ORLAMÜNDE. *Grabmann, Martin*, Die Philosophia Pauperum und ihr Verfasser, Albert von Orlamünde (BGPhM 20, 2, 1918). viii, 56 pp.

ALEXANDER OF HALES. *Minges, Parthenius*, Exzerpte aus Alexander von Hales bei Vincenz von Beauvais (FrSt 1, 1914, 52-65); Abhängigkeitsverhältnis zwischen Alexander von Hales und Albert dem Grossen (FrSt 2, 1915, 208-229); Die psychologische Summe des Johannes von Rupella und Alexander von Hales (FrSt 3, 1916, 365-378).

ALFARABI. *Baeumker, Clemens*, Alfarabi über den Ursprung der Wissenschaften (de ortu scientiarum) (BGPhM 19, 3, 1916). iv, 32 pp.

ANSELM OF CANTERBURY. *Müller, Max*, Anselm von Canterbury. Das Verhältnis seiner Spekulationen zum theologischen Begriff des Übernatürlichen. Munich dissertation. 114 pp. Kempten, Kösel, 1914.

ANSELM OF LAON. *Bliemetzrieder, Franz Paul*, Anselms von Laon systematische Sentenzen, herausgegeben, eingeleitet und philosophie- und unterrichtsgeschichtlich untersucht (BGPhM 18, 2. 3, 1919). xxv, 37, 167 pp.

ANTONIUS OF FLORENCE. *Bürck, Franz Joseph*, Die Psychologie des heiligen Antonius von Florenz. Dissertation. 69 pp. Bonn, Ludwig, 1916.

ROGER BACON. *Baeumker, Clemens*, Roger Bacons Naturphilosophie, insbesondere seine Lehren von Materie und Form, Individuation und Universalität (FrSt 3, 1916, 1-40, 109-139). v, 74 pp. Münster, Aschendorff, 1916.

BONAVENTURA. *Israel, Gerhard*, Die Tugendlehre Bonaventuras. Erlangen dissertation. 77 pp. Berlin, Ebering, 1914. — *Kattum, Franz Xaver*, Die Eucharistielehre des heiligen Bonaventura. Munich dissertation.

196 pp. Munich-Freising, Datterer, 1920. — *Leonissa, Josef*, Zur Mystik des heiligen Bonaventura (DTh 5, 1918, 215–254).

DUNS SCOTUS. *Heidegger, Martin*, Die Kategorien- und Bedeutungslehre des Duns Scotus. vii, 245 pp. Tübingen, Mohr, 1916. — *Klein, Joseph*, Zur Sittenlehre des Joh. Duns Scotus (FrSt 1, 1914, 401–437; 2, 1915, 137–169); Die Immaterialität der Engel und [der] Menschenseelen nach Johannes de Duns Scotus (FrSt 3, 1916, 400–403); Intellekt und Wille als die nächsten Quellen der sittlichen Akte nach Johannes de Duns Scotus (FrSt 6, 1919, 107–122, 213–234, 295–322; 7, 1920, 118–134, 190–213). — *Klug, Hubert*, Die Lehre des Johannes de Duns Scotus über Materie und Form nach den Quellen dargestellt (PhJbG 30, 1917, 44–78). — *Minges, Parthenius*, Zur Erkenntnislehre des Duns Scotus (PhJbG 31, 1918, 52–74); Zur Trinitätslehre des Duns Scotus (FrSt 6, 1919, 24–35). See also under William of Ware.

ERIGENA. *Lehmann, Paul*, Zur Kenntnis und Geschichte einiger Johannes Scotus zugeschriebener Werke (Hermes 52, 1917, 112–124).

FRANCIS OF RETZ. *Häfele, Gallus N.*, Franz von Retz. Ein Beitrag zur Gelehrtengegeschichte des Dominikanerordens und der Wiener Universität am Ausgange des Mittelalters. xxiv, 422 pp. Innsbruck, 1918.

GREGORY OF RIMINI. *Würzdörfer, Joseph*, Erkennen und Wissen nach Gregor von Rimini. Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der Erkenntnistheorie des Nominalismus (BGPhM 20, 1, 1917), viii, 139 pp.

GROSSETESTE. *Baur, Ludwig*, Die Philosophie des Robert Grosseteste, Bischof von Lincoln (BGPhM 18, 4–6, 1917). xvi, 298 pp. — *Vogelsang, Friedrich*, Der Begriff der Freiheit bei Robert Grosseteste. 105 pp. Gütersloh, Bertelsmann, 1915.

HONORIUS AUGUSTODUNENSIS. *Baeumker, Franz*, Das Inevitable des Honorius Augustodunensis und dessen Lehre über das Zusammenwirken von Wille und Gnade (BGPhM 13, 6, 1914). vi, 94 pp.

HRABANUS MAURUS. *Hablitzel, Johann Baptista*, Hrabanus Maurus und Claudius von Turin (HJG 38, 1917, 538–552).

JOHN OF NAPLES. *Jellouschek, Carl Johann*, Johannes von Neapel und seine Lehre vom Verhältnis zwischen Gott und Welt. Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der ältesten Thomistenschule. xvi, 128 pp. Vienna, Mayer, 1918.

LEONARDUS A VALLE BRIXIENSIS. *Jellouschek, Carl Johann*, Des Leonardus a Valle Brixiensi Untersuchungen über die Praedestination (DTh 7, 1920, 107–141).

LULLUS. *Probst, Jean*, La Mystique de Ramon Lull et l'Art de contemplacio (BGPhM 13, 2, 3, 1914). viii, 126 pp.

NICOLAUS E MIRABILIBUS. *Jellouschek, Carl Johann*, Des Nicolaus e Mirabilibus O. Pr. Abhandlung über die Praedestination. Nach Cod. 1566 der Wiener Bibliothek herausgegeben. viii, 59 pp. Vienna, Mayer, 1918.

PECHAM. *Oligier, Livarius*, Die theologische Quaestion des Johannes Pecham über die vollkommene Armut (FrSt 4, 1917, 127–176). — *Peeters*,

Emil, Vier Prosen des Johannes Pecham (FrSt 4, 1917, 355–367). — *Spettmann, Hieronymus, O. F. M.*, Johannis Pechami quaestiones tractantes de anima, quae nunc primum in lucem edidit notisque illustravit H. S. (BGPhM 19, 5, 6, 1918). xl, 224 pp.; Die Psychologie des Johannes Pecham (ibid., 20, 6, 1919). x, 102 pp.; Quellenkritisches zur Biographie des Johannes Pecham (FrSt 2, 1915, 170–207, 266–285).

PETRUS DE HIBERNIA. *Baeumker, Clemens*, Petrus de Hibernia, der Jugendlehrer des Thomas von Aquino und seine Disputation vor König Manfred (SAM, 1920, 8. Abh.). 52 pp.

PETER LOMBARD. *Smisniewicz, Leon M.*, Die Lehre von den Ehehindernissen bei Petrus Lombardus und bei seinen Kommentatoren Albert dem Grossen, Thomas von Aquino, Bonaventura und Scotus. Freiburg i. B. dissertation. xvi, 258 pp. Posen, Wieniewicz, 1917.

RAPHAEL OF PORNASSIO. *Michel, Karl*, Der Liber de consonancia nature et gracie, des Raphael von Pornaxio (BGPhM 18, 1, 1915). x, 62 pp.

RATHERIUS OF VERONA. *Schwark, Bruno*, Bischof Rather von Verona als Theologe. Dissertation. v, 163 pp. Königsberg, Teichert, 1915.

RICHARD OF MEDIAVILLA. *Minges, Parthenius*, Scotistisches bei Richard von Mediavilla (ThQ 99, 1917–1918, 60–69; 100, 1919, 269–300).

RICHARD OF ST. VICTOR. *Ebner, Joseph*, Die Erkenntnislehre Richards von St. Victor (BGPhM 19, 4, 1917). viii, 126 pp.

SERVASANCTUS. *Grabmann, Martin*, Der Liber de exemplis naturalibus des Franziskaner-Theologen Servasactus (FrSt 7, 1920, 85–117). — *Kruitwagen, Bonaventura*, Das Antidotarium animae von Frater Servasactus O. F. M. (Wiegendrucke und Handschriften. Festgabe für Konrad Häbler, 80–106). Leipzig, Hiersemann, 1919.

THOMAS AQUINAS. *Beemelmans, Friedrich*, Zeit und Ewigkeit nach Thomas von Aquino (BGPhM 17, 1, 1914). vi, 64 pp. — *Feldner, Gundisalv*, Die Tätigkeit der Geschöpfe nach St. Thomas von Aquino (DTh 4, 1917, 277–321; 5, 1918, 27–44; 136–153). — *Geyer, Bernhard, D.* Thomae Aquinatis summae theologiae partis primae quaestiones 75–77 de essentia et potentiis animae in generali una cum Guilelmi de la Mare correctorii articulo octavo (Florilegium patristicum 14). xx, 66 pp. Bonn, Hanstein, 1920. — *Grabmann, Martin*, Thomas von Aquino. Eine Einführung in seine Persönlichkeit und Gedankenwelt. 3. Aufl. vi, 169 pp. Kempten and Munich, Kösel, 1917; Einführung in die Summa Theologiae des heiligen Thomas von Aquino. viii, 134 pp. Freiburg i. B., Herder, 1919; Die echten Schriften des heiligen Thomas von Aquino (BGPhM 22, 1, 2, 1920). viii, 275 pp.; Thomas von Aquin und Petrus von Hibernia (PhJbG 33, 1920, 347–362). — *Kolb, Viktor*, Kurzer Abriss der Tugendlehre nach dem heiligen Kirchenlehrer Thomas von Aquino. x, 182 pp. Vienna, Mayer, 1918. — *Langenberg, G.*, Des heiligen Thomas Lehre vom Unendlichen und die neuere Mathematik (PhJbG 3, 1917, 79–97, 172–191). — *Leonissa, Josef*, Zur Mystik des heiligen Thomas von Aquin (DTh 3, 1916, 232–255). — *Mausbach, Joseph*, Grundlage und Ausbildung des Characters nach dem heiligen Thomas von Aquin. 2. u. 3. Aufl. vii, 146 pp. Freiburg, Herder,

1920; *Ausgewählte Texte zur allgemeinen Moral aus den Werken des heiligen Thomas von Aquin*. 2. Aufl. viii, 116 pp. Münster, Aschendorff, 1920. — *Michelitsch, Anton*, Kommentatoren zur Summa Theologiae des heiligen Thomas von Aquin (DTh, 3, 1916, 260-291; 4, 1917, 116-152, 463-472; 5, 1918, 365-380; 6, 1919, 113-135, 315-325). — *Müller, Wilhelm*, Der Staat in seinen Beziehungen zur sittlichen Ordnung bei Thomas von Aquin (BGPhM 19, 1, 1916). 99 pp. — *Pelster, Franz*, Der Katalog des Bartholomaeus von Capua und die Echtheitsfrage bei den Schriften des heiligen Thomas von Aquino (ZkTh 41, 1917, 820-832). — *Pfeiffer, N.*, Die Klugheit in der Ethik von Aristoteles und Thomas von Aquin. xi, 44 pp. Freiburg i. S., Paul, 1918. — *Rackl, Michael*, Die ungedruckte Verteidigungsschrift des Demetrios Kydones für Thomas von Aquin gegen Neilos Kabasilas (DTh 7, 1920, 303-317). — *Rolfes, Eugen*, Die Philosophie von Thomas von Aquin. In Auszügen aus seinen Schriften (Philosophische Bibliothek, 100). xi, 224 pp. Leipzig, Meiner, 1920. — *Schilling, Otto*, Politik und Moral nach Thomas von Aquin (ThQ 99, 1917-1918, 79-98). — *Schulemann, Günther*, Das Kausalprinzip in der Philosophie des heiligen Thomas von Aquin (BGPhM 13, 5, 1915). xviii, 116 pp. — *Zychlinski, Alexander von*, Die species impressa et expressa beim beseligenden Schauakt nach der Lehre des heiligen Thomas von Aquin. Breslau dissertation. Breslau, Fleischmann, 1918.

WILLIAM OF AUXERRE. *Gillmann, Franz*, Zur Sakramentenlehre des Wilhelms von Auxerre. 43 pp. Würzburg, Bauch, 1918. — *Strake, Joseph*, Die Sakramentenlehre des Wilhelms von Auxerre (FLDG 13, 5, 1917). xiv, 220 pp.

WILLIAM OF WARE. *Daniels, Augustinus*, Zu den Beziehungen zwischen Wilhelm von Ware und Johannes Duns Scotus (FrSt 4, 1917, 221-238).

We will make the transition to works on individual schoolmen with *Ehrle's* admirable study (*supra*, I). It is well known that the great schoolmen were known by honorary titles such as *doctor profundus*, *resolutus*, *subtilis*, *venerabilis*, but in the manuscripts the titles not infrequently occur without mention of any names. To prepare from the manuscripts a catalogue of these titles with explanations of their history and significance was a fit task for the long-time head of the Vatican Library. These titles first appear in the fourteenth century, and then only for a few preëminent scholars, such as Thomas Aquinas and Duns Scotus. Later they became more common, and in the fifteenth century catalogues of them began to be made. It is interesting to note that the title *doctor angelicus*, by which, and which alone, Thomas is now known, did not supplant his earlier title of *doctor communis* until the fifteenth century, when in the heat of the battle between Franciscans and Dominicans 'common doctor' was transformed into a term of contempt.

ABAEIARD.¹³ Abaelard's influence on the development of scholastic philosophy cannot be too highly rated, and it is of much importance that his two writings on logic, hitherto unpublished, are now made accessible in a critical edition by Geyer. Of the two works, known from their opening words as *Logica ingredientibus* and *Logica nostrorum petitioni sociorum*, the former is contained in the Milan codex M 63 sup., and was rediscovered by Grabmann after Antonio Rosmini had used it more than half a century earlier. It shows Abaelard on his best side as a keen and independent thinker, and will put his often debated attitude on universals in a new light.

ALBERTUS MAGNUS. The great German schoolman of the thirteenth century, whose fame stands for the time being somewhat in the background as compared with that of his pupil Thomas, has lately begun to receive more attention. The best estimate of him is that of *Freiherr von Hertling*, the professor of philosophy who, at the end of the War, undertook the heavy responsibility of the imperial chancellorship. He has thoroughly revised his article, first published in 1880, and has brought it into accord with the latest investigations. — *Pelster's* book consists of preliminary studies for a critical biography, the fruit of thorough work and marking a long step in advance. He deals first with the mediaeval legends, and traces them back to an early common original, dating probably from the first decades of the fourteenth century. In the second part he studies the chronology of the life of Albertus, and in the third the order and dates of his philosophical and dogmatic writings. Unfortunately the information, at least that relating to the first half of the great scholar's life, is so scanty and so full of contradictions that even Pelster's inquiry has not succeeded in establishing every date beyond controversy. Even the year of his birth is not certain; with the writings we are on firmer ground. Pelster's results here will be the foundation of further research. He agrees with Geyer in placing in the later part of Albert's life his activity as a commentator on Aristotle's works. — For all future work critically trustworthy texts are the first requisite,

¹³ According to the best manuscripts, as Geyer shows, this name should be pronounced Abaëlard, in four syllables.

and this *Stadler* has provided for the *De animalibus*, using the original autograph now preserved in the archives of Cologne. Besides establishing the text, he has worked out the author's relation to his sources, and finds that he was by no means so independent of others as the manuals usually state, following Prantl in his *Geschichte der Logik im Abendlande*. What the writer borrowed from earlier descriptions exceeds in amount his own observations. That a publishing house in these difficult times should have issued such an *ingens opus* (1664 pp.) is certainly a proof of courage. — A hitherto unknown continuation of the chief work of Albert's earlier years, the *Summa de creaturis*, has been discovered by *Grabmann* in Venice and Rome. It contains Ethics (*tractatus de bono sive de virtutibus*), the doctrine of the Sacraments (*de sacramentis*), and Eschatology (*de resurrectione*). *Grabmann* gives the results of his investigation, with a full statement of the contents of the treatises. We can only wish that these texts, so important for the understanding of Albert's theology, might soon be published. — *Von Loë* publishes a sermon by Albert on Luke 11, 17, which, as he shows, was delivered before the clergy of the Liebfrauenkirche of Trier not long after 1260.

ALBERT OF ORLAMÜNDE. *Philosophia pauperum* is the title of an outline of natural philosophy which was used as a textbook in the German city schools toward the end of the Middle Ages. *Grabmann* proves the usual assumption to be wrong, that the author was Albertus Magnus, and finds it highly probable that the book was written by Albert of Orlamünde, a fourteenth century Dominican monk. He introduces us also to the commentaries on the book, or rather abridgments of it, among which the *Parvulus philosophiae* was the most widely used.

ALFARABI. A document of some importance for the transition from early to middle scholasticism is the little treatise by the Arab Alfarabi, on the origin of the sciences. It gives a convenient survey of the classification of all branches of learning which, in dependence on the Greeks, were received and cultivated by Arabic-speaking scholars. The Arabic original is apparently lost. The Latin version, which was eagerly con-

by European scholars, is probably the work of Dominicus Gundissalinus, archdeacon in Segovia. It is published by *Baeumker* from five manuscripts of the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries.

ANSELM OF LAON. Even before Anselm of Canterbury, Anselm of Laon (†1117) had created the general type of mediaeval thought. As the first of the *sententiarii*, he deserves the title of a "father of scholasticism" even more than the more famous Anselm, but his works have until now been entirely neglected, and *Bliemetzrieder* has performed a useful service in taking hold of him in scholarly spirit. He publishes the texts called in the manuscripts *Sententiae divinae paginae* and *Sententiae Anselmi*, and promises later a critical and historical estimate, with special reference to Anselm's influence on his contemporaries and successors. We look forward with much interest to the work of this well-trained scholar.

ROGER BACON. *Baeumker's* essay is a discussion of Hugo Höver's book on Bacon's hylomorphism (Limburg, 1912). He finds too little emphasis put on the element of natural philosophy and natural science in Bacon's philosophy, but does not himself fill the gap.

BONAVENTURA. *Leonissa* gives a detailed account of the mystical ideas of the *doctor seraphicus*, based on his *Itinerarium*, *Breviloquium*, and *De donis spiritus*.

DUNS SCOTUS. *Heidegger* does not so much expound the great Franciscan's logic and theory of knowledge as point out instructively the lines which connect that theory with modern philosophy (Husserl, Rickert, etc.).

FRANCIS OF RETZ. This Dominican († 1427), a professor at the University of Vienna, is not one of the leading figures of late scholasticism, but *Häfele*, in a thorough monograph, has found in him some interesting traits, and has traced both his scholarly work and his influence on religion and morals. In the chapter on his work for reform there are passages of an interest for the history of civilization well beyond the strict limits of the main subject. The plates are taken from manuscripts and the earliest editions.

GREGORY OF RIMINI. The Augustinian monk, Gregory of

Rimini († 1338), who was made general of the order shortly before his death, a keen antagonist of Duns Scotus and, as a nominalist, a pupil of William of Occam, is of importance in the study of Luther by reason of his commentary on Peter Lombard. After a biographical introduction *Würzdörfer* treats his psychology, theory of knowledge (*Erkenntnistheorie*), and conception of knowing and knowledge (*Wissen und Wissenschaft*), and shows that Gregory, although in general a precursor of the modern empirical tendency, did not succeed in attaining perfect clearness in his theory of knowledge.

GROSSETESTE. Grosseteste's position in scholastic philosophy is determined by his adherence to the tradition of Augustine and Anselm, in opposition to the Aristotelian school, represented especially by Thomas. In this he was the predecessor of Duns Scotus. By his writing on natural science he laid the foundation of the empiristic tendency of scholasticism, and although here his dependence on Aristotle must be acknowledged, yet his innovations through the use of mathematics and of experiments mark him as a pioneer. This is clearly brought out in *Baur's* able work. — *Vogelsang*, in discussing Grosseteste's treatise *De libero arbitrio*, shows that he was influenced by Augustine and Bernard, but still more by Anselm.

HONORIUS AUGUSTODUNENSIS. The Benedictine Honorius is a copious but neglected writer of the first half of the twelfth century. Probably of English birth, he belonged to the monastery of St. Augustine at Canterbury (hence properly *Augustinensis*), and later was active in Germany. *Baeumker*, a son of the well known professor of philosophy at Munich, discusses one of his writings, *Inevitabile sive de praedestinatione et libero arbitrio inter magistrum et discipulum dialogus*. It is preserved in two forms, commonly designated by the names of the first editors; Cassander (1552; new issue by Kelle, SAW 150, 1904, 3. Abh.) and Conen (Antwerp, 1621; Migne, ser. lat. 172). The original text is that given by Cassander; Conen's is a revision influenced by Anselm's writings.

HRABANUS MAURUS. *Hablitzel* proves that in his commentary on the Gospel of Matthew Hrabanus used the com-

mentary by Claudian of Turin, but without naming it among his sources.

JOHN OF NAPLES. The Dominican Johannes de Regina, from Naples, belongs to the second generation of the pupils of Thomas Aquinas. He was present at the ceremony of canonization at Avignon in 1323, and is to be reckoned among the earliest of the commentators. His own work, *Quaestiones disputatae* (Naples, 1628), not without importance for the history of Thomistic doctrine, receives for the first time an exhaustive critical treatment from *Jellouschek*.

LEONARDUS A VALLE BRIXIENSI. The Dominican Leonhard Huntpehler († 1478), from Tyrol, taught in Vienna. *Jellouschek* publishes his *Inquisitiones de praedestinatione*, not previously printed, from Cod. Monac. 18606.

LULLUS. The Franciscan Raimundus Lullus is usually judged by his *Ars magna* as an example of the strange constructions of thought in which the schoolmen could lose their way, but his *Liber contemplationis* shows him as a simple soul of pious feeling, *doctor illuminatus*, and is to be ranked as one of the most original of the mystical writings of the Middle Ages. The *Art de contemplacio* is published by *Probst* in the Catalan dialect from Cod. Monac. 67 (14th cent.), with an analysis of the work and a thorough examination of its ideas.

PECHAM. John Pecham or Peckham, the first Franciscan to become Archbishop of Canterbury, had earlier been a professor at Paris. As a zealous defender of neo-platonic Augustinianism against the doctrine of Aristotle, he stood in direct opposition to Thomas. *Spettmann* has collected and critically examined the meagre notices of his life, and does good service in publishing for the first time his *Quaestiones de anima* from a manuscript in the Biblioteca Nazionale at Florence. His analysis of the sources, although necessarily incomplete, is especially welcome. — From the same manuscript *Oliger* publishes Pecham's hitherto unknown *Quaestio* on complete poverty, with which he took his part in the controversy over the mendicant orders. — Pecham was also a poet, and *Peeters* publishes from Cod. Vat. 4863, four of his poems: "Planctus almae

matris ecclesiae," "Deploratio humanae miseriae," "Exhortatio Christianorum contra gentem Mahometi," and "Deploratio hominis." The melodies for the first two are given.

PETRUS DE HIBERNIA. A manuscript in the city library at Erfurt contains the report of a disputation in which Magister Petrus from Ireland, the teacher of the young Thomas of Aquino, takes the leading part. The text is published and discussed by *Baeumker*, who does not regard it as a mere literary fiction, but believes that valid conclusions as to Peter's attitude as a scholar can be drawn from what he says here. The dialogue takes us into the midst of the discussions aroused by the circulation of Aristotle's writings on natural philosophy.

RAPHAEL OF PORNASSIO. In a work preserved in several manuscripts but never printed, Raphael of Pornassio († 1467) attempted to show the harmony between faith (*gratia*) and knowledge (*natura*) by comparing the precepts of the gospels with the corresponding utterances of ancient sages. The tract is dedicated to Pope Nicholas V, the great patron of the humanist movement, and is a protest against the narrowness of those who objected to humanistic studies as being hostile to the church. *Michel* has for the first time given the work a thorough critical examination, and finds that Raphael drew his gospel citations from the harmony of Ammonius, that is, the Latin version of Tatian's Diatessaron, and his ancient sayings mostly from the so-called compilation of Laertius.

RICHARD OF ST. VICTOR. Richard (†1173), the successor of Hugh as prior of the chapter of St. Victor in Paris, owes his importance to his share in the development of St. Bernard's mysticism in scholastic form. *Ebner* discusses his system under four heads: (1) nature and meaning of sense-perception according to Richard; (2) cognition by the reason, or non-mystical vision; (3) faith and its development into knowledge; (4) mystical cognition.

SERVASANCTUS. The name of this Franciscan theologian of the end of the thirteenth century has been quite unknown, although his literary activity was considerable. *Kruitwagen* discovered a copy of his chief work, printed in 1485, and has analyzed it. He shows that the title given to it, *Antido-*

tarium animae, is a mistake; the work is rather a *Summa de paenitentia*. — *Grabmann* gives an account of another work, *De exemplis naturalibus*, which he has identified in several manuscripts.

THOMAS AQUINAS. Since the encyclical of Leo XIII, Thomas, the famous native of Aquino, has stood in the forefront of interest for the learned world, as is attested by the number of books and articles about him which fall within our period, and of which we have mentioned only the most important. Even books for the general reader have begun to appear, one of the most successful being that of *Grabmann*, his Introduction to the Personality and General Ideas (*Gedankenwelt*) of Thomas. First published in 1912, it has recently appeared in a third edition, with the historical sections enlarged and brought up to date. It might well be translated into English, as it has already been into Dutch and Spanish, and perhaps it would be desirable that *Grabmann's* second work mentioned above, his Introduction to the Summa, should be combined with it. The present reviewer is acquainted with no book which gives so good an understanding of Thomas's Summa, the greatest product of scholasticism. Its inception, its relation in date and subject matter to Thomas's other writings, its later influence down to the present day, its special method and scope, are all described and brought into relation with the intellectual life of the time in general and Thomas's background of ideas and manner of thought in particular. — It is not necessary to discuss here most of the other books named in the bibliography, as the titles sufficiently indicate their contents. Among them, *Müller's* article is of more general interest, for, although its theme has been often discussed, yet by reason of the author's thoroughly dispassionate attitude it occupies a place by itself. The book may help to dissipate the prejudice that scholastic teaching, including that of Thomas, treated civil government as only the result of sin, for in reality that teaching regarded the State as required by the moral order, although existing in divinely ordained subordination to the Church. — I would also recommend the painstaking and very useful work of *Micheltich*, who has put together in an alphabetical list, with exact

bibliographical notices, the names of the hundreds of commentators on Thomas's *Summa*, beginning with Peter Crockart († 1514) and Cajetan († 1534). — *Rackl* gives an account of an unprinted polemic by Demetrios Cydones († 1400), minister of the Emperor John VI Cantacuzene, in answer to Neilos Cabasilos, metropolitan of Salonica, who in 1360 had written a tract on the procession of the Holy Ghost, attacking Thomas Aquinas and the union with the Latin church.

WILLIAM OF AUXERRE. *Strake's* work has been subjected to a searching criticism by *Gillmann*, but the latter, great as is his competence in the field of early scholastic sacramental doctrine, goes too far when he requires that Strake should have taken into account the canonistic and theological literature of the end of the twelfth century, even when extant only in unpublished form. *Gillmann's* own additions and corrections from such sources are certainly valuable, but the present reviewer must agree with Geyer, likewise an authority on early scholasticism (see Abaelard and Thomas above), when he says (*ThRev* 18, 1919, 399) that such objections do not detract from the merit of Strake's book, in which the accessible material is employed with sound historical judgment.

WILLIAM OF WARE. Among the forerunners of Duns Scotus, William of Ware (*doctor fundatus*) deserves special attention. *Daniels* compares his treatise on the prologue to the Sentences of Peter Lombard with the corresponding sections of the *Opus oxoniense* of Scotus.

X. THE GERMAN MYSTICS

DAVID OF AUGSBURG. *Stöckerl, Dagobert*, Bruder David von Augsburg, ein deutscher Mystiker aus dem Franziskanerorden (VKSM 4. 4, 1914). xvi, 284 pp.

EBNER. *Zoeopf, Ludwig*, Die Mystikerin Margarethe Ebner (BKGMR 16, 1914). ix, 177 pp.

ECKEHART. *Büttner, Hermann*, Meister Eckeharts Schriften und Predigten übersetzt und herausgegeben. 2. Aufl. 2 vols. lix, 240; x, 255 pp. Jena, Diederichs, 1917. — *Landauer, Gustav*, Meister Eckeharts mystische Schriften in unsere Sprache übertragen (Verschollene Meister der Literatur 1). 153 pp. Berlin, Schnabel, 1920. — *Lehmann, Walter*, Meister Eckehart (Die Klassiker der Religion, hrsg. von Gustav Pfannmüller 14, 15). iv,

312 pp. Göttingen, Vandenhoeck u. Ruprecht, 1919. — *Marie, R. van*, De mystieke leer van Meister Eckehart. Haarlem, Poissevain, 1916. — *Strauch, Philipp*, Paradisus anime intelligentis (Paradies der fornuftigen sele). Aus der Oxforder Handschrift Cod. Laud. Misc. 479 herausgegeben (Deutsche Texte des Mittelalters 30). xl, 170 pp. Berlin, Weidmann, 1919.

ROLLA. *Lindkvist, H.*, Richard Rolla: Meditatio de passione domini. According to MS. Uppsala C 494. Uppsala, Akad. Bokhandel, 1917.

RUYSBROEK, *Huebner, Friedrich Matthes*, Jan van Ruysbroek: Das Buch von den zwölf Beghinen. Aus dem Flämischen [Ausgabe von J. David, 1863] übersetzt. Leipzig, Inselbücherei No. 206, [1917]; Die Zierde der geistlichen Hochzeit, übertragen und herausgegeben. 164 pp. Leipzig, Inselverlag, [1919].

SEUSE. *Gebhardt, Adam*, Die Briefe und Predigten des Mystikers Heinrich Seuse, genannt Suso, nach ihren weltlichen Motiven und dichterischen Formeln betrachtet. Strasburg dissertation (partial publication). vi, 66 pp. Strasburg, Trübner, 1918. — *Heitz, Paul*, Zur mystischen Stilkunst Heinrich Seuses in seinen deutschen Schriften. Jena dissertation (partial publication). xxii, 38 pp. Halle, Karras, 1914. — *Heyer, Curt*, Stilgeschichtliche Studien über Heinrich Seuses Büchlein der ewigen Weisheit. Kiel dissertation (partial publication). viii, 54 pp. Stuttgart, Hohlhammer, 1915. (Complete in Zeitschrift für deutsche Philologie 46, 1915, 175–228, 393–443.) — *Nicklas, Anna*, Die Terminologie des Mystikers Heinrich Seuse. Königsberg dissertation. 161 pp. Königsberg, Lankeit, 1914. — *Wilms, Hieronymus*, Der selige Heinrich Seuse. 284 pp. Dülmen, Laumann, 1914.

TAULER. *Strauch, Philipp*, Zu Taulers Predigten (Beiträge zur Geschichte der deutschen Sprache 44, 1919, 1–26). — *Vogt-Terhorst, Antoinette*, Der biblische Ausdruck in den Predigten Johann Taulers. vi, 171 pp. Breslau, Marcus, 1920.

THEOLOGIA DEUTSCH. *Büttner, Hermann*, Das Büchlein vom vollkommenen Leben. Eine deutsche Theologie, in der ursprünglichen Gestalt herausgegeben und übertragen. 2. Aufl. lxiii, 107 pp. Jena, Diederichs, 1920.

THOMAS À KEMPIS. *Pohl, Michael Josephus*, ed., Thomae Hemerken a Kempis: Opera omnia. 4. Band. v, 692 pp. Freiburg i. B., Herder, 1918. — *Rebholz, J.*, Thomas von Kempen: Das Lilienthal. xv, 208 pp. Regensburg, Verlagsanstalt, 1920.

The great German mystics stand in the forefront of interest in the Germany of today, for the younger generation is turning to them for inspiration and support in a time of untoward circumstance and inner need. Editions of Eckehart, Seuse, Tauler, and others, published for the general reader, are abundant, but do not call for notice in the present survey, which will be limited to works of some scholarly significance.

DAVID OF AUGSBURG. Most of the so-called German mystics belonged to the Dominican order, but David († 1272), like some

others, was a Minorite. Born in Augsburg, he spent his life as a prefect of novices there, but was known outside, even if not so widely as his more famous pupil, Bertold of Regensburg. His numerous mystical writings, both in Latin and German, are described at length by *Stöckerl*, with critical investigations.

EBNER. *Zöpf* has written an excellent book on the mystical nun, Margarethe Ebner († 1351), who lived for many years in the convent of Medingen, in the diocese of Augsburg. Her revelations, written by herself, portray a life of contemplation. Employing in his discussion the Freudian method of psychoanalysis, which Pastor Pfister of Zürich has applied to religious phenomena, and which attributes the leading part in all mysticism to the sexual subconsciousness, *Zöpf* gives a sympathetic appreciation of the pious nun. The book will give anyone (including readers outside of Germany) a good idea of the nature of German mysticism in the Middle Ages.

ECKEHART. Among the numerous books about Eckehart's literary work and his religious life, *Lehmann's* seems to the present reviewer the best. — *Strauch* gives an interesting collection of sixty-three sermons by Eckehart, now first printed in full from the Oxford manuscript.

SEUSE. The letters and sermons of this celebrated Dominican (critically edited by Karl Bihlmeyer, 1907) have exercised a singular attraction on the present generation. Of late they have also won attention by their literary style. *Gebhardt* discusses the "secular motives" found in them, for Nature, in all her manifestations, fills a large place in Seuse's verbal art, and since these secular motives often occur in poetic guise, or at least in prose nearly related to contemporary or earlier poetry, both spiritual and secular, his poetic formulas invite study. — *Heitz* discusses his style, especially in the mystical language. — *Heyer* endeavors further to show its relation to the general history of literary style. — *Fräulein Nicklas* studies Seuse's use of words with reference to psychological, logical, metaphysical, and mystical expressions.

TAULER. The textual criticism of Johannes Tauler's sermons is unsatisfactory, but *Strauch*, the most learned student of the subject, has made at least a beginning of cataloguing the man-

uscripts, using material which he has been accumulating for many years.

THOMAS À KEMPIS. In concluding this somewhat scanty list, it is a satisfaction to present a laborious but very important work, *Pohl's* complete critical edition of the works of Thomas à Kempis. The *Imitatio Christi* has made the name of Thomas world-famous, but, as is not so generally known, many other ascetic writings came from his pen. The fourth volume of this edition contains the following: *Hortulus rosarum*, *Vallis liliorum* (cf. the German translation by *Rebholz*), *Consolatio pauperum*, *Epitaphium breve monachorum*, *Vita boni monachi* (a didactic poem), *Manuale parvulorum* (cf. Matt. 19, 14), *Doctrinale iuvenum*, and *Hospitale pauperum*, besides one hundred and ten hymns. The hymns comprise nearly twice as many as were previously known, although the genuineness of some needs further examination. The volume also includes the tract in form of a letter entitled *De solitudine et silentio*, together with five shorter letters. The epilegomena, in which the manuscripts and printed editions are critically discussed, show the enormous amount of work involved in the edition. Fifteen facsimiles of manuscripts are added. The seventh volume is to finish the text and the eighth will contain the account of Thomas's life and works.

XI. REFORMERS

HUS. *Hauck, Albert*, Studien zu Johann Hus. Universitäts-programm. 64 pp. Leipzig, Edelmann, 1916. — *Pijper, F.*, Johannes Hus (NAGS 13, 1917, 1-57).

SAVONAROLA. *Schnitzer, Josef*, Savonarola im Streit mit seinem Orden und seinem Kloster. vii, 108 pp. Munich, Lehmann, 1914.

WESSEL GANSFORT. *Rhijn, M. van*, Wessel Gansfort. xi, 263, lxxix pp. The Hague, Nijhoff, 1917; *Impugnatorium M. Antonii de Castro O. P. contra epistolam M. Wessel Groningensis ad M. Jacobus Hocch de indulgentiis*, op nieuw uitgegeven en toegelicht. 84 pp. The Hague, Nijhoff, 1919.

WYCLIF. *Loserth, Johann*, Wiclif-Studien (Zeitschr. des deutschen Vereins für die Geschichte Mährens und Schlesiens 20, 1916, 1 ff.); *Johann von Wiclif und Guilelmus Perardus*, Studien zur Geschichte der Entstehung von Wiclifs Summa theologiae (SAW 180, 3, 1916). 101 pp.; *Johann von Wiclif und Robert Grosseteste*, Bischof von Lincoln (SAW 186, 2, 1918). 83 pp.; *Die kirchenpolitischen Schriften Wiclifs und der englische Bauernaufstand von 1381* (MIOeG 38, 1919, 399-422). — *Pijper, F.*, Johann Wiclif (NAKG 12, 1916, 293-334).

HUS. The substance of *Hauck's* study has since been incorporated in the last volume of his *Kirchengeschichte Deutschlands* (see I, above), but it is important enough to warrant separate mention. Hauck believes that the last word on Hus has not been said, and it is true that in the present unsettled state of criticism the figure of the Czech reformer appears in a less favorable light than that in which his tragic death at Constance had put him. Hauck tries to picture him as he actually was, not as he appeared to the eyes of scholars, who were influenced by sympathy for him either as a Czech (Palacky) or as a precursor of Luther (Lechler). It appears beyond doubt that his convictions rested on a general Catholic foundation, which was never shaken, even by his large acceptance of Wyclif's views, and that he believed at bottom in an hierarchically organized church as the means of salvation. On the other hand, his doctrine, vigorously advocated, that a Christian bound to the *lex evangelica* must refuse obedience to the servants of Antichrist (his name for the clergy of his own time), made peace with the hierarchy impossible. There is further his prejudice in favor of everything Czech (*kritiklose Stellung zum Tschechentum*). One need only compare the likeness of Hus recently made known from the Leitmeritz miniature with his traditional portrait to see for oneself how in his face the features of the fanatic predominated over those of the reformer. —It is still the reformer that *Pijper* sees in Hus, viewing him as the martyr of Constance who refused to subordinate his conscience to the authority of the church. His idea that Hus's attitude was less political and more religious than Wyclif's is questionable. See also under Wyclif below.

SAVONAROLA. *Schnitzer*, who in the past has given abundant proofs of his competence as a student of Savonarola, has introduced a new point of view into the discussion. He shows that a considerable cause of the fall of the prior of San Marco was his disagreement with his own order. In the question of the observance of the rules relating to poverty, Savonarola held the strictest possible view, and denied all right to hold property, even on the part of the order as a corporate body. He further lost the confidence of the brethren in the monastery during his

last trial, not so much by failure at the ordeal by fire as because he was supposed to have assented to the protocol in which it was declared that he had never received divine revelations and that his whole course had been dictated by personal ambition.

WESSEL GANSFORT. *Van Rhijn's* admirable biography is a model of thoroughness and full of instruction. He has not only described fully the circumstances of Wessel's life, especially in the years of travel from 1449 to 1475, but has also written a fresh exposition of his theology. In all this he has been able to build on the foundation laid by van Veen's excellent article in the *Protestantische Realencyclopädie* (vol. 21). The question how far Wessel is to be counted among the "pre-reformers" is also discussed, and appendices deal with the sources, the portraits of Wessel, and the editions of his works. The author disagrees with van Veen in thinking that the first name Johannes should be dropped. — *Van Rhijn* has also published a new edition of the *Impugnatorium* of Antonius de Castro, which deals with the curialist understanding of the doctrine of indulgences. On Jacob Hoeck, to whom the tract is addressed, see van Rhijn's article in *NAKG* 12, 1916, 209-222.

WYCLIF. *Pijper's* article on Wyclif, although competent and based on original authorities, brings out no new points of view. — *Loserth*, on the contrary, occupies the first place among recent students of the English reformer, and has sensibly increased our knowledge. The contents of his four papers are as follows: (1) Criticism of the Wyclif manuscripts, with special reference to Cod. 1294 of the Hofbibliothek at Vienna, written in England in 1406-07 by two Bohemian students. In a review of recent works on Wyclif and Hus, attention is called to the editions, and articles on Hus, of J. Sedlak (in Bohemian), from which it is now for the first time possible to show that even in his Bohemian writings Hus made use of Wyclif. (2) In his ethics, and in part in his theology, Wyclif was largely dependent on two Franciscan scholars of the thirteenth century, William of Auvergne and William Peraldus (Péroult). The latter in turn was a follower of William of Paris, whose works were also known to Wyclif and used by him. *Loserth* comments

instructively on the life and works of Peraldus, and then shows by numerous examples how largely Wyclif copied from his predecessor. (3) A similar relation to Grosseteste on the part of Wyclif is proved by a comparison of the *Dicta* of the Bishop of Lincoln with Wyclif's *Summa*. Grosseteste's *De praeceptis* could not be used for comparison, as it has never been printed, and the only manuscript, being in England, was not accessible to the Austrian scholar. (4) Wyclif's writings have been used hardly at all for light on the situation of the lower classes in England toward the end of the fourteenth century, although they are directly concerned with the very problems then uppermost in the English world. Loserth shows that in Wyclif's earlier writings no allusions to social conditions are to be found, but that with the Peasants' Revolt of 1381 his sympathy began to show itself, finding expression in his *De blasphemia*. This was followed by his pamphlet *De quatuor sectis novellis*, 1383. From this and from Wyclif's later writings it is plain that his conviction of the necessity of ecclesiastical and economic reforms was not shaken by the violence of 1381. It is to be hoped that Loserth may soon bring together the results of his pioneer work in a comprehensive biography.

XII. NORWEGIAN CHURCH HISTORY

Bang, A. C., Den norske kirkes historie. 519 pp. Christiania, Gyldendalske Boghandel, 1914. — *Brynildsen, R. K.*, Om tidsregningen i Olav den helliges historie (Avhandlingar fra Universitets historiske seminar, 1916, 41–120). Christiania, Gröndahl, 1916; Haakon den gode som missionskonge (NHT 4, 1917, 368–381). — *Bugge, Alexander*, Norge og de britiske oer i middelalderen (NHT 2, 1914, 299–378); Kirke og stat i Norge, 1152–1164 (NHT 3, 1916, 169–212). — *Bugge, Anders*, Haslum kirke i Ostre Barum (FNFBFA, 1916, 1–30). — *Bull, Edvard*, Der pavelige legat Stephanus i Norge (Videnshapsselskapets Skriften, hist.-filos. Klasse, 1915, 2). 18 pp. Christiania, Dybwad, 1915; Islandsche praeiken motiver i det 14 aarhunderte (NHT 3, 1916, 454–457); Interdiktet mot Sverre (NHT 3, 1916, 321–324). — *Dahl, Daniel*, Hamar Bispegård (FNFBFA, 1916, 50–67). — *Fischer, Gerhard*, Middelalderens bispeborg: Oslo (St. Halvard, 1917, 256–274); Middelalderens Oslo (FNFBFA, 1920, 124–174). — *Johnsen, Oscar Albert*, Olavssaagens genesis (Edda, 1916, 209–224). — *Kielland, Thor*, Fra Munkeliv Birgittiner-kloster, Norges Vadstena (FNFBFA, 1920, 71–90). — *Koht, Halvdan*, Saettargjarda i Tönsberg (NHT 3, 1916, 261–276); Medförte Kristendommens indførelse et magttap for det gamle norske aristokrati (NHT 4, 1917, 409–423). — *Kolsrud, Oluf*, Kristendom og kunst under

gothiken (NHT 7, 1920, 82–114); Olavskirkja i Trondheim (Norske Folkeskriften 63. Norigs Ungdomslag og Studentmaallaget). 132 pp. Christiania, 1914. — *Lund, Fredrik Macody*, Ad Quadratum. Det geometriske system for antikens og middelalderen sacrale bygningskunst, opdaget fra kathedralen i Nidaros. 393, xxxvi pp. Helge, Erichson, 1919 — *Nicolaisen, O.*, Flakstad kirke i Lofoten (FNFBA 1914, 150–152). — *Paasche, Fredrik*, Kristendom og Kvad i norrön middelalder. 180 pp. Christiania, Aschehoug, 1914; ¹⁴ Den norske stammes overgang til kristendommen (Kirke og Kultur, 1914, 463–480); St. Michael og hans engle. En studie over den katolske skaldediktning, draumkvadet og sarlig Sólurjódt (Edda, 1914, 33–74); Lilja et kvad til Guds moder. 108 pp. Christiania, Aschehoug, 1915; Sverre prest (Edda, 1915, 197–212); Kong Sverre. 303 pp. Christiania, Aschehoug, 1920. — *Pettersen, Fredrik*, Bamle Stenkirke i Bratsberg amt (FNFBA, 1914).

The following notices, which I owe to the courtesy of Professor Mowinckel and Mr. Finn Bader, student in theology at Christiania, reached me too late to be incorporated with the main text, and must be placed in a separate chapter. Some are of interest for local history only, others will claim the attention of scholars outside of Norway also.

In the compendium of Norwegian church history by *Bang*, the chapters on the Middle Ages occupy the largest space and are also in subject matter the most important. — *Brynildsen* deals with the chronology of King Olaf Haraldson, and finds that the dates given by the Icelandic chronicler Snorre are more trustworthy than is commonly supposed. (See also Bull.) — *Bugge* discusses the close relations between Norway and the British Isles, the interest for church history lying in the part played by the Archbishop of Nidaros (Trondheim), whose ships for more than a century furnished the means of intercourse with England. English priests sometimes held incumbencies in Norway. *Bugge's* second article is on the relation of church and state at the time of the erection of the archdiocese of Nidaros by Cardinal Nicholas in 1152. This year is a turning point in Norwegian history. Up to that date Norway had lain outside the general current of ecclesiastical development; the peasants had built the churches and owned them. But with the year 1152 the newly established cathedral

¹⁴ Cf. *Edvard Lehmann*, Vorefaders omvendelse i anledning av Fredrik Paasche: Kristendom og Kvad (Kirke og Kultur, 1914, 103–110) and *F. Paasche* (ib. 251–255); also the critical discussions in NoTT, 1915, 149–183.

chapters and the bishops acquired greater influence, both in church and state. King Magnus Erlingsson at that time received land in fee from Saint Olaf, that is from the church. — On the authority of an hitherto unnoticed document, *Bull* believes that he has proved that the legate Stephen of Orvieto, who was in Norway at the coronation of King Magnus, had come with a mandate from the pope as a missionary to the Norwegian people. He further shows that King Sverre was only threatened with the interdict by Innocent III, not subjected to it. — *Johnsen* treats of the accounts of the life and deeds of Olaf Haraldson which served as source for the Olaf-saga of Snorre. — *Kielland* tells the story of the Munkeliv convent in Bergen after it was transformed into a convent of St. Birgitta in 1426. It soon gained wealth and power, and artistic weaving was specially cultivated there. — *Koht* points out that the Concordat of Törnberg (1277) was not so favorable to the church as has been inferred from the letter of the document. He shows further (in opposition to the views of J. G. Sars) that the introduction of Christianity into Norway did not cause any loss of power to the aristocracy, but that the nobles assumed the oversight of the churches and maintained a close connection with the church. This continued after the organization of the church in 1152 (see Bugge, above), so that the later struggle of the monarchy with the aristocracy was at the same time a contest with the church. — *Lund* asserts that in all the more important ecclesiastical architecture of the Middle Ages, as in antiquity, a definite geometrical system of proportions was followed, and by observing this he thinks it possible to reconstruct the cathedral of Nidaros in its mediaeval form, even in detail. His view has called forth vigorous opposition from architects and students of the history of art, but has also found convinced adherents. — *Paasche* has also roused much discussion by his attack upon the important question of how far Christianity succeeded in influencing the life of the Norwegian people during the Middle Ages. Basing his studies on the religious element in the old songs (*kvad*), he comes to the conclusion that the conversion to Christianity was not a matter of outward form alone but that by the year 1300 the

new religion was firmly rooted in the inner life of the people, and that the latter was suffused by the spirit and moved by the forces of European catholicism. — In commenting on this view, *Lehmann* denies that the religious songs justify so sweeping an assertion, while *Bull* (NoTT) does not believe the effect was so profound as *Paasche* holds.—*Koht* (NoTT) on the contrary agrees with *Paasche* in the main, and accepts his proof that Christianity early exerted its influence on the poetry of the scalds, although this influence became dominant only about the year 1400, with “*Lilja*,” a song in honor of the Virgin Mary by an Icelandic monk, Brother Øistein. *Paasche* has translated this poem, with a commentary. In another paper he traces the part of St. Michael in the scald poetry, and in the last book named in the bibliography describes the life and activities of King Sverre (see *Bull*). Toward the king, whose legitimacy was sharply attacked by contemporaries, he is sympathetic, in contrast to the skepticism of recent historians. A more cautious tone (for instance with regard to the stories of Sverre’s dreams) would be advisable.

BOOKS RECEIVED

- THE ORIGIN OF PAUL'S RELIGION. (The James Sprunt Lectures, Union Theological Seminary in Virginia.) *By J. Gresham Machen.* The Macmillan Company, 1921. Pp. 329.
- AT ONE WITH THE INVISIBLE: STUDIES IN MYSTICISM. *Edited by E. Hershey Sneath.* The Macmillan Company, 1921. Pp. 293.
- THE MINISTRY AS A LIFE WORK. *By Robert Lee Webb.* The Macmillan Company, 1922. Pp. 96.
- SPIRITUAL ENERGIES IN DAILY LIFE. *By Rufus M. Jones.* The Macmillan Company, 1922. Pp. 179.
- THE THEORY OF ETHICS. *By Arthur Kenyon Rogers.* The Macmillan Company, 1922. Pp. 197.
- THE CHURCH IN AMERICA: A STUDY OF THE PRESENT CONDITION AND FUTURE PROSPECTS OF AMERICAN PROTESTANTISM. *By William Adams Brown.* The Macmillan Company, 1922. Pp. x, 378.
- PREACHING AND SERMON CONSTRUCTION. *By Paul B. Bull.* The Macmillan Company, 1922. Pp. xiii, 315.
- THE CONTENTS OF THE NEW TESTAMENT. *By Haven McClure.* The Macmillan Company, 1921. Pp. ii, 219.
- CONFESSIONS OF AN OLD PRIEST. *By S. D. McConnell.* The Macmillan Company, 1922. Pp. 124.
- THE IDEA OF GOD, HISTORICAL, CRITICAL, CONSTRUCTIVE. *By Clarence Augustine Beckwith.* The Macmillan Company, 1922. Pp. xiii, 343.
- THE BOOK OF JOB. *By Moses Buttenwieser.* The Macmillan Company, 1922. Pp. xix, 370.
- PROPHECY AND RELIGION: STUDIES IN THE LIFE OF JEREMIAH. *By John Skinner.* Cambridge University Press, 1922. Pp. viii, 360.
- PELAGIUS'S EXPOSITIONS OF THIRTEEN EPISTLES OF ST. PAUL. I. Introduction (Texts and Studies, Vol. IX, No. 1). *By Alexander Souter.* Cambridge University Press, 1922. Pp. xvi, 360.
- THE LAWS OF LIFE: PRINCIPLES OF EVOLUTION, HEREDITY AND EUGENICS. A Popular Presentation. *By William M. Goldsmith.* Boston, Richard G. Badger, The Gorham Press. Pp. 441.
- THE LITERATURE OF THE OLD TESTAMENT IN ITS HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT. *By Julius A. Bewer.* New York, Columbia University Press, 1922. Pp. xiv, 452.
- DAS WESEN DES JUDENTUMS. (Zweite neubearbeitete Auflage.) *By Leo Baeck.* Frankfurt a. M., J. Kauffmann Verlag. Pp. viii, 308.
- MANUALE DI STORIA DELLE RELIGIONI. *By Nicola Turchi.* Turin, Fratelli Bocca, 1922. 60 Lire. Pp. xv, 658.
- PSALMENSTUDIEN. *By Max Löhr.* Berlin, W. Kohlhammer, 1922. Pp. 53.
- DER SEGEN MOSE'S DEUT. 33 ERLÄUTERT UND ÜBERSETZT. *By Karl Budde.* Tübingen, J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1922. Pp. vi, 50.

Rec. Sch. of Rel. - 2
TE